

# THE PLIGHT OF ANGLICAN CHURCH MUSIC IN THE WESTERN CAPE: THREE CASE STUDIES

Levi Eudo Alexander



Thesis presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

**Master of Music (Choral Conducting)**

in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at Stellenbosch University.

Supervisor: Martin Berger

March 2021

## **DECLARATION**

By submitting this thesis electronically, I declare that the entirety of the work contained therein is my own, original work, that I am the sole author thereof (save to the extent explicitly otherwise stated), that reproduction and publication thereof by Stellenbosch University will not infringe any third party rights and that I have not previously in its entirety or in part submitted it for obtaining any qualification.

**Levi Alexander**

March 2021

## **ABSTRACT**

Music ministries still providing Anglican church congregations with traditional Anglican church music find themselves clutching onto a musical tradition in a church plagued by the increasing secularisation of society.

This thesis, in three case studies, investigates the musical output and general daily function of three Anglican churches in the Western Cape by interviewing the rector and music director of each parish. Each parish was selected as it presented a varied historical, musical, liturgical and churchmanship culture. The aim of the thesis is to ascertain, primarily, whether traditional music is under threat of falling into disuse in the church and secondly, if traditional music is indeed under threat, the possible measures which could be implemented to preserve the heritage for future generations of Anglican worshippers.

The literature review presents a body of information to define traditional Anglican music and contextualise its practices by tracing its historical development through the centuries, and in so doing, creates a contextual framework on which the findings of the three case studies are based.

This research presents the challenges endured by music ministries by: (1) defining the role of church music in the service and the Anglican liturgy; (2) identifying Anglican music history in South Africa by ascertaining styles of worship; and (3) contextualising the function of the music ministry in the church by discussing the role of the music director and the working dynamic with clergy, education and development, youth participation, future planning and finance.

## OPSOMMING

Die musiekbedienings, wat steeds aan Anglikaanse kerkgemeentes tradisionele kerkmusiek verskaf, vind dat hulle vaskleef aan 'n musiektradisie in 'n kerk wat al hoe meer deur sekularisasie van die gemeenskap beïnvloed word.

Deur drie gevallestudies, ondersoek hierdie tesis die musikale uitset and algemene daaglikse funksionering van drie Anglikaanse kerke in die Wes-Kaap deur middel van onderhoude met die rektor en musiekdirekteur van elke gemeente. Die gemeentes is elk gekies omdat hulle 'n gevarieerde historiese, musikale, liturgiese en kerkmanskap kultuur bied. Die doel van die tesis is, hoofsaaklik, om vas te stel of tradisionele musiek dreig om in onbruik in die kerk te verval, en tweedens, in geval tradisionele musiek wel onder bedreiging is, watter moontlike maatreëls in plek gestel kan word om die erfnis vir toekomstige geslagte van Anglikaanse kergangers te behou.

Die literatuurnavorsing bied deurgronde inligting aan om tradisionele Anglikaanse musiek te definieer en ook die praktyke daarvan te kontekstualiseer deur die historiese ontwikkeling deur die eeue na te spoor, en daardeur 'n kontekstuele raamwerk te skep waarop die bevindinge van die drie gevallestudies gebaseer is.

Hierdie navorsing toon die uitdagings aan wat musiekbedienings ondervind deur 1) die rol van kerkmusiek in die diens en die Anglikaanse liturgie te definieer; (2) die Anglikaanse musiekgeskiedenis in Suid-Afrika te identifiseer deur verskillende diensstyle vas te stel; en (3) die funksie van die musiekbediening in die kerk te kontekstualiseer deur die rol van die musiekdirekteur, asook die werkende dinamiek met priesters, opvoeding en ontwikkeling, jeugdeelname, vooruitbeplanning en finansiering te bespreek.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis is the product of my experiences and participation in many an Anglican music ministry. Therefore, I acknowledge all my music educators in my primary, high school and tertiary education. I am grateful to all the church musicians, conductors, choristers, organists and clergy who have welcomed me in the Anglican music circles and who have educated, inspired and encouraged me.

I would like to extend my gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Martin Berger, for the time and effort contributed to this thesis and for the patience, utmost support, encouragement, confidence and wonderful friendship he has displayed towards me. He has inspired a passion and drive in my career and a new enjoyment of, and fulfilment in, music.

I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my wife, Mrs Janine Alexander, for the many hours of assistance in proofreading and editing, sharing her opinion and her dedicated and unwavering love and support.

I am extremely honoured to have completed my postgraduate studies beside my colleague and close friend, Warren Patientia, who encouraged me to embark on the study of a Masters in Music degree and was a major source of energy and inspiration when the journey presented challenges.

I am also grateful for the support of my family and friends and for their interest shown in my studies. I very much appreciate the editing assistance of Diane Abrahams and the Afrikaans translation assistance of Sonja Brasler. Thank you for your generous offering.

A special word of gratitude to all the clergy, Reverends Michael Weeder, Timothy Lowes and Leslie Adriaanse and music directors, Mr Grant Brasler, Adv. Deon Irish and Dr Ashley Petersen, who completed substantial questionnaires and interviews and calmly and unreservedly engaged in this study. Without their generous effort, this thesis would not be possible and I am immensely appreciative. I am humbled by their tireless endeavours and dedication to Anglican church music. I salute their constant goal to provide their church parish with music of the highest quality.

*Deo gratias*

# Table of Contents

List of Tables.....	7
Chapter 1     Introduction .....	8
Chapter 2     Literature Study .....	10
2.1     Liturgy and Music .....	10
2.2     Anglicanism and Church Music in South Africa.....	14
2.2.1     Establishment of the Anglican Church in England .....	14
2.2.2     The Role of Church Music in the Anglican Liturgy .....	18
2.2.2.1     Forms of Music in the Anglican Church .....	19
2.2.2.2     Music Performance Practice in the Anglican Church .....	25
2.2.3     Anglicanism in South Africa.....	27
2.2.3.1     History .....	27
2.2.3.2     Church Music and Liturgical Practice .....	28
2.2.3.3     Catholic and Anglican Ecumenical Relations .....	32
2.2.3.4     Styles of Worship .....	33
2.3     Role of the Music Director in Anglican Church Music.....	36
2.3.1     Conducting .....	37
2.3.2     Teaching .....	38
2.3.3     Leadership Skills .....	40
2.3.4     Relation to Clergy .....	44
2.3.5     Financial Management .....	45
2.4     Education and Development within the Anglican Church .....	46
2.4.1     The Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) .....	46
2.4.2     Religious Music within School .....	47
2.5     Future Prospects of Anglican Church Music.....	48
Chapter 3     Research Methodology and Design.....	51

3.1	Research Question .....	51
3.2	Research Approach.....	52
3.3	Research Methodology .....	53
3.4	Research Ethics.....	54
3.5	COVID-19 Pandemic .....	55
Chapter 4	Case Studies .....	56
4.1	Introduction .....	56
4.2	Anglican Cathedral Church of Saint George the Martyr, Cape Town .....	56
4.2.1	Establishment of the Cathedral and its Music Ministry .....	56
4.2.2	Current Music Ministry .....	58
4.3	Anglican Church of Saint Michael and All Angels, Observatory .....	75
4.3.1	Establishment of the Parish and its Music Ministry .....	75
4.3.2	Current Music Ministry .....	76
4.4	Anglican Church of the Holy Nativity, Blackheath .....	87
4.4.1	Establishment of the Parish and its Music Ministry .....	88
4.4.2	Current Music Ministry .....	89
Chapter 5	Data Analysis .....	101
5.1	Liturgy .....	101
5.2	Anglican Church Music .....	102
5.3	History of Anglican Church Music and Liturgy in South Africa .....	103
5.4	Catholic and Anglican Ecumenical Relations .....	105
5.5	Styles of Worship .....	106
5.6	Role of the Music Director in Anglican Church Music.....	111
5.7	Relation to Clergy.....	119
5.8	Financial Management .....	121
5.9	Education and Development.....	122

5.10 The Future Prospects of Anglican Church Music .....	126
Chapter 6 Conclusions .....	128
Chapter 7 Recommendations .....	135
References .....	140
Personal Communication .....	149

## **List of Tables**

Table 1: St George's Cathedral Choirs' Specifications .....	60
Table 2: St Michael's Church Choir Specifications .....	77
Table 3: Holy Nativity Church Choir Specifications .....	90



## Chapter 1 Introduction

Over the past fourteen years, I have been immersed in Anglican church music through my involvement in various church choirs. At a young age, I joined my local church choir at St John's Anglican Church, Bellville South. This humble beginning was the stepping stone for my pursuit of a career in music. At the commencement of my tertiary education at the University of Cape Town (UCT), my involvement in choral singing increased. I joined St George's Cathedral Morning Choir, St George's Cathedral Evensong Choir and University Cathedral Singers (now St George's Cathedral Chamber Choir), the latter two of which I am still a member. In addition to my participation in many events of the Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) through my involvement in these choirs, I was also a member of Amici (a student choir at UCT's South African College of Music), Audivi (a Cape Town-based early music ensemble), True Voices Vocal Ensemble, St Michael and All Angels Anglican Church Choir, Observatory and the assistant conductor of the Symphony Choir of Cape Town. My interest in church music performance prompted me to complete two years of organ and vocal studies and I am currently pursuing a Masters Degree in Choral Conducting at Stellenbosch University to broaden my knowledge of the musical environment of which I am so passionate. The Stellenbosch University Academic Choir, Schola Cantorum, of which I am a member, performs and focusses on a large selection of choral music, which is part of the standard repertoire of the church. The study of this type of traditional liturgical repertoire is key to the success of any conductor interested in a career in church music.

Through my involvement in the Anglican Church over the past thirteen years, I have witnessed some of the challenges associated with traditional liturgical music in the Anglican Church in the Western Cape. During this period, I sensed a tendency towards an alleged general decline in Anglican liturgical music. This notion intrigued me and manifested in the research interest to investigate through objective research, in order to comment on the current circumstances through an unbiased stance. My research interest arose out of the intrinsic motivation to serve my church with my musical gifts.

In order to appease my curiosity, academic reading in the field yielded an article by Bethke (2016). The statement, "[t]he past 50 years have witnessed massive theological, liturgical, and social changes in South Africa, all of which have affected Anglican Church music in some way" (Bethke, 2016, p. 23), resonated with the notion of the alleged decline mentioned above. In his

article, “Music in the South African Anglican Diocese of Cape Town from 1900 to the Present: Toward a History of Anglican Music in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa”, Bethke (2016) describes the development of Anglican music in the Cape from its inception to its growth and diversification. Although the author is not necessarily negative about the future of Anglican church music, the underlying implication is that, despite the impression of a supposedly glorious past, the impact of modern society has already made its way into the choir stalls and could contribute to a decline in Anglican church music in South Africa in the future. This hypothesis that suggests there is indeed a decline in traditional Anglican church music is supported by several scholars, namely, Aigner (2018a); Bugenhagen (2019); Kandra (2019); Lerner (2019); Montagna (2017); and West (2017) among many, and imbues a general feeling of insecurity in the Anglican community about the future of traditional church music in South Africa.

Through subsequent reading in the field, it became obvious that a substantial amount of research addressing traditional church music has been published within the last five years but alludes to the question in a more general way. This research paper intends to investigate the perceived decline in Anglican liturgical music in the Western Cape, the possible causes of the decline and to contribute possible solutions in order to preserve this tradition for future generations.

This research is undertaken in the hope that it will contribute to a better understanding of the mechanisms that lead to the change in Anglican church music and that it will encourage efforts to preserve traditional Anglican music in the Diocese of Cape Town.

## Chapter 2 Literature Study

This literature study presents a body of information to define traditional Anglican music and contextualise its practices by defining the role of music in the liturgy, Anglicanism and its historical development and the establishment of Anglicanism in South Africa. Furthermore, the functionality of a music ministry of a church is defined by discussing the role of the music director and the output of musical education and development of the church. This presentation of data creates a contextual framework on which the findings of this research study are based.

### 2.1 Liturgy and Music

Guzman (2014) lists and explains what is called the Four Ends of Mass. In this case, “mass” is referring to a church service with the celebration of the Eucharist. This theologically rooted teaching defines the nature and purpose of any liturgical action performed in a church setting. Guzman mentions adoration, thanksgiving, atonement and petition. This theological understanding is made relevant in the context of church music in Arinze's (2007, 13:55) response to a question posed regarding the genre and style of church music performed in the mass. Arinze answers by quoting the Four Ends of Mass and its direct relevance to music, saying that

“[...] , every music has its own setting. We come to mass for those four reasons I mentioned: Does that music mean adoration of God, or praise of God, or asking pardon for our sins and reparation, or begging God for what we need? Recreation[-al music] is very different” (Arinze, 2007, 13:54-14:16).

Therefore, the definition of liturgy and traditional Anglican liturgical music is rooted in these core principles.

Evidence of music and worship can be found in the Old and New Testaments of the Bible. Hayward (2003) defines the role of music in the bible as “assisting in the memorisation of God’s truth and reminding God’s people of their fallenness and salvation” (Hayward, 2003, para. 1). The RCA Commission on Worship (n.d., para. 1) justifies Hayward’s stance by citing notable musical events in the bible. Examples from the Old Testament include the Jews’ escape from Egypt (Exod. 15), and Jewish worship in the tabernacle and temple in Israel (1 Chron. 6:31–32, 16:42). New Testament examples include the psalms and lamentations of David, hymn singing by Jesus and his disciples (Matt. 26:30), and the instruction by Paul to the Colossians to make

sacred music (Col. 3: 16– 17). These musical scenes are further highlighted by Percival (2007, para. 1) who states that

“[t]he New Testament paints a picture of church in which we see a mutual exercising of our gifts [music] to build one another up in Christ. And heading those lists of gifts are the word ministries [which include music].”

Chappell (2010), Kauflin (2017) and Brewer (2016) define the role of music in the mass in the same way. Chappell (2010) states that the purpose of sacred music is that of worship, thanksgiving, rejoicing, consecration, edification and evangelism. Kauflin (2017) summarises the above purposes into the three ends of sacred music, namely, emotional engagement, unification of the congregation and memorisation and internalisation of all texts sung in the mass. Brewer (2016) defines the purposes of sacred music in worship as being four-fold, namely, teaching the gospel (education), connecting us to God in unique ways (emotional engagement), expressing our love as a community (unification), and worship fulfilling God’s command (worship and thanksgiving).

Spreadbury (2016) exemplifies the notion of education through sacred music as he explains how music in the Anglican church follows the seasons of the liturgical calendar of the church. According to him “[w]orship is themed around the two great Christological cycles, reflecting the incarnation (from Advent to Candlemas) and the Paschal mystery (from Ash Wednesday to Pentecost)” (Spreadbury, 2016, para. 1). The arrangement of readings within the Christological Cycles follows a consecutive order which reflects the span and significance of the life of Jesus, which can be understood and experienced by the regular church attendee.

Evangelising through music takes two forms, namely (1) in the witness of Christ in the text of the sacred music and (2) in the exemplifying role of choir members in their selfless commitment to sacred music with its demands of perfection and dedication of time (Gomes, 2019). Gomes (2019, para. 8) reports on the teaching of Pope Francis on the way in which the visual role of the choir in liturgy, their dedication in rehearsing and perfecting music to sing in honour of God and the biblical text they bring to life in music, are clear forms of evangelising. Brockhaus (2018) and (Watkins (2018, para. 2) both mention a similar statement made by Pope Francis:

“Your music and your song are a true instrument of evangelisation insofar as you witness to the profoundness of the Word of God that touches the hearts of people, and allow a celebration of the sacraments, especially of the Holy Eucharist, which makes one sense the beauty of Paradise” (Brockhaus, 2018, para. 2).

Music seems to have an inimitable way of unifying the prayerful sentiments of a congregation. Sison (2004) highlights the way in which varying music styles offered in mass can symbolise the unity of a congregation. Sacred music unifies a community into a worshipping congregation by singing with one mind and heart to the same eternal cause, a musical equivalent to the congregation sharing in the eucharistic communion. Music brings people closer, even the most distant, by building bridges and ignoring the barriers of nationality, ethnicity or skin colour. It involves everyone in a “superior language”, bringing people and groups together from very different backgrounds (Gomes, 2019, para. 10).

The Merriam Webster Dictionary (2020) describes “transcendent” as (1) exceeding usual limits, (2) extending or lying beyond the limits of ordinary experience, (3) being beyond the limits of all possible experience and knowledge, (4) being beyond comprehension, and (5) transcending the universe or material existence. Traditionally, the church has used music in a semi-mystic way as a sacrificial worship-offering or in a way to help us feel God’s blessing and presence (Percival, 2007, para. 1), a practice that has often been described as the transcendent character of sacred music. Transcendence is achieved when sacred music spiritually moves the congregation through text and beauty of sound. Pirtle (2018) believes that God himself ministers through our being in music: “When Paul talks about singing, he also talks about it as a word ministry” (Col 3:16). Singing is therefore a ministry of God’s word to us “but one in which we participate in order to build up our brothers and sisters in Jesus” (Percival, 2007, para. 1).

Supporting this notion, Pope Benedict, reflecting on the theological understanding of Word-made-Flesh in the book of Genesis, which foretells Jesus’ manifestation on earth, draws a comparison between the theology of the proclamation of the Gospel through Jesus and the words of the Gospel made Flesh through the singing of biblical text in sacred music (Pirtle, 2018, para. 7). Pirtle (2018) talks of Pope Benedict’s statement that music is transcendent and goes beyond rationality. It talks to our human nature and our reason for being. This is itself the utmost reason to include music in worship: “Celebrating the liturgy involves the whole person: intellect and will, emotions and senses, imagination, aesthetic sensibilities, memory, physical gestures, and powers of expression” (Pirtle, 2018, para. 6). Further definition in the transcendent characteristic of sacred music is to be found in Schall’s report on Pope Benedict’s reflection on ‘What is Music?’. Benedict mentions three sources of music: (1) Love, (2) Sadness, and (3) an Encounter with the Divine (Schall, 2015, para. 7). Schall quotes Benedict’s conclusion in his

address where he says that “music is a demonstration of the truth of Christianity. [...] It remains a way to participate in the celebration of the mystery of faith” (Schall, 2015, para. 10).

Musical transcendence is described by Gomes (2019, para. 12) as assisting the congregation “to feel the attraction of beauty, which detoxifies from mediocrity, elevates them upwards, towards God, and unites hearts in praise and tenderness”. Pavlick (2010, para. 4) underlines that “music is much more than icing on the cake - music actually turns the human soul toward God, and it helps people to raise their hearts more fervently in prayer.” Music therefore expresses that which we are not able to communicate through text (Fraser, 2014).

In conclusion to this section, Adam (1992, p. 87) explains the consideration of the Second Vatican Council of liturgical music, which was more simply defined as ‘sacred song closely bound to the text’. Music was not to be seen as an ornamental accompaniment to the liturgy, but as an essential part of solemn liturgy - it *is itself liturgy* (Adam, 1992, p. 87).

The term ‘liturgy’ finds its roots in the Greek word *leitourgia* (λειτουργία). In order to define *leitourgia*, one must define *leitourgos*, which means, “a man who performs a public duty”. Therefore, *leitourgia*, would refer to the public duty itself. In ancient Greece, *leitourgia* refers to several varied public services. In the Hebrew Old Testament, *leitourgeo* refers to public service in the temple – the ritual service of a priest. With its appearance in Exodus 26:27, Joel 1:9 etc, it has been adopted in Christian meaning as public official service in a church (Fortescue, 1910, paras. 1–2). The New Testament sees the word *leitourgia* used in various other meanings, caritative activities (2 Cor 9:12), service rendered to communities by angels (Heb 1:7,14) and the “worship of God” (Acts 13:2). Jesus’ service as mediator between heaven and earth is called Liturgy (Heb 8:6) and he is referred to as “minister of the sanctuary and the true tent” (Heb 8:2) (Adam, 1992, p. 3).

Liturgy in the church therefore refers to all public rites, ceremonies, prayers and sacraments of the church, such as the eucharistic Mass, and should not be confused with private devotions such as the praying of the rosary (Fortescue, 1910, para. 5).

The rites and ceremonies of the liturgy of the first three centuries are evident in the numerous descriptions of the New Testament. The fourth century sees the ancient liturgical rites of Antioch, Alexandria, Rome and Gaul, all early Christian fortitudes, develop into three distinct liturgies. The liturgies of the three patriarchal cities of Rome, Alexandria and Antioch survive because of the district jurisdiction. The Gallican Rite was amalgamated into the Roman Rite.

These three district rites have kept their unique liturgies till the eighth century. All liturgies still used today are derived from the rites and ceremonies performed in these ancient patriarchs.

For the purpose of this study, the influence of the eastern rites, Antioch and Alexandria, are not pertinent. The Roman Rite, as with all rites, has developed substantially through the centuries (Fortescue, 1910). With the unique history of the Anglican Church, the Roman Rite forms the liturgical basis from which all Anglican liturgies are derived.

## **2.2 Anglicanism and Church Music in South Africa**

### **2.2.1 Establishment of the Anglican Church in England**

Christianity spread to England in the third century, and with Roman occupation during the fourth century Catholicism took root. At the end of the sixth century, Canterbury was established as the symbolic seat of the churches of England as a result of St Augustine of Canterbury's mission on behalf of Pope Gregory the Great. Disgruntlement with the control by Rome of the medieval English church was voiced in the twelfth century with the martyrdom of St Thomas Becket, marking the start of the conflict between the Roman Catholic Church and the State (Sachs & Dean, 2020, paras. 1–3).

The Reformation against the Catholic Church started on the European continent at the beginning of the sixteenth century. The Church of England broke away from Rome in Reformation under the leadership of King Henry VIII in 1534, with the movement culminating in the reign of Elizabeth I. However, the English Reformation did not entirely follow the extreme Protestant Movement of the continent. Strong (2017a, p. 5) writes the “essential ‘Anglican’ values are seen (variously) as instinctive moderation and compromise, attachment to a ‘middle way’, respect for antiquity and continuity, a concern for order and a reluctance to follow aspects of continental Protestantism”. England adopted the so called ‘via media’, a soft Protestantism, with the implementation of Archbishop Thomas Cranmer's *The Book of Common Prayer*, which incorporated a revised Catholic liturgy with Protestant ideology (Sachs & Dean, 2020, paras. 4–5).

The mid-seventeenth century saw the influence of the Puritans. This introduced more Protestant dogma into the Church of England with the reformatory efforts of John Wesley, John Newton and other clergy committed to an Evangelical revival (Buchanan, 2009, pp. 175–177). In stark contrast to this, the nineteenth century saw the renewal of ancient Catholic liturgy in the Oxford



Movement led by John Henry Newman et al. This Anglo-Catholic movement established a culture of High Church which sought to revive some traditions and rites of the early church (Sachs & Dean, 2020, para. 6).

The so called *Anglican Communion* was established as a major branch of the Reformation as a result of British Colonialism and the missionary of the Church of England in the sixteenth century. Strong (2017, p. 37) explains the way in which

“the Henrician Reformation established a series of patterns and precedents that would later become distinctively ‘Anglican’. Among the most important of these were: the integration of the Church into the constitution of the realm; the Church’s authority to enforce uniformity in worship; the dual authority of the bishops as simultaneously ordained prelates and officers of the crown; a devout ceremonialism that retained much of the traditional symbolic order of the medieval liturgy; and an abiding self-identification as a scion of the primitive Church of the apostles rather than the Church of Rome”.

The *Anglican Communion* is therefore a worldwide denomination of Christianity with the Archbishop of Canterbury as its nominal head and the British monarch as its supreme governor (Sachs & Dean, 2020, para. 1). The nineteenth century saw an immense growth in the Anglican Communion with the establishment of various national churches with loyalty to the Church of England (Sachs & Dean, 2020, para. 7).

Certain forms of Anglican church music have been composed with the express purpose of being used within the Anglican Offices and Mass. The Anglican Office and Mass has developed out of the Catholic Liturgy of the Hours.

The liturgy and prayer-life of Catholic Britain of the Late Medieval period was governed by the monastic Liturgy of the Hours, a liturgy that is also referred to as the Divine Office, Daily Office, or Canonical Hours. The cornerstone of this elaborate prayer rhythm was the eucharistic celebration of Mass as the public worship offering of the Church. The eight Offices were Matins (also known as the Vigil comprising two Nocturns between 12am and 2am), Lauds (dawn 5am), Prime (early morning 6am), Terce (mid-morning 9am) which is traditionally followed by Mass, Sext (midday 12pm), None (mid-afternoon 3pm), Vespers (evening 6pm), and Compline (night 7pm) (Cuming, 1969, pp. 6–7). These structured prayer hours are categorised into four classes. Each prayer time has a unique liturgy with appointed texts, readings, responses, canticles and



prayers which might vary on any given feast day (Cuming, 1969, p. 7). These texts were printed in the daily prayer book known as the Breviary (Dailey, 2011, p. 4).

Central to the devotions of the monastic prayer cycle was the Mass, with its structure resembling the later Tridentine Mass, still said today in various Catholic communities. All the devotions were said in Latin except for the Prone - a Sunday insert to the Mass which allowed for the sermon and some prayers to be done in the vernacular. The Canon of the Mass, the Eucharistic Prayer, was the one part of the Mass that remained unchanged – printed in the missal (Mass Book). The missal also contained the texts for the days of the year. The Canon of the Mass was preceded by the variable texts: the Collect, Biblical Readings, Secret, Psalm verses in the Introit, Gradual, Offertory and Communion Propers with Feast Days having the addition of Sequence and Tropes before the Gospel (Cuming, 1969, p. 12; Dailey, 2011, pp. 3–4).

Accepted regional variations of the-above described Offices and Mass rubrics were also in use, most notable of which were the Uses of Salisbury (Sarum), York, Lincoln, Hereford and Bangor. These were all recognised by Cranmer in his notes in the Preface of his *Book of Common Prayer* (Cuming, 1969, p. 14; Dailey, 2011, p. 12).

The notable historic events which lead up to Thomas Cranmer's first draft of the Book of Common Prayer are the following: 1) Martin Luther marks the start of the Protestant Reformation in Europe with his ninety-five theses in 1517 (Buchanan, 2009, p. xxiv); 2) King Henry VIII breaks with Rome with the Act of Supremacy in 1534 (Dailey, 2011, p. 5); 3) the first Tudor attempts at unifying the liturgy in 1543 with the enforcement of the Use of the Rite of Sarum (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 40); and 4) the implementation of the Act of Uniformity of Edward VI (Young, 2017, para. 1). Subject to these events, Thomas Cranmer publishes his Book of Common Prayer in 1549 (Buchanan, 2009, p. xxvi).

Prior to the official enforcement of the Book of Common Prayer in 1549, Cranmer and some other clergymen had already experimented with translating and amending small portions of the Latin Mass to English and writing new English Rites and prayers (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, pp. 22–25).

After the publication of the first Book of Common Prayer, the book was revised by various other contributors in the 1549, 1552, 1559, 1604 and 1662 publications, with the most important version published in 1662 (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 21; Young, 2017, para. 1).

The 1662 version of the Book of Common Prayer was used by the early Anglican missionaries to the Anglo-Boer Colony in Cape Town in the 1820's. The Anglican Church became an established church as the British won full control of the territory in 1850. In 1870, the Anglican Church of the Province of South Africa was formed through the expansion of the Anglican community (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, pp. 194–195). Sachs discusses an interesting observation on the reception of the Book of Common prayer in an Anglican Missionary Post in South Africa, 1849. The Book of Common Prayer had its distinct limitations - it relied on the British colonial order for the identity, vocation and authority of the church as a justification for its use, and it was not always regionally and circumstantially appropriate as it could not adapt to varying congregations and novel circumstances. This was because it did not adapt fast enough with the increasingly global character of Anglicanism (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 153).

In alignment with the Article XXIV of the Thirty-nine Articles published in 1571 (Buchanan, 2009, p. xxvii), which legislates the use of the vernacular language of the congregation, the Book of Common Prayer was translated into native African languages, namely, isiXhosa in 1864 and improved in 1906, isiZulu in 1872, and Sesotho in 1870 and revised in 1891 (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, pp. 196–197). As for the English Book of Common Prayer, a need for a revision of the book for South African usage was made in 1911 with the first Book of Common Prayer for use in the Church of the Province of South Africa published in 1954 (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 194).

Cumings discusses the development of the prayer book in the 1920's in the Anglican Communion. He focusses on six revisions, those which followed a more conservative Anglo-Catholic liturgical development (Scotland, America and South Africa) and those that had undergone evangelical developments (Ireland, Canada and Australia). He concludes his discussion by saying that

“[t]he South African Communion service was generally regarded as the most satisfactory of the six, even by supporters of the English Book. It certainly represented the ideals of the Anglo-Catholics more accurately than did the English Book, just as the Irish revision would have been perfectly acceptable to the Evangelicals” (Cumings, 1969, p. 190).

The official prayer book currently used by the Anglican Church of the Province of Southern Africa is the new ‘An Anglican Prayer Book’ of 1989 (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 200).

### 2.2.2 The Role of Church Music in the Anglican Liturgy

Anglican church music is defined by its character of timelessness and resistance to change. Chaney et al. (2004, para. 10) describes it as “an avoidance of revolution in politics and liturgy; rather than radical change, slow assimilation and gradual change remain characteristic from the Synod of Whitby onwards. This suggests that continuity has priority over novelty.” To further define Anglican Church Music, the value of worship through music and liturgy is embodied in the following ethe: (1) an inherited tradition that holds together both catholic and reformed; (2) the fact that the church has texts which are authorised, and freedom to choose any variety of expression; (3) the aesthetic potential of environment, music, art, and movement, offered as appropriate to the culture; (4) the symbiotic relationship between corporate worship and individual piety; (5) worship in an ordered liturgical space; (6) the liturgical ministry of bishops, priests and deacons; and (7) the church’s value in the following of the characteristics in our rites (“Liturgy and Anglican Identity,” 2005, para. 5).

Anglican music was shaped by the foundations laid by the early Christians in Britain, most notably, Benedictine Monasticism and the tradition of the Divine Offices. These had developed into the Office of Mattins and Evensong, but musical traditions of the Latin Rite post-reformation, remain in the singing of plainsong within chant and responses, and in the singing of psalms, canticles and prayers. By request of Cranmer, John Merbecke perpetuated the plainsong tradition from Catholicism into Anglicanism in his compositions of 1550. As in the case with many other British churches, Canterbury Cathedral traces their 1500-year musical heritage beyond that of the Reformation to the missionary of St Augustine, claiming that their all-male choir heritage was born of the monastic tradition (Chaney et al., 2004, pp. 2–3).

The Reformation also emphasised the singing of church music in the vernacular, English, in a way that employed simple harmonies to melodies composed to use one note per syllable, in a singable register of the voice with easy melodies, to encourage congregational participation. The Act of Uniformity of 1549 standardised liturgical and musical practices with the enforcement of the Book of Common Prayer (Temperley, 2001, sec. 3, para. 4). Thomas Tallis and William Byrd were early Anglican court composers who transitioned from the Catholic musical heritage. Their compositions exemplify Anglican music to composers. Further musical

pioneering was encouraged by the Book of Common Prayer in its inclusion of the choral anthem in the liturgy (Chaney et al., 2004, p. 3).

Anglican musical traditions develop on two different platforms: 1) through churches who have the wealth and status to finance musical growth such as cathedrals and Collegiate Chapels; and 2) through parish church music. The musical divide of parish versus cathedral church was blurred, as certain parishes had the means to perform cathedral repertoire. Parish repertoire was generally in a simple style, with Psalm-like settings to the music of the Office and Eucharist and the encouragement of active participation of the congregation. Contrary to this, cathedral music emphasised the independence of the choir's musical performance. Elaborate and experimental settings of the communion service, canticles and anthems were standard performance practices (Chaney et al., 2004, p. 4).

#### 2.2.2.1 Forms of Music in the Anglican Church

The following section further defines Anglican church music by discussing various musical settings and repertoire in worship (Routley, 1997, p. 129). In order to categorise the repertoire, I designed a system loosely based on the liturgical text classification of Ordinary of the Mass versus the Proper of the Mass.

Traditionally, the Ordinary of the Mass refers to the texts in the Mass which do not change from Sunday to Sunday, such as the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, *Credo*, *Sanctus* and *Agnus Dei*. The Propers of the Mass will therefore be the texts in the mass that change from week to week, such as the *Introit*, *Gradual*, *Alleluia or Tract*, *Sequence*, *Offertory* and *Communion* (Ouzts, 2017, paras. 5–6).

Based on this liturgical classification system, I have classified all music that is performed in an Anglican worship setting into two categories which encompass all musical settings of text that appear in Anglican worship: (1) standard liturgical texts of the Anglican eucharistic service and Offices that always appear in that particular service setting; and (2) standard liturgical musical offerings in the Anglican eucharistic service and Offices that have texts that vary according to the lectionary, or in the case of organ music, music that supports the theme of the texts in the lectionary.

## Standard Liturgical Texts of Worship set to Music:

### a) The Ordinary of the Eucharist

On the occasion of a sung eucharistic service, the musical setting of the Holy Communion will be performed. The intricacy of the musical setting may vary according to the occasion and the musical forces and their abilities. Parishes may use simpler plainsong musical settings of John Merbecke and Martin Shaw, whereas cathedral choirs might perform settings by Herbert Howells or Harold Darke (Temperley, 1979, p. 333). Western orchestral settings of the Mass by composers such as Haydn, Mozart and Schubert might also be performed at festive occasions (Bethke, 2015, p. 21). Routley (1997, p. 129) lists the composers of mass settings used in the traditional Anglican church.

### b) Mattins

Mattins is the Anglican service of morning prayer that combines the monastic offices of Matins, Lauds and Prime into one service – a design by Thomas Cranmer. This sung service is led by the choir and includes musical settings of the preces and responses and the canticles of *Te Deum*, *Benedicite*, *Benedictus*, *Jubilate* and *Kyrie* (Clarke, 1922; Kim, 2008, pp. 128, 132; Routley, 1997, p. 130).

### c) Evensong

Evensong is the Anglican service of evening prayer that combines the monastic offices of Vespers and Compline into one service – a design by Thomas Cranmer (Temperley, 2001, sec. 3, para. 1). This sung service is led by the choir and includes musical settings of the preces and responses and the evening canticles of the Magnificat and the Nunc Dimittis. The service will include the chanting of psalms, an anthem or motet, hymns and organ voluntaries (Clarke, 1922, paras. 1–8).

Very often, the Office of Evensong is concluded with the Benediction of the Blessed Sacrament. The practice of placing the reserved host in a monstrance and blessing the congregation at the conclusion of the Mass was a Catholic Church tradition that was assimilated into the Evening Office by the Anglo-Catholic movement in the nineteenth century. The sacramental benediction required formal liturgical ceremony by the priests and servers which was underpinned by a selection of sung Ordinary texts. The Benediction of the Sacrament largely fell into disuse as

Pope Pius XII encouraged reforms against the practice in the 1950's, reasoning that the mass should not be celebrated past noon and the benediction was a practice of evening devotion (Buchanan, 2009, pp. 56–57). This reform could have had an impact on the disuse of the Benediction of the Sacrament by the Anglican Church.

#### d) Preces and Responses

These are prayers of praise and supplication from the Book of Common Prayer in a musical setting of versicles sung antiphonally by a precentor and responses sung by the choir or congregation (Clarke, 1922).

Liturgical Musical Offerings in Worship with Variable Texts:

#### a) Propers

The Propers refer to the prayers and versicles that vary according to the date. These prayers represent the observance of a saint or event of the liturgical calendar. In the Roman Rite, these prayers would be set to plainchant – Gregorian chant. The proper of the Mass includes the chanting of the Introit, Gradual, Alleluia or Tract, Sequence, Offertory and Communion. These would be printed in the missal or the Gradual book (Ford, 2008, pp. 3–4). The term ‘Gradual’ refers to the “step” on which the cantor stood when chanting in the Roman Rite. The chanting of the Propers allows for meditation or response to the Epistle and Gospel readings mostly with the use of texts of the Psalms. These chants are normally performed responsorially between cantor and choir.

The Novus Ordo Mass now involves the congregation singing a hymn at the Introit or Offertory, or the choir chanting the psalm in Anglican chant between the Epistle and Gospel readings (“Gradual,” n.d.). The chanting of the Propers out of an edition of the Anglican Gradual is a practice rooted in the chanting of the Propers in the Mass of the Roman Rite, which itself is rooted in Christian antiquity. Because of its tractarian undertones, the Anglo-Catholic practice of chanting the Propers in English have largely fallen into disuse in South Africa, except for the very rare Anglo-Catholic parishes that still perform them. The reason the Anglican Church stopped chanting the Propers can be attributed to (1) the need for the Propers to be chanted by skilled choristers as it could not be sung by the congregation, (2) the Anglican Prayer Book making provision for the Mass to be said without the chanting of Propers, and (3) the

evangelical ideologies and charismatic trends in parish churches rendering the performance of chant as archaic (Ford, 2008, p. 3; Weaver, 2009, para. 4).

Even some Catholic churches have done away with using Gregorian Chant in their worship in spite of still practising the associated liturgical movements (Williams, 2016, para. 18). To attribute the banishment of chant to the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II)<sup>1</sup> would be a grave error, as its rulings contained explicit and binding recognition of the role of Gregorian chant in Christian history and that of the Roman Rite (Tucker, 2008, para. 1). The *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963), which was promulgated by Vatican II, speaks of Gregorian chant as ‘distinctive to the Roman liturgy’ (Adam, 1992, p. 88) and as the supreme model for all liturgical music (Adam, 1992, p. 85). It also contains Articles 112-121 on the norms of liturgical music which express preference for Gregorian chant with all other forms of music subsidiary (Swain, 2006, p. 46).

#### b) Anglican Chant

The earliest examples of this musical form were written by John Merbecke in his publication *The Booke of Common Praier Noted* (1550). This used the first seven traditional Gregorian chant psalm tones and applied it to chanting the canticles in English and likewise, tone eight was used to chant the psalms - this was the very beginning of Anglican chant (Rodriguez, 2020, para. 1; Temperley, 2001, sec. 4, para. 1, sec. 5, para. 13). The design of Anglican chant is a means to sing texts that have no metric rhythm, but by making use of the natural speech rhythm set to a harmonised melody (Alfred, 1970, p. 32). Anglican chant reached its prime in the eighteenth century, with its use in Mattins and Evensong as it solemnly, and with great simplicity, delivered the texts (Cuming, 1969, p. 130; Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 451). The chant can be sung unaccompanied but is most often performed with the accompaniment of the organ. The organ would colour the mood by underlaying the text with various registrations to characterise the music. The standard practice of cathedral psalm-singing is to do so antiphonally, alternating between the two complete halves of the choir with five voice parts each, *decani* and *cantoris*, which suits the Hebrew poetry of the psalms (Swain, 2006, pp. 5–6;

---

<sup>1</sup> In January of 1959, Pope John XXIII called for the convening of an ecumenical council of all christian religious leaders. The meetings started on October 11, 1962. The council is known as Vatican II as the previous council (Vatican I) ended in 1870. The council brought about changes in the church that would significantly affect church music and liturgy, amongst other things (Mathis, 2012).



Temperley, 2001, sec. 4, para. 2). The Parish Psalter by S. Nicholson first published in 1932 was used throughout the Anglican Province of Southern Africa (Bethke, 2015, p. 6).

c) Anthem (Motet) (Temperley, 2001, sec. 4, paras. 5-14)

Artopium's Music Dictionary (n.d.) describes the church anthem as follows:

“A choral setting of an English religious text similar to a motet, usually used in church with or without organ accompaniment. An anthem is a short vocal composition. In the church of England, the word indicates such a composition often using a non-liturgical text (i.e. not part of the official service). A full anthem is for full choir, without soloists, while a verse anthem makes contrasting use of solo singers. Both these forms flourished in the church of England from the late 16th century.”

The English anthem developed in the Protestant Reformation as a derivative of the Latin Motet. Today, the word ‘anthem’ refers to a piece of accompanied music, whereas the motet is generally unaccompanied (Das, 2011).

The function of the anthem is “to dispel tedium and enhance contemplation during the collection of the offering - and partly provocative, useful at points of rest or suspension in the liturgy to engage the congregation's religious imagination at the highest musical level” (Graham, M. Derksen, J. Winters, 2007, para. 2). Senn (2012, p. 28) comments on the beautifying role of music, with particular mention of the anthem, after the reconstruction of St Paul's Cathedral, which was damaged by the London fire of 1666, stating that “With the restoration of choirs and organs, Anglican cathedral and collegiate worship was enriched with new musical settings and anthems”.

d) Hymns

The *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (1861) was the only hymnbook in the Anglican Province of Southern Africa until the 1906 publication of the *English Hymnal*. *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, therefore, is still the most widely used hymnbook in the Province (Bethke, 2015, p. 3). The hymnal was published in the light of the Oxford Movement. Bethke (2015, p. 3) notes that many churchgoers in the Province owned their own copies of the hymnal and some parishes provided copies of the hymnal in its pews.



Many evangelical parishes affected by the Charismatic Movement have opted to discontinue the use of hymnals, reasoning that the cost to maintain and purchase hymnals is exorbitant and the repertoire in the books is outdated as the church has adopted charismatic music. Hymns and songs are now projected on a screen for the congregation - a development of the mid-1990's. This technology frees congregants to clap, move, dance and raise their hands. Corporate worship was improved as songs flowed into one another and there was no need to turn hymnbook pages (Evans, 2006, p. 64). Challies (2017b, pp. 4–5) lists that in abolishing the use of hymnals we have lost: (1) an established body of songs; (2) deep knowledge of the songs; (3) the ability to harmonise; 4) the ability to sing skilfully; and (5) the ability to sing hymns in our homes. Aigner (2016, paras. 1–9) lists why every church needs to sing hymns: (1) hymns have a strong theological grounding; (2) they allow for a more authentic response to emotional expression; (3) they display social consciousness and acknowledgement of church history; (4) they encourage congregational singing; (5) the hymn tradition is open to new contributions in compositions; and (6) they lend themselves to liturgical use. The projection of hymn texts on a communal screen might also infringe on copyright laws.

#### e) Organ

The role of the organ in Christian liturgy can be traced back to its use in Byzantium courts. It accompanied the imperial speech to indicate when the divine emperor spoke. After time the instrument was adopted into Papal liturgy, remaining in theological and political history for centuries (Ratzinger, 1983, para. 22; Ratzinger, 2014, pp. 484–485). Articles 112-121 of *The Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963) express strong preference for the pipe organ (Swain, 2006, p. 46), stating that “the pipe organ [...] to be held in high esteem, for it is the traditional musical instrument which [...] powerfully lifts up man’s mind to God” (Swain, 2006, p. 173).

The organ has accompanied congregational-and choir singing for centuries and has also flourished as a solo instrument with improvisations or composed voluntaries performed in the gaps of the liturgy, before a service, during processions, the distribution of the eucharistic elements, and after the service. The organ voluntary was so revered in the Church of England that it was custom to have a voluntary in the middle of morning or evening prayer. This practice lasted well into the nineteenth century (Temperley, 2001, sec. 7, para. 1). Vatican II gave organ music solemnity and gravitas as they declared “Instrumental and organ music continue as it were the wordless music of the early Christian Alleluia-*jubilus*. For there are realities that can be experienced and expressed only in the medium of art” (Adam, 1992, p. 87).

In the mid 1970's, the parish churches of the Anglican Province of Southern Africa were swept up in the Charismatic Movement. Some churches found the organ accompaniment archaic causing clergy to incorporate both contemporary and traditional music in the repertory, to the great disgruntlement of church organists. The organists' unwillingness to change with the movement saw an increase in worship bands leading congregational singing (Bethke, 2015, p. 18).

J. Graham's (2012) stance on the relevance of the church organ must be one very similar to that of a congregant of a charismatic parish. His article claims that church organs are part of the cause of the drop in church attendance, claiming it as an instrument not relevant to modern church worship. Johnson (2012) replies fervently to the article above saying that the decline in congregation numbers cannot be attributed to the church organ. She continues by listing the reasons that organ music is, at times, so terribly performed: (1) there are not enough trained organists; (2) the remuneration is too low; (3) the instrument is unmaintained; (4) there is friction between clergy and church musicians; or (4) there has been an extensive degrading of church liturgy. A huge shortage in capable church organists has been noted by Dean (2018), Pitts (2017), and Roth (2018).

#### 2.2.2.2 Music Performance Practice in the Anglican Church

The Anglican choir leads the congregation in the praying of the Offices and the Mass. The choir is made up of the standard soprano, alto, tenor and bass voice parts. The choir sings from the choir stalls in the chancel of the church and is vested in cassock, knee-length surplice, a ruff if the chorister is a treble, a medallion displaying rank within the choir and an academic hood worn in the Offices (Buchanan, 2009, pp. 90, 462; Chapman, 2006, p. 101; Cuming, 1969, pp. 6, 159; Meakin, 1990, pp. 66–67). The choir is split in two halves on either side of the aisle of the chancel to facilitate antiphonal singing. The halves of the choir are named *decani* and *cantoris*. These choir halves have all the choir voices (SATB) represented within them (Temperley, 2001, sec. 4, para. 10).

The traditional Anglican choir was made up of adult male singers, referred to as lay clerks, who would sing the bass, baritone, tenor and countertenor (alto) voice parts. They would accompany a soprano line made up of boys, called *trebles*. The use of only male voices was the established tradition. Later, where there was a shortage of boy trebles, the use of female voices to sing the soprano and alto voice part became an accepted practice. Female choir members are referred to

as *choristers*. The word *choristers* has now become the term used to define all choir members (Meakin, 1990, pp. 93–96; Temperley, 2001, sec. 5, para. 2).

The all-male choir is synonymous with the Anglican choral tradition but is in decline as it is based on the Catholic ideal of only male clerics and laity in the church sanctuary. Aigner (2018b) and Ratzinger (1983) motivate the importance of the symbiotic relationship between layperson and clergyman. The forbidding of females to sing in church can be traced back to practice in early Christian times inherited from Hebrew Temples (Stubbs, 1917, p. 416). The separation of the sexes in the Temple service was based on the premise that a woman's voice is a physical attraction (Stubbs, 1917, p. 420).

Pius X justified the ban on females singing in church on the grounds that females were not permitted to perform any liturgical function as they were not laity. Adam (1992, p. 11) reports that Vatican II consider certain groups among the laity that play a special role as agents of the liturgy. The *Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy* (1963) states that “servers, readers, commentators and members of the choir ... exercise a genuine liturgical function”. These role players in the service would normally be seated in the Chancel and Sanctuary of the church. These areas were traditionally separated from the Nave with a closed screen because they are considered the Holy of Holies where the Holy Eucharist is celebrated and therefore reserved for those who are officially engaged in the Divine Service (Stubbs, 1917, p. 420). The choir traditionally performs a key liturgical function and belongs to the ranks of laity (which includes bishops, priests and deacons) as formerly described (Stubbs, 1917, p. 420; Wijngaards, 2014, para. 7). Females therefore were not permitted to form part of the choir. This Catholic teaching was made relevant to Anglican choirs through early British Catholic heritage and the effects of the Oxford Movement in the 1840's (Temperley, 2001, sec. 10, para. 4).

The Victorian period saw the climax of the boy-choir era with music commentators noting a characteristic modern sound of English choirs and its dependence of the flute-like, ethereal tone of boys' voices and the distinct prominence of the individual lower voices, particularly the counter-tenors (Temperley, 2001, sec. 8, para. 7).

Despite the long tradition of an all-male Evensong choir, the use of female sopranos and altos has now become standard practice at St George's Cathedral in Cape Town. The cathedral was the last church in the Anglican Province of Southern Africa to have an all-male choir (Bethke, 2012, p. 20). Chaney et al. (2004), Graham (2018) and Meikle (2014) discuss the current reality of this tradition by suggesting that “the secular priorities of today's social scene have brought

about the demise of the traditional men and boys choir in most Anglican churches”(Chaney et al., 2004). Y. M. Graham (2018) supports this statement and documents the first instance where females were included in the treble ranks in Salisbury Cathedral in 1991. He describes how the tendency to move away from all-male choirs spread through Anglican institutions.

The “First all-girl cathedral choir in [the] southern hemisphere” (2016) was established in St Paul’s Cathedral, Melbourne. Meikle (2014) documents the institution of the first female treble line at Canterbury Cathedral and the demise of all-male Anglican choirs, whilst Grossman (2014) and Sweeney (2017) offer possible reasons for the decline in the number of church choirs in general. The value of female choristers to the church institution, when considering fair and equal treatment among girl and boy treble lines, is brought into question as Coghlan (2018) describes the resolutely hierarchical view of collegiate and cathedral all-male choirs upon mixed choirs. Coghlan goes on to mention the ‘stiff, venomous opposition’ to the introduction of female choristers at Salisbury cathedral (Coghlan, 2018, para. 8). Davies (2017, para. 1) reports on the possibility of the girl choristers of Gloucester Cathedral being done away with as funding runs low.

### 2.2.3 Anglicanism in South Africa

#### 2.2.3.1 History

The colonial control over the Cape alternated between the Dutch and the British since its founding by the Dutch East India Company in 1652 until control was formally signed to the British in 1815 in the Final Act of the Congress of Vienna (1814). The Cape was conveniently situated as a refreshment port for maritime trade between the East and West. The colony had a unique demographic of Dutch, French, German, Native Cultures and slaves from the East, making for the unique creole community culture of the Cape (Ward, 2006, p. 136).

The first record of an Anglican service held in Southern Africa was on board the Admiral Boscawen ship anchored in Table Bay on its return to England from the East in 1749 (Gordon & Bock, 2012, p. 15). An Anglican garrison chaplaincy was formed for the Cape Colony in 1806 as the British army took up their second occupation of the Cape. The Napoleonic Wars saw the territory exchange governance between the British and Dutch numerous times. These military chaplains to the British army also served as schoolmasters, preachers and colonists to the local community (Strong, 2017b, p. 51). The first services of Matins were held 1807 at the Castle of Good Hope, and subsequently the Groote Kerk, as congregations grew. The settled

English community was served by clergy under the jurisdiction of the Bishop of Calcutta in the 1820's and 1830's, with the Governor of the Cape in the role of Ordinary to see to the secular function and jurisdiction on behalf of the Anglican Bishop (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 195).

After complaints by colonial officials of the low levels of Anglican church life, Robert Gray was appointed Bishop of Cape Town in 1848. Due to the rapidly expanding diocese into the northern territories, Gray became Metropolitan in 1853 (Buchanan, 2009, p. 424) and announced a unilateral declaration of independence from the Church of England, forming the Anglican Church in the Province of South Africa in 1870 as a separate self-governing entity (Buchanan, 2009, p. 169). The Anglican Communion saw great growth in South Africa with the consecration of new dioceses in the Eastern Cape (Grahamstown) in 1853, Natal in 1859, Free State in 1863, Transvaal in 1870, Zimbabwe in 1886 and Botswana in 1955. These dioceses had growth within their own areas and split into more jurisdictions. The expansion into Namibia, Lesotho, Swaziland and Angola had the Provincial Synod change the title of the Province to 'Southern Africa' (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 195). Gray had his first diocesan synod as Metropolitan in 1856 and convened the first provincial Synod of South African Bishops in 1863 (Strong, 2017b, pp. 54–55).

#### 2.2.3.2 Church Music and Liturgical Practice

Anglicans in the Cape Colony would have been privy to the first surge of evangelical Christianity. This was as a result the evangelical Great Awakening of the middle of the eighteenth century that swept through the colonies (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 159). The Methodist Church, born of the John Wesley tradition of energetic preaching and evangelical spiritualism, was established earlier than the Anglican Church. The Methodist missionaries had arrived with the first British settlers and by the time Robert Gray arrived, the Methodist Diocese consisted of ten churches, sixteen priests and approximately ten thousand parishioners. Gray's remarkable achievement was his response to the delayed start of the Anglican Church in the Cape. His life's work was dedicated to the establishment of the Anglican Church of the Province of South Africa, which, by his death in 1872, consisted of five dioceses and a Synod of Bishops. Other denominations experienced staggered growth as they organised separate churches according to race, but Gray endeavoured to establish firmly the principle of a church for all races. In Gray's dedication to the rapid growth of the Anglican Church, he failed to instil the Anglo-Catholic traditions he idealised into the ethos of the church (Ward, 2006, p. 137).

The nineteenth century saw the influence of the Oxford Movement on colonial Anglican churches (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 159). The Anglo-Catholic movement was incited by John Keble's sermon in Oxford which influenced like-minded clergyman. The movement sought to reincorporate catholic liturgical practices with ceremonial symbolism through, for example, the use of Catholic clerical vestments, in order to emphasise the Eucharist as central to worship (Buchanan, 2009, p. 443).

The first major evidence of a schism in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa based on the liturgical and theological ideologies is evident in the opposing views of the conservative, tractarian-influenced Gray, firmly advocating Anglo-Catholicism, and the liberal bishop of Natal, John Colenso, openly advocating Evangelistic ideologies (Strong, 2017b, p. 16). It is especially clear that Gray and his wife, Sophy, were staunch Anglo-Catholics in the number of Gothic-style churches she designed and built in South Africa – the Gothic style being favoured by the Anglo-Catholic Movement (Ward, 2006, p. 138).

Gray's instruction to the new bishops of the newly-formed dioceses of Grahamstown and Natal emphasised mission work. John Colenso, an evangelical Anglican and free-thinker, was appointed the Bishop of Natal. He taught German-inspired theology, countering the accepted biblical doctrines of Romans and Exodus, had controversial views on polygamy and sought to find parallels between Christianity and native religions, among other controversies (Chapman, 2006, p. 112; Strong, 2017b, p. 16; Ward, 2006, pp. 130–140). Gray called for a Synod of South African Bishops and declared Colenso a heretic in 1863. After Colenso's appeal to British courts, Gray was said to have overshot his authority as the Bishop of Cape Town and had no jurisdiction to make such rulings. The Bishop of Natal remained while Gray then appointed an alternative bishop to the same region, the Bishop of Maritzburg. This split in the church is still prevalent today in the Church of England in South Africa and the Anglican Church of the Province of Southern Africa. This controversy led to the first Lambeth Conference, a sitting of international Pan-Anglican bishops, in 1867 (Chapman, 2006, p. 114; (Ward, 2006, p. 140).

Liturgy and Music in the 1850's laid the traditional musical foundations of the Anglican Church in South Africa. The churches of the Diocese of Natal practised Anglo-Catholic ritual observance in the 1850's. Pietermaritzburg Cathedral had frequent celebrations of Holy Communion with choir and prayer book responses. St Andrew's Church had a vested choir and clergy, who wore quire dress with hoods, and who regularly sang the canticles and psalms at morning prayer. St Paul's, Durban, had choir stalls built into the sanctuary and introduced

Catholic ritual traditions. The priests of the dioceses donned copes and chasubles at eucharistic services and choral evensong and the use of the 'Hymns Ancient and Modern' hymnbook and Book of Common Prayer was observed throughout the dioceses (Hefling & Shattuck, 2006, p. 160) . For the purposes of this study, the diocese of Natal can be exemplified as a microcosm of liturgy and musical practice in the Anglican Church of the Province of South Africa at the time.

Liturgy and Music in the 1900 saw considerable growth in traditional Anglican Church Music. The Diocese of Cape Town had forty-seven parishes in the 1900's, with four of those parishes described as traditionally black and attended by the Xhosa-speaking community. The primary language of the remaining forty-three parishes was English, with British Anglican worship trends and patterns. Sunday worship services included early morning Eucharist, Matins at 11am and Evensong at 7pm. The music in these services was led by a traditional, robed choir. The use of the 'Hymns Ancient and Modern' hymnbook (1861) was the standard throughout the diocese with very few parishes opting for the 'English Hymnal' (1906). The King James Bible also remained the standard among parishes for the first half of the twentieth century. Church liturgy remained Anglo-Catholic with the use of the worship books mentioned above, the 'Parish Psalter' and the Communion Service Setting by John Merbecke. This meant that worship throughout the parishes of the diocese was virtually the same (Bethke, 2016, pp. 2–3).

Music at St George's Cathedral flourished in the 1900's. The Cathedral had a well-rehearsed all-male choir which primarily performed at regular worship services. The choir produced music of high quality as they were of the standard to perform Bach's St Matthew Passion meritoriously. Despite lack of funding and resources, music education in schools and the availability of sound recording made for enthusiastic choirs in the parishes. Matins and Evensong were performed every Sunday and were well attended by the congregation. The service of Matins became obsolete in the 1940's as the eucharistic Mass was rescheduled to start at 9:30am. Performance repertoire for smaller parishes was limited with the choir largely fulfilling the role of leading the congregation in worship. However, smaller parish choirs did endeavour to prepare choral anthems for notable occasions in the liturgical calendar. Larger parish choirs performed cathedral-standard repertoire and some even sported all-male choirs. Bethke notes that the success of certain parishes was thanks to good funding in the parish as it attracted competent trained musicians (Bethke, 2015, pp. 6–8).



Liturgy and Music in the 1950's to the present saw a substantial shift in practice, from the height of the traditional music output of the church to the influence of the charismatic movement. The church, post-World War II, saw extensive changes in its liturgy and music, most prominently by the Charismatic Movement which affected Christian music internationally from the 1960's (Hindson & Mitchell, 2013, p. 90). New liturgical movements, particularly in the eucharistic service, emphasised congregational participation in the music of the liturgy. The morning Office of Matins, which was led by the choir, was no longer part of worship. Some parishes then focussed their choirs on leading Evensong, others introduced musical settings in which the congregation could not participate (thereby highlighting the importance of the choir) and other parish choirs joined congregational settings. Amateur worship bands began to replace parish choirs and organists at morning services. A notable decline in Evensong services also resulted from worship bands introducing evening youth services. Charismatic movements infiltrated Anglican churches with ease as evangelically-minded clergy were drawn to the new teachings of charismatic theologians and a growing secular community found a resonance with the worship music (Poewe, 1994, p. 54).

Music in St George's Cathedral flourished under the directorship of Barry Smith. Smith notes Dean Edward (Ted) King's strong aversion to the Charismatic Movement that swept across the diocese (Gordon & Bock, 2012, p. 109). The cathedral took heed of the changes in the reception of music by the congregation and clergy. Efforts were made to include music from South African composers which is still regularly performed in the cathedral. The cathedral services included the use of the three languages of the Western Cape (English, Afrikaans, isiXhosa). In consequence to the changes in the liturgy and the effect of charismatic music, some parishes reverted to Anglo-Catholic practices while others embraced evangelical church movements. The Office of Evensong in parishes gave way to evening youth services indefinitely and the introduction of liturgical dance further emphasised the redundancy of church choirs (Bethke, 2015, pp. 8–9, 16–23).

One of the occasions that enables a Province of the Anglican Communion to exhibit their musical and liturgical ideals is certainly the enthronement of a new Archbishop to the Province. The 1996 enthronement ceremony of the Archbishop and Metropolitan of the Anglican Province of Southern Africa, The Most Reverend Njongonkulu Ndungane, was reported to be a three-hour service of music, readings and a Eucharist. The choirs of St George's Cathedral, the diocese of Kimberley and Holy Cross Anglican Church, Nyanga, provided the music for



the occasion – this alludes to the variety of traditional Anglican music and traditional African hymnody. The mixed-race congregation was noted, with particular mention of the ability of the new Archbishop to move between several languages in the liturgy (“Archbishop of Cape Town Enthroned,” 1996, para. 2).

The enthronement of the Archbishop of Cape Town, The Most Reverend Thabo Makgoba in 2008, was no different in its sincere attempt to unite the Anglican Province through liturgy and music with a unique liturgy designed by Reverend Bruce Jenneker. Music was provided by musicians from across greater Cape Town, who performed the Lumko Marimba Mass, works by Schubert, Elgar, Mozart and newly commissioned works by local composers. Fanfares of western trumpets and the traditional Kudo horn were heard in the service. Again, mention was made of the multiple languages used in the liturgy (Rosenthal, 2008, paras. 1–2, 6–8).

The 1960’s to 2000’s was a time of musical degradation for Anglican church music in the Western Cape, with the downfall of traditional Anglican music and the abandonment of the Offices, and thereby, the church choir and skilled musicians. It introduced a variety of musical styles and standards, empowering amateur musicians and, in turn, reflected the diversity of society. The evangelical movement most certainly took root and the church saw a definite veer away from the Anglo-Catholic formality. Chaney, et al. (2004, p. 6) agrees with this stance in writing that “the demands of a “religious market” economy have also eroded high standards of musical competence. The fusion of music and text, which was the distinguishing quality of all Anglican choral music, is all too often replaced by univalent music that conveys simplistic and childish lyrics”.

For the purposes of this study, the Diocese of Cape Town can be exemplified as a microcosm of liturgy and musical practice in the Anglican Church of the Province of Southern Africa at the time.

### 2.2.3.3 Catholic and Anglican Ecumenical Relations

As this thesis makes references to Catholic resources, it is important to highlight the ecumenical relations of the Catholic and Anglican Church. The Anglican Church has always had a strong tether to Catholic relations and liturgical advances as a large proportion of Anglican theology, liturgy, music and church traditions are rooted in the Catholic faith. Membership of the Catholic denomination in Britain is forecast as 1.13 million for 2020, 25% of the Christian denomination in the country (“Christianity in the UK,” 2020).

Attempts by the Anglican Church to realign itself with Papal doctrine and practice was first made in the mid nineteenth century through the Oxford Movement of Anglo-Catholicism led by John Henry Newman who later converted to Catholicism and became a cardinal. A century later, Vatican II allowed for discussion to attempt to resolve doctrinal issues, paving the way for further greater ecumenicalism (Grove, 2018, para. 4). A major development of 1982 was the “pastoral provision” approved by Pope John Paul II that allowed groups to enter the Catholic Church while retaining elements of their Anglican identity (Grove, 2018, para. 6). Pope Benedict further actioned this process with the implementation of “personal ordinariates” in 2009. This new procedure allowed for the creation of dioceses without geographical boundaries which will be run by Anglican bishops and govern Catholics who form part of the pastoral provision, again allowing parishes which convert to Catholicism to preserve distinctive Anglican elements (Grove, 2018, para. 7).

Ecumenical relations shared between the Catholic and Anglican churches are strong. The recent Papal visit of Pope Benedict XVI to Britain in 2010 and the visit of the Archbishop to the Vatican in 2019 support this notion (ACNS, 2019; “The Papal Visit: Pope Benedict XVI in the UK,” 2010). In the 2010 Papal visit, the Pope celebrated an Ecumenical Service of Evensong at Westminster Abbey. As a result of the service, the Pope invited the Westminster Abbey Choir on an official visit to Vatican City where they performed the first Office of Evensong in St Peter’s Basilica (“Abbey Choir sings for Pope in St Peter’s,” 2012; “Anglican choir to sing for the Pope,” 2012).

#### 2.2.3.4 Styles of Worship

Chaney et al. (2004, p. 2) emphasise the resilience of Anglican church music as it is slow to change to any modern influences and, in so doing, finds its grounding in tradition. Anglican music has remained resilient to the trends of music genre changes through its avoidance of the impact of political or liturgical revolution of the church’s traditions. The genre has stood the test of time and remained relevant throughout the ages. Wood (2014) suggests that traditional church music was shaped through various church conflicts and in his argument, highlights the disputes of the early church in the Graeco-Roman era in its attempt to diminish the pagan music influence of Christian worship as well as St Ambrose’s encouragement of the participation of women in church worship in contradiction to the writing of the Apostle Paul (Corinthians 1:14). Though the illustrious Anglican church music is deeply rooted in tradition, conflicts within the church through the centuries brought about a degree of change. The introduction of new music

styles, such as contemporary worship music, influenced the fabric of Anglican music ministries. A reflection on the way in which new genres of music infiltrated Anglican music-making and the results thereof are investigated below.

The early twentieth century marks the beginning of the era of liturgy and music which encouraged active participation from the congregation, a key idea promulgated by the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy of Vatican II (Ratzinger, 2014, p. 516). Pope Pius X in his publication of church music, *Tra le sollecitudini* (1903), called for the congregation to be invited to participate actively in the holy mysteries and solemn public prayer of the Church. This was his attempt to “Democratise the Liturgy” (Adam, 1992, p. 39).

This was implemented in a number of ways. A major movement was to make the liturgy more comprehensible for the faithful by avoiding the extensive use of Latin (Adam, 1992, p. 63). Vatican II encouraged liturgical and musical localisation and an Africanisation of the church. This manifested in the use of the vernacular and the promotion of local music traditions and more accessible music genres (Bethke, 2016, p. 15). Liturgical renewal in the parishes of the Anglican Church of Southern Africa manifested in the active participation of congregations in the singing of accessible charismatic worship music and, in so doing, abandoning their Anglican musical heritage (Bethke, 2016, p. 18). It also encouraged congregational singing and discouraged the performance of music that would hinder the active participation of the congregation (Adam, 1992, p. 87). Pope Francis implores church musicians to encourage active participation of the congregation in the music of the church by helping them sing but not replacing its voice (Gomes, 2019, paras. 2–3; Watkins, 2018, para. 1).

In the attempt to make music more accessible to the congregation, contemporary worship music took root in parishes, which naturally brought about disputes in churches as to the style of music used in mass. This divided the congregation into those who prefer charismatic music with worship band accompaniment and those who prefer traditional music with organ and choir leadership. Some congregation members felt passionately for one or the other style of music, entering into feverish debates in their justification (Hallowell, 2011, para. 1,4).

Keith (2013) investigates in his thesis the perceived role of music in the church by comparing two congregations in case studies. His research concluded that in congregations with clear cultural and musical differences, the perceived role of music to the worshippers remained the same, that is, to draw the worshipper into a more direct contact with God. DeMol (1998) discusses the churchgoer’s receptiveness to various genres of church music, with special

reference to the mass setting. The author states that “our ability to appreciate and discern [music] aesthetic matters is spoiled. Further, it is difficult to distinguish whether our aesthetic capabilities are limited by sin, by differences of gifts, by human finiteness, or by a mixture of these” (Demol, 1998, p. 6).

Marshall (2019, p. 40) attributes the decline in traditional church music to the Modernists theology. “Modernism is the rejection of what Catholics had known as the good (morals), the true (doctrine), and the beautiful (aesthetics). The tight system of original sin, venial sin, mortal sin and being forgiven and healed through redemption in Christ is abandoned. Moral relativism is promoted. Modernists say that doctrine must always be “pastoral,” not “true.” And the gorgeous art, sanctuary, architecture and music of the Catholic Church is cast aside for the pedestrian, modern, and useful” (Marshall, 2019, p. 40).

Galbraith (2010) theorises a more liberal and inclusive stance in motivating for the development of an ecclesiological approach to music in contemporary Christian worship, suggesting that this musical style is indeed appropriate in the liturgy. The author proposes that when church musicians and clergy find themselves confronted with deliberation regarding musical style and appropriateness, they engage in exploration and discussion rather than uncritical application (Galbraith, 2010, p. 183).

The stereotypical notion that young congregants are progressive in their choice of music and liturgy and older congregants are more conservative, must be avoided. Ratzinger (2014, p. 402) warns not to politicise the liturgy by labelling positions as “preconciliar”, “reactionary” and “conservative”, or as “progressive” and “alien to the faith”, because this achieves nothing. Ratzinger encourages openness and discussion in the “search for the best realisation of the memorial of Christ” (Ratzinger, 2014, p. 402). There is however evidence that church authorities are actively promulgating contemporary music in an effort to pander to, and retain, younger congregants as documented in the writings of Zulu (2016), who reports on the strategies of the Anglican Church to retain youth. One need only observe congregational participation during the singing of the mass to assess the effectiveness of the music programme of a church (Zulu, 2016, paras. 5–6).

Aigner (2018) discusses the way in which offering different worship styles contributes to the decline of the traditional church. He reasons that there should be no need to pander to various tastes of music as “worship is about God’s divine impressions on us through word and sacrament, not our human expressions. [...] This only makes sense when we forsake the idea

that we should expect emotional satisfaction or release through worship” (Aigner, 2018a, p. 5), a sentiment that writings by Francis et al (2000), Larmondin (2001) and Calitz (2011) all substantiate. Ratzinger (1983), Chaney et al. (2004) and Russell (2007) acknowledge that the church is at a crossroad in its music ministry and propose various solutions to the current situation. Ratzinger theorises that the ecclesiastical and theological crisis of church music has been ongoing since Vatican II and concludes that “music must obey a stricter law than the commonplace music of everyday life: such music is beholden to the Word and must lead to the Spirit.” (Ratzinger, 1983, para. 34). Russell states that performing non-traditional Anglican music parallel to traditional music makes for an “inconsistent smorgasbord” (Russell, 2007, para. 6). It is also inevitable that when offering traditional and contemporary music, the standard of excellence in music cannot be upheld as the musician is either trained in a specific genre or is more comfortable performing in a specialised genre. Evidence of a decline in the quality of church music can be read into a report of a statement by Pope Francis which calls for the end of mediocrity, banality and superficiality in church music (Montagna, 2017).

### **2.3 Role of the Music Director in Anglican Church Music**

The Anglican Church traditionally entrusts the full and proper functioning of the music ministry to the appointed music director. Therefore, the responsibility to select, rehearse and perform music to accompany the liturgy is the core function of the music director. The traditional function and understanding of the role of the music director is crucial for the understanding of traditional Anglican music in liturgy. A change in this understanding could be a possible explanation for presumed changes in Anglican church music.

The role of a church parish music director embodies both the role of musician and administrator. In order to outline the job description fully, this section will list, define and discuss the key attributes of a well-rounded Anglican music director. The informative and amusing book *Advice to the Minister of Music – Get a Giant Hat Rack!* by Cheri Walters (1994) wonderfully describes the numerous roles of the music director of a parish choir. It defines the multifaceted and complex job description encompassed by the role. Wittry (2007, p. 319) exemplifies a music director job advertisement which describes the duties and responsibilities of a music director to be a leader to both the ensemble and to the community at large, to develop and enhance the vision and performance quality of the ensemble, to take charge of all administrative tasks of fundraising and promotional activities, to facilitate educational outreach initiatives, plan repertoire programmes and rehearsal schedules, supervise rehearsals, conduct concerts,

establish a strong cultural presence within the community and work closely with senior management.

The following general attributes of all church music directors, which also inherently apply to Anglican church music directors, will not be discussed in detail in this thesis, since they are self-evident: (1) the most fundamental skill of listening to the tonality and sonority of the ensemble (Lisk, 2006, p. 4); (2) score preparation with the ability to anticipate performance problems and strategise to address them skilfully, creatively and efficiently for effective rehearsal planning and time-efficiency (Bartle 2003, p. 98; Colson, 2012, p. 130; Meier, 2009, p. 131; Ward-Steinman, 2010, p. 63); (3) wellness, personal appearance and dress, which greatly affects the tone of rehearsals and performances - the pride taken by the conductor in his appearance is emulated by the choir (Bartle, 2003; Wittry, 2007); (4) performing with professionals - the need to be versatile enough to have prepared the chorus sufficiently and change rehearsal and conducting style effectively to engage with musicians at a professional level (Bartle, 2003, pp. 97–98); (5) leadership personality, being the art of persuasion through the power of position and trust - this trust is achieved by inspiring the choir with the contribution of the music director to the organisation and the morals represented by him or her (Wittry, 2007, pp. 77–78); (6) public speaking required at performances, conferences, workshops and management meetings - establishing a visual public presence forms the continuous promotion of the music ministry (Wittry, 2007, pp. 202, 205–208); (7) ensuring the facilities are well-suited with piano or organ, music stands, chairs, lighting and ventilation (Tagg, 2013, pp. 104–105); (8) consider planning for an annual or once-off CD recording session (Tagg, 2013, pp. 139–141); and (9) scheduling a local, national or international choir tour (Bartle, 2003, pp. 138–144; Ward-Steinman, 2010, pp. 178–180).

In the following paragraphs, I would like to discuss some key attributes of a music director essential for the role of Anglican Music director. The subcategorisation into the sections of Conductor and Musician, Teacher and Leader follows Lisk (2006).

### 2.3.1 Conducting

It is important that the music director is an accomplished, and preferably, qualified musician, with all the required technical training to perform the role of accompanist and conductor efficiently. Having an expansive musical knowledge in music theory fundamentals and music history and being adept in using proper terminology in rehearsal to explain concepts, is essential

(Chron Contributor, 2020, para. 2). It is essential to be adept in a keyboard instrument to accompany rehearsals, to be educated in vocal technique and production, preferably be a singer oneself and to be able to conduct ensembles. A background in teaching will stand the music director in good stead (Estrella, 2019, para. 2).

The ensemble director needs to have mastered the basic skills of conducting, having received formal training in the craft (Colson, 2012, p. 102). The ease and comfortability of conducting technique is paramount for affective shaping and interpretation of the music (Ward-Steinman, 2010, p. 10). Very often, where there is the absence of a choir accompanist, the conductor needs to fulfil this role too. This requires the skill of conducting the choir from the piano, sometimes having to stand and play the piano, play the piano with one hand while conducting the choir with the other hand, using the head to indicate preparatory beats, keeping visual contact with the choir and maintaining ensemble balance (Ward-Steinman, 2010, p. 16).

#### a) Professional Development

The key to staying motivated as a musical director is to continue learning and engaging in professional development. The music director should be willing to challenge himself by programming new repertoire, attending seminars and workshops, attending rehearsals of other conductors, accepting constructive criticism from colleagues, reviewing video footage of himself in rehearsal and performance and making the opportunity to teach his craft (Wittry, 2007, p. 211).

### 2.3.2 Teaching

#### a) Aptitude for Working with Children

The ability to engage with younger minds is essential as is the skill to describe and teach new concepts within rehearsals and the selection of appropriate repertoire to introduce various music styles. Teaching good vocal technique to children is paramount, with a focus on tone production, breathing technique, singing diction, intonation and musical phrasing (Bartle, 2003, p. 15). Ward-Steinman (2010, p. 22) advises that conductors who work with children should be aware of vocal, psychological and social changes during adolescence.



#### b) Music Educator

The success and growth of the choir is hinged on education. The conductor should spend a short time in every rehearsal emphasising fundamental music theory to develop music literacy while using the correct terminology when explaining new concepts (Chron Contributor, 2020, para. 2; Estrella, 2019, para. 2). Teaching within the rehearsal environment must be efficient and effective (Danyew, 2016, sec. 5). The long-term goal for the conductor should be to foster the independence of the choristers and sound sightreading skills. Bartle (2003, p. 46) recommends giving the choristers the opportunity to sightread sheet music, without the assistance of being taught the individual parts first within the rehearsal environment.

#### c) Leader and mediator

The ideal rehearsal environment is that choristers are seated quietly while being enthusiastic and attentive. It is important that the conductor maintains good discipline within the rehearsal environment. Establishing a rehearsal culture by implementing a rehearsal routine is essential (Bartle, 2003, p. 59). When tension arises, it is the conductor's responsibility to mediate. The skill of confronting people amicably without alienating or publicly embarrassing any parties is important, and in so doing, also dealing with disagreements or complaints with diplomacy and confidentiality (Mulgrew, 2020a, para. 5; Walters, 1994, p. 41).

#### d) Rehearsal Methodology

Colson (2012, pp. 20–28) discusses the infrastructure components of a successful rehearsal. An effective rehearsal is dependent on the planning process completed by the conductor before the rehearsal commences. The rehearsal infrastructure components are: 1) Ensemble Performance Goals; 2) Rehearsal Process Objectives, which are key to an outcomes-based rehearsal process and ensures the rehearsal has a sense of purpose and outcome; 3) Rehearsal Essentials, which refers to repertoire selection, time constraints and pacing, warmups, ensemble sensitivity and striving towards musicality; 4) Rehearsal Priorities, that is, to be true to the score with no musical or rhythmical errors, with careful attention to intonation, ensemble balance and tone, dynamics, and articulation; 5) Rehearsal Plan and Schedule, to ensure the goal is reached within a structured and planned timeframe; and 6) Rehearsal Teaching Strategies, to ensure growth and improvement of all choir members.



Tagg (2013, p. 102) emphasises the importance of the conductor being very well prepared for the rehearsal with an amount of time allocated to each rehearsal component. Lisk (2006, p. 19) concurs with this advice.

It is important for the conductor to be a good communicator within the rehearsal environment. The conductor's rehearsal language should be positive, uplifting and constructive at all times (Wittry, 2007, p. 186). Wittry (2007, pp. 141–145) concurs with all the statements regarding communication skills.

There is the temptation of many choir conductors to forgo the warm-up process. Ward-Steinman (2010, p. 100) motivates that there are two key reasons to spend time warming up the choir: 1) Warm-ups are important for all choristers, young and experienced. It focusses body, mind and spirit on the task at hand. It also creates a physical awareness of various muscles; 2) It is an opportunity to teach vocal technique to the choir. They are to be used to teach and reinforce vocal concepts that will be referred to later, within the rehearsal (Danyew, 2016, sec. 5).

Lastly, build a rehearsal atmosphere that is professional and collegial within a spiritual environment. A positive and inspiring learning environment yields the best results (Chron Contributor, 2020, para. 8)

#### e) Have a sense of humour

Long term commitment from the choir is fostered by an enthusiastic conductor, one who creates new opportunities for the choir, always strives to improve and makes the rehearsal enjoyable (Mulgrew, 2020a, para. 10). Rehearsals need to have an element of fun. The rehearsal experience is central to belonging to a choir - the conductor should strive to make the chorister look forward to returning each week (Cromwell, 2018, sec. 4; Mulgrew, 2020b, para. 7).

### 2.3.3 Leadership Skills

#### a) Minister through Music

A leadership role within the music ministry of the church is a calling and an extension of the evangelisation of the clergy. Choir rehearsals should commence with a prayer in order that the faith and service of the choir can inspire the faith of others (Chron Contributor, 2020, para. 8). The conductor should explain the meaning of text and the significance of the works sung,

reminding the choir that they minister to the congregation through music (Cromwell, 2018, sec. 5).

#### b) Approachability

The conductor is to be an approachable personality. Make easy opportunities for choir members to ask questions or discuss queries. The space for this can be made before and after rehearsals. Strengthen relations with choir members by learning their names and sharing opinions and concerns where appropriate (Mulgrew, 2020b, para. 4; Wittry, 2007, pp. 71, 141).

#### c) Administrator

Being an organiser is paramount to the success of any choir, however it is not always the case that it is within the conductor's aptitude to administer at a large scale. If this is the case, conductors should delegate administrative tasks affectively (Mulgrew, 2020a, paras. 3–4).

The organisational skills and functions required of a conductor are numerous: 1) personal time management, which includes, at the very least, prioritising the important versus urgent administration, email, paper, telephonic and all other correspondence, delegating tasks, score study, long term and short term planning and scheduling; 2) meetings; and 3) recreation (Bartle, 2003, pp. 66–75; Wittry, 2007, pp. 70–75).

Central to organising and planning ahead is the design of an annual schedule which displays all rehearsals, performances and repertoire for the year while keeping school, academic and extramural activities, university schedules and major public holidays in mind. This allows choir members to diarise performances and rehearsals and prioritise choir within their weekly routines. Communication with parents and choristers must be clear and effective, using technology and social media which allows them to access choir schedules and data with ease (Tagg, 2013, pp. 83–86, 128–135).

Having an organised and well-resourced music library or muniments room is essential as it is the heart of the choir's musical output. A suitable categorising system that allows for ease of access to scores and books will assist in smooth overall running of the music ministry as well as when music programmes are being planned. Having a volunteer tasked as the music librarian is highly recommended and having library computer software is also a wonderful resource (Tagg, 2013, pp. 104–105; Wittry, 2007, p. 160).

Programme planning can only be done effectively when the conductor has a long-term vision set for the choir. This will allow for programming that challenges the musicians and allows for goal setting and growth in the ensemble. Appropriate programme planning is key to the success of the choir. Performing a variety of styles and repertoire develops the choristers to be versatile musicians. It also keeps both the listener and performer engaged. The conductor should be sure to programme works with genre varieties, both accompanied and a cappella anthems, new hymns, new editions of old favourites, new anthems and works that bridge the generational or cultural gap. The consideration of commissioning a new work by a local composer for an important occasion can also be made where there is the availability of funds. It is almost certain that programming will not suit everyone's taste. This is part of good programming - to challenge the listener and performer and to evoke new experiences and in this way, always encourage growth (Chron Contributor, 2020, sec. 3; Cromwell, 2018, sec. 3; Tagg, 2013, pp. 151, 157; Ward-Steinman, 2010, pp. 55–56).

In the process of programming for the choir, the conductor should assess the limitations of the ensemble, in terms of size, musical capability, budget and time constraints. Programming beyond the limitations of the choir will make choristers uncomfortable. If choristers are pushed too far beyond their comfort zone, this can cause performance anxiety and ultimately lead to the drop-out of members. Collaboration with soloists and other local music fraternities, the liturgical season, as well as important feast days, occasions, choir festivals and events and public popular dates should also be taken into consideration. The audience or congregation should be considered when programming for the music ministry. The overall educational value of the programme must also be considered (Cromwell, 2018, sec. 2; Wittry, 2007, pp. 97–103).

The very essence of community building can be exemplified by a choir. By nature, people want to be part of a social group, even more so if it is for a greater cause. The community does not only represent those who perform in the choir but also those who surround, support and administer the choir. The choir is a community that straddles all cultures, race, economic circumstances and creeds. Conductors must be aware of the social aspect of choir singing and plan for social events, celebrating accomplishments or special occasions, or choir outings, dinners, or retreats. Ensure that the choir reaches out to its members that are in need or celebrate with members - this builds loyalty to the choir and a deep sense of community (Cromwell, 2018, sec. 1; Tagg, 2013, pp. 149–150).

Cromwell (2018, sec. 2) states that “Excellence attracts excellence!”. Achieving an excellent performance standard will in turn recruit new members to the choir without the effort of a dedicated recruitment drive. People want to be part of a group that produces excellence. When embarking on a recruitment drive, it is important to identify children who are able to fit into the choir’s environment as well as parents who fully comprehend the extent of the commitment. Decisions need to be made in terms of the child’s religion, schooling, personal profile, schedule of extramural activities, personal interests, literacy level, music and voice capabilities. Choir parents need to know and buy into the conductor, the choir programme, the schedule and the conductors’ expectations of the chorister upfront. When recruiting, a keen understanding of the community and social strata on which the choir is based would determine many aspects of the functionality of the choir. It is important to remember that all children, no matter their background, are capable of appreciating and producing beautiful music (Bartle, 2003, pp. 76–85). The same principle applies when recruiting adult singers.

Auditions twice a year are recommended for both prospective and current members of the choir. This is an opportunity for the choir director to gauge voice change, skill and abilities and rotate seating and choir positions where necessary. An audition of this nature would assess healthy voice productivity, range and musical aptitude. In the audition of a prospective chorister, this opportunity can be used as an interview platform and if it is the audition of a current choir member, this opportunity can be used to interview the singer about their current experience within the choir (Tagg, 2013, pp. 99–102; Ward-Steinman, 2010, pp. 34–36).

Many church music ministries, with most established Anglican Church music ministries, are registered and affiliated with the Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) through their local branch. Through this affiliation, many Anglican churches who still have children within its choir ranks make use of the RSCM medals and ribbons and an awards system based on improvement, longevity of service and seniority within the choir ranks. St George’s Cathedral, Cape Town, made use of this system when the choir had a treble line. The RSCM has based the award of these medals on the ‘Voice for Life’ Chorister Training Scheme, which is an outcomes-based curriculum offered in a series of music tutor books (“Royal School of Church Music,” 2018, paras. 1–2). Long service certificates are awarded by the local RSCM branch to members of affiliated choirs. It is the responsibility of conductors to monitor and administer the awards system put in place at their institution (Tagg, 2013, p. 103).

### 2.3.4 Relation to Clergy

Any change in leadership and management is always a time of instability within an institution, especially within a church setting which has a regular turnaround of clergy and a staff of middle management which rarely changes leadership. When new clergy members are instituted in the church parish or a new director of the music ministry is appointed, there is great potential for new and exciting ventures, but there is also the potential for friction within management.

Choir directors in churches often serve a long tenure and the departure of the director is accompanied by emotion, stress and uncertainty from the clergy, remaining management and the choir. Special care should be taken to schedule the time of departure within a low season of the calendar of the church after an agreed-upon notice period has been given. The clergy and parish council should receive formal notification and should be committed to following through with an ethical and thorough process of appointing a new director. It is within this time of uncertainty where unrest can develop within an institution. A qualified and knowledgeable committee should be assembled for this purpose and a job description should be drawn up after consolidating with the departing music director, senior choristers and any other stakeholders. An appropriate timeline of events should be taken into consideration with regard to: 1) the appropriate announcement of the departure of the director to the choir and parish; 2) compilation of an exit agreement for the departing director; 3) advertisement of the vacant post; 4) receipting and opening of applications; 5) review of applications; 6) candidate interview and auditions; 7) evaluation of candidates; 8) offer of the job to the successful candidate; 9) hiring an interim director or music committee; 10) announcement of the new director; 11) arrival of the new director; and 12) the welcome and orientation of the new incumbent. All stakeholders should be kept well informed of the entire process and transparency and fair procedures should be a priority for all (Tagg, 2013, pp. 43–59).

Walters (1994, p. 26) likens a relationship between music directors and clergy to that of a marriage relationship, where there are upfront and uncommunicated expectations of one another. These preconceived, uncommunicated expectations very often become the root of disgruntlements in management relations. Open communication between the music director and clergy is key to the success of the music ministry. Both parties should communicate expectations and intentions upfront. All matters should be addressed with compassion and understanding. All disagreements should first be reflected on through prayer - this mitigates emotions of resentment or jealousy in management relations. It is vital that clergy and the music

director share the same vision with regard to the future projection of the music ministry and both should work together to achieve this common goal. The relationship should be based on trust - a trust that discussions will remain confidential between parties, that they have the best intentions for one another and that they always speak highly of one another in public. A mutual respect for the ability, position, opinion, qualification and role for each party must be ever present. Both the music director and clergy must consider the criticism raised against him and constructively engage with it. Negative, non-verbal communication must be avoided at all times as this leads to conflict. Conflicts should be resolved only with the parties actively involved - this should happen sooner rather than later and in private and confidence (Walters, 1994, pp. 25–34).

Bartle (2003, pp. 91–92) outlines the following practices as fundamental in the establishment of good relations between clergy, management and the music director: 1) a shared vision for the choir ministry that interlinks with the mission statement of the church and manifests itself in short and long term plans for the music ministry; 2) an understanding that decisions made by both the music director and clergy are always made in the best interest of the church and not for the individual; 3) clear outline of job description, responsibility and expectations; 4) regular appraisal of the job done of all staff members in the church; 5) a clear hierarchy within the institution; 6) effective and active committees qualified to expedite tasks effectively; and 7) a mutual respect among staff members based on trust and genuine concern.

### 2.3.5 Financial Management

The success of a music department and its output are directly linked to its financial capabilities. Every music director is furnished with an allotted income for the music ministry on which to function. This amount may vary greatly from one institution to another. It is the responsibility of the director to draw up a budget, obtain approval from management and, in conjunction with the choir committee, treasurer, clergy, or institution accountant, manage the finances of the music department effectively and responsibly through effective planning and record keeping. Rarely is the budget of the music department adequate for large performance projects. It will be the responsibility of the conductor to stand in as the entrepreneur of the music ministry (Ward-Steinman, 2010, p. 179).

Strategic financial budget planning should accompany the annual programme and schedule planning of the music director. A choir will rarely meet their long-term goals unless the music

ministry is appropriately financially resourced. An annual audit, financial statement, budget, balance sheet, and net income is essential for the effective administration of the finance of the department (Tagg, 2013, pp. 60–61).

Regular expenses and budgetary considerations may include: staff salaries, accompanist costs, purchase of music (including shipping or postage), printing (including maintenance and supplies), costs (programme, posters, concert brochures and newsletters), office costs (rental, equipment, furnishings and supplies), rehearsal and concert venue rental, instrumental costs (maintenance, insurance), performance costs (musicians, refreshments, recordings), music library maintenance, tour expenses, scholarships (organ or chorister), choir uniforms or robes, courses for development and continuous education and social events (fundraisers, awards) (Tagg, 2013, pp. 66–67; Wittry, 2007, p. 196).

Possible income sources may include: contributions (from individuals, boards, corporations, foundations, scholarships, bequeathed funds and endowment funds), the operating budget of the institution, contributions restricted for specific purposes within the music department (orchestral performances, music purchases, scholarships), grants (from government or other institutions), interest and dividend income, contracted performances, other performance income (ticket sales, sales of promotional merchandise or CD's) and fundraising events (Tagg, 2013, pp. 67–68; Wittry, 2007, p. 195).

## **2.4 Education and Development within the Anglican Church**

The success, sustainability and growth of an Anglican church music ministry is hinged on the education of future and current choristers of the church. The following institutions are central to the role of adult and youth music education in the Anglican Church:

### **2.4.1 The Royal School of Church Music (RSCM)**

The RSCM is an educational charity that promotes study, practice and improvement of music in Christian worship. The organisation encourages life-long learning by offering training in person and online through workshops, courses, activities and published resources. The RSCM, based in the United Kingdom (UK), supports an international network of affiliated churches, schools and individual members. The organisation was founded by Sir Sydney Nicholson in 1927 at Westminster Abbey with the mandate to improve and attain high standards of Anglican choral singing in affiliated churches. The organisation has changed its identity and mandate in



time and now serves a diverse ecumenical role in its support of church music (“About RSCM,” 2020, paras. 2–5).

The typical function of the RSCM is to encourage the gathering of church choirs at one location and expose choirs who are low on resources or unfamiliar with new liturgical practices to current practices. This keeps the tradition of church music alive and contributes greatly to continuous community education (Routley, 1997, p. 115). Routley (1997, p. 138) acknowledges that there are far fewer traditional Anglican choirs with children singing the treble line today, but attributes the high standard of choirs that still perform in parishes today to the role that the RSCM has performed in the community.

South African choirs were first affiliated with the RSCM in the early 1930’s, with the first RSCM summer school workshop hosted in 1960 in Cape Town. 1967 saw the expansion of RSCM South Africa to a wider national reach, encompassing four branches, namely, the Northern Branch (Transvaal, Kimberley), Natal Branch, Eastern Cape Branch and the Cape Branch (including Stellenbosch, George and Knysna). The branches enjoyed significant growth until the 1980’s, offering courses and workshops in repertoire performance, choral conducting, and sight singing. Most workshops that were geared towards larger groups of singers concluded with a service of Evensong. The 1980’s also focussed attention on the development, integration, and support of traditional musical elements in church music (Bethke, 2016, pp. 9–11). The RSCM Branch in Cape Town is still central to the education and continuous development of the majority of Anglican Church music programmes in the Western Cape.

#### 2.4.2 Religious Music within School

Music education in churches and schools may be imperative for the future of church music. Davis (2018) reports on the UK government’s in his opinion unfortunate intent to marginalise music education within schools, arguing that music education makes for a wholistic education and being. Hebert (2018) concurs with Davis in further justifying the importance of musical education of the Christian child. Henschen (2018, paras. 1–2) reports that there is a decline in music literacy among adults for the reason that music education in schools is deemed to be sub-par. Music literacy level were down to eleven percent in America in 2018. In 2017, the South Gauteng High Court ruled that public schools should not promote one religion but encourage mindfulness of all religions (Macupe, 2017). This ruling that encourages inclusivity of all religious affiliations, impacts negatively on the teaching of religious music in schools in South



Africa by restricting repertoire choices. According to Hodgson (2017, p. 187), the South African Constitution purposefully does not set any state religion in its attempt to unite people in their diversity. This constitutional example should be applied to all public education institutions. Teaching religious music in a public school which has no religious affiliation could be construed as excluding certain learners through religious exclusivity and marginalisation.

## **2.5 Future Prospects of Anglican Church Music**

Chaney et al. (2004) and Hohstadt (2018) hypothesise pessimistically about the future of Anglican church music. It is now recommended and customary in some churches, to present a variety of musical traditions within a service, sometimes resulting in an inconsistent smorgasbord of music from diverse sources and varied styles and historical periods. Chaney et al. (2004, p. 6) argues that this style of programming detracts from a seamless transition of repertoire in parallel styles, therefore contributing to the current problems in church music. The stance that congregations must not be lead by the current aesthetics of modern society has been suggested, but should rather rise up and preserve the heritage of the Anglican faith (Chaney et al., 2004, p. 6). This notion is supported by Hohstadt (2018, sec. 3) who explains that traditional church music programs must not be pressured to conform to modern society in the name of relevance, justifying that the church does not alter its moral standards in its theology in order to remain relevant.

The effects of a growing secularisation of society has already greatly affected traditional Anglican church music. Hill (2011, p. 2) reports from a survey done in 2011, that the number of traditional all-boy treble-line choirs in the UK had dropped to a quarter of the numbers that there were in the early 1980's - only an approximately sixty all-boy choirs remain. All is fortunately not negative as there is an acknowledgement from Pope Francis that some church music has become inappropriate for the liturgy because of its mediocrity, superficiality and banality (Montagna, 2017, para. 1). The Pope encourages a more culturally inclusive offering of sacred music within churches and that compilers should not be tempted to present a sentimental, nostalgic and archaic music programme that does not balance with the present way (Montagna, 2017, para. 2,9). Rishton supports this notion, explaining that we need to see church music as a vehicle of communication and decoration of the text of the Mass and we are to be cognisant of the real purpose of the Mass. The debate of the style of music to be performed and the defence of traditional music is inconsequential to the purpose of Mass, which is to worship God. He likens the excessive debate of the style of music performed in churches to the biblical

story of Moses and his shock at finding the Israelites singing worship songs to a golden calf (Exodus 32). As Christians, we idolise the music and forget the purpose of Mass (Rishton, n.d., paras. 63–64).

The Archbishop of Canterbury also regularly celebrates the Anglican choral tradition by using the Evensong platform to preside and celebrate notable occasions (“The Archbishop of Canterbury will be celebrating the choral tradition,” 2008, paras. 1–8). A recent, most notable, celebration of the Anglican choral heritage was the invitation from Pope Benedict XVI to the Westminster Abbey Cathedral Choir to perform at the Vatican. This ecumenical gesture is historic in its magnitude for the Anglican choral tradition (“Anglican choir to sing for the Pope,” 2012, paras. 1–3).

Kwasniewski (2018, secs. 6–7) reports that according to the observations of Archbishop Sample, younger generations who have not grown up with the traditions of the solemn Latin mass are now attracted to the Latin liturgy as is evident in the attendance when he presides at mass. Sample notes that the younger generation is more enthusiastic for the Latin mass than the older generation. The Archbishop says the attraction of the younger generation is owing to the solemnity, sense of transcendence and mystery that Mass in the Extraordinary Form offers. G Kandra (2018, sec. 11) reports an eight percent annual increase in church attendance since a local parish church has changed to offer the traditional catholic mass on Sundays.

In the same conservative line, Tilby (2018) writes positively on the prospects of traditional Anglican church music, as Evensong attendance rates in the UK are on the rise, reporting that attendance and weekday cathedral services have been on the rise since 2007. Berg (2017, paras. 1–3) concurs with these findings. Westminster Abbey has seen a thirty-four percent increase in attendance between 2008 and 2012. Evidence that traditional church music still remains relevant in society (“Cathedral choirs - Sing and they will come,” 2014, paras. 2–4). Gledhill (2018, para. 4) provides further evidence, by reporting that midweek evensong attendance in the UK has been increasing by sixty percent in the last ten years.

Marty (2007, pp. 5–6) advises that if we are to assure the presence of traditional liturgical church music in the future we are to: 1) accept the fact that there are varying styles of appropriate worship music within the liturgy; 2) not to deem oneself as elite or one’s opinion of the style of music as superior; 3) realise that all generations have not fostered the appreciation for classical church music and it is one’s responsibility to allow them the opportunity to grow in taste; 4) educate future generations to appreciate classical church music through

conversations about historical context – this is the only way it will survive into posterity; 5) foster classical music appreciation in young children; 6) find a way for people to participate in the performance or administration of classical music actively and not just be consumers; 7) note that all church music is to the worship of God and that it must have different moods, from contemplative and sombre to praising and energetic; 8) become cosmopolitan in the music used during mass - try and embrace church music from different cultures; and 9) ensure the future of classical music in church, by employing competent teachers, mentors, exemplars, coaches, and incentives in the church.

This literature study defined traditional Anglican music by contextualising its practices, defining the role of music in the liturgy, Anglicanism and its historical development and the establishment of Anglicanism in South Africa. Furthermore, it discussed the functionality of a music ministry of a church which was defined by discussing the role of the music director and the church's output of musical education and development. This presentation of data creates a contextual framework on which the findings of this research study are based. The readings from various sources have defined general traditional Anglican music practices and discusses Anglican music in South Africa as recorded from the 1800's to mid 1980's. The data does not make reference to current practices in Anglican church music ministries in the Western Cape, South Africa. This research paper will be contributing by closing the gap in research and reporting on current practices in Anglican church music ministries.

## **Chapter 3      Research Methodology and Design**

The following chapter aims to describe the research methodology undertaken by detailing the various stages of research. In this chapter, the primary and secondary research question are stipulated and contextualised, the research approach is outlined by stipulating and justifying the data collection methods employed, ethical considerations are discussed, and the data analysis process followed is explained. Summative comments are made on the reliability and validity of the study as well as its limitations.

### **3.1      Research Question**

Marczyk, G. et al. (2005, p. 34) discuss how a research problem should be devised and how a research question should be formulated. They define the criteria for a research problem as: (1) weighing up the relationship between two or more variables; (2) presented in the form of a question; (3) must be able to be tested empirically. The layout of the research question below is based on the template set out by Dawson (2009, p. 9).

As a result of the research findings in Chapter 2, it became clear that there are reasonable grounds for the presumed worldwide decline in traditional Anglican church music. The question therefore contextually addressed Anglican church music in the Western Cape, which has not been addressed in previous literature.

My primary research question was thus:

Is there a decline in traditional church music in the Anglican Church in the Western Cape?

My research question resulted in a secondary question which was addressed as well:

If there is a decline in traditional church music in the Anglican Church in the Cape, which factors contribute to this current situation?

In order to make a valid statement, possible contributing factors were assessed, including the development of liturgical music, national and international Anglican music trends, music leadership, clergy involvement, youth involvement, education and financial matters.

## 3.2 Research Approach

I chose to examine the research questions through means of case studies. Case studies allow for an in-depth examination of an institution, provide an accurate and complete description of the case examined, and also take specific context, nuances and extraneous influences into account (Marczyk, G. DeMatteo, D. Festinger, 2005, p. 147-148). Case studies allow the researcher to document and evaluate a contemporary circumstance in which he can explain how and why a social phenomenon has taken place (R. K. Yin, 2018, p. 33). Kumar (2011, pp. 126–127) concurs with the above-mentioned definitions. Chalmers' thesis (2008), which makes use of case studies to document the music programs of various parishes and investigate the role and function of traditional Anglican church music in the Witwatersrand, served as a model for this research. According to Mouton (2000, p. 97), this 'self-reporting' method allows one to make use of personal face-to-face interviewing, telephonic interviewing and interviewing by mail correspondence. Case studies enable the researcher to consider many variables in order to justify the findings (Marczyk, G. DeMatteo, D. Festinger, 2005, p. 42). It was important to be critically aware of the threat of bias on the part of the researcher. In a sincere effort to mitigate this, Marczyk, G. et al. (2005, p. 68) recommends comparing groups and selecting them at random. Statistical controls were observed by ensuring the case study pool represented institutions of varying history, while following design protocols by applying the same research methodology in interviews and questionnaires to all cases. Jason, L. Glenwick (2016, pp. 15–16) notes that qualitative research can vary greatly when comparing one community to another, but emphasises that the most important part of data collecting is hinged on the relationship established between the researcher and participant. Marczyk, G. et al. (2005, p. 149) does concede that the use of case studies as a research design allows for greater risk of bias from the researcher as it involves significantly more interaction between the researcher and the interview candidate. A sincere attempt was made to mitigate such bias by using objective measures in comparing findings.

The research approach was qualitative and of an empirical nature. Case studies were conducted on three churches selected for their diverse music programs:

- a) St George's Cathedral, Cape Town, the Mother Church of the three Cape Dioceses, and the seat of the Archbishop of the Anglican Church of Southern Africa: the Cathedral had the first established traditional Anglican music program in South Africa.

- b) St Michael and All Angels, Observatory: a traditional Anglo-Catholic church, which continues to worship using the old traditional Anglican liturgy.
- c) Holy Nativity, Blackheath: a church which is experiencing a resurgence in traditional worship introduced in recent years.

### **3.3 Research Methodology**

Data for the research was collected using primary and secondary sources and will include the following (Creswell, J. Creswell, 2018, p. 264; Dawson, 2009, p. 46):

Secondary sources have formulated the literature study presented in Chapter 2. This body of data formulates the foundation on which the interview and questionnaires were designed. The primary data sources consisted of two parts: a) a short-answer online questionnaire and b) semi-structured online interviews.

- a) short (yes/no) answer questionnaires, set up using the close-ended style described by Dawson (2009, pp. 31, 90) were completed by the current music director and rector of each parish via Sun Survey. This method of data collection was recommended by the REC Humanities as a means of shortening lengthy interview protocols, especially as interviews was conducted online per the COVID-19 regulations of the University of Stellenbosch.
- b) Interviews with the current music director and rector of each parish were conducted. They were in the form of face-to-face, semi-structured, online video interviews, which were transcribed by a professional company, TopTranscriptions. These transcripts were reviewed by the researcher for authenticity as per the recommendation for interview recording and transcriptions by Dawson (2009, p. 67), Seidman (2006, pp. 114–115), and R. Yin (2016, Chapter 7). The interview questions were set up as open-ended, as described by Dawson (2009, p. 31). Kothari's (2004, pp. 97–98) comments on interview method were also consulted.

Seidman (2006, p. 20) encourages the researcher to conduct interviews that do not exceed ninety minutes in length, but warns against the distraction of having to watch the clock constantly. Seidman recommends considering up to three interview sessions if necessary, over a two to three-week period, as it allows the researcher to develop a substantial relationship with the interview candidate. With regard to the number of interview candidates proposed, Seidman

(2006, p. 55) debates the number of interview candidates that should be sufficient for any given study and concludes it is advisable to err on the side of caution and interview more extensively rather than to be left with inconclusive or compromised findings. Dawson (2009, p. 54) supports these findings.

Yin (2018, p. 121) suggests that a case study researcher should have the following skills and values: (1) the ability to formulate good questions to create a rich dialogue by maximising one's familiarity with the topic; (2) the ability to be a good listener, process and further question a lengthy response from the interview candidate without bias; (3) be prepared to be adaptable in an interview scenario, and; (4) always protect the dignity of the interview candidates and adhere to ethical research practices.

### **3.4 Research Ethics**

Dawson (2009, Chapter 13) explains extensively on ethical considerations during interviews. Research questions were approved through Stellenbosch University Research Ethics Committee for Social, Behavioural and Education Research. All interview candidates were specifically identified through the constraints of the case studies outlined above, and therefore no recruitment methods were employed to gain the interest of possible interview candidates. The candidates were contacted individually, via private email, followed by a telephone call, to ascertain their consent to participate in the study and were chosen by the researcher virtue of their office held in the institutions studied, following the protocol outlined by Seidman (2006, p. 50). Contact with the interview candidates was made by the researcher himself, as recommended by Seidman (2006, p. 46), where the project was extensively explained, as to foster a relationship between the participant and researcher. All interview candidates were issued with an informed consent form prior to collecting any data for the study (Marczyk, G. DeMatteo, D. Festinger, 2005, p. 40). When the candidate consented to participate in this study, he was made aware that the interview transcripts will not be anonymised, could appear in the thesis addendum and might be used for future research or appear in a publication. All church parishes were furnished with a formal Gatekeepers letter, which required a formal response. Seidman (2006, p. 44-45) stipulates that some interviewees should be approached only once permission has been obtained from the institution for which they work, and therefore permission should be formally granted by the administrators in charge of an institution. The participation by the interview candidates in the study was entirely voluntary. They were free to decline to participate, withhold answering a question, or to terminate the interview at any stage. They

were also free to withdraw from the study at any point or choose not to answer certain questions while remaining part of the study.

### **3.5 COVID-19 Pandemic**

The Statement of Intent for this dissertation was tabled in 2018, the Research Proposal tabled in 2019, with field research commencing in 2020. South Africa went into national lockdown on 26 March 2020 due to the spread of the COVID-19 pandemic. Interview and survey candidates were instructed to respond to questioning with the mindset and music department status of pre-lockdown circumstances.



## **Chapter 4        Case Studies**

### **4.1    Introduction**

I completed interviews with the Rector and Music Director of each church parish for the purposes of this research paper in order to present holistic findings that fully encompass the status of the music ministry within the studied parish. Before the interview date, all interview candidates completed a comprehensive online questionnaire on the topic. The reports below of the current music ministries of the three church parish case studies have been compiled from the data collected. Firstly, a section outlining the establishment of the music ministry within the parish is presented, followed by a report on the way in which music ministry is currently run in the parish.

### **4.2    Anglican Cathedral Church of Saint George the Martyr, Cape Town**

In order to fully understand the structure, operations and output of the current music ministry of the cathedral, the history and establishment of both the cathedral and its music ministry are outlined below. It is then followed by an extensive report of the current status of the music ministry.

#### **4.2.1   Establishment of the Cathedral and its Music Ministry**

Early Anglican British Settlers had an agreement with Dutch Reformed church authorities to worship in the Groote Kerk on Sundays from 1807. The congregation then moved into the old St George's Cathedral designed by John Skirrow in 1834. The commissioned Thomas Joel Hitchcock three manual organ was installed in the same year. In 1861, the organ was upgraded to an organ built by Bevington and Sons and in 1889, again replaced by a new organ designed by William Hill & Son. This instrument is now housed at St John's Anglican Church in Wynberg (Gordon & Bock, 2012, pp. 96–98).

The early Anglicans did have music as part of their worship, though, records reflect, it was simple in style, largely comprising of metrical psalmody. Singing in services at Groote Kerk was largely unaccompanied until 1813, when permission was granted by the authorities of the Groote Kerk for the Anglican worshippers to make use of the organ. The first Anglican choir was founded in 1830 for the inauguration of the new organ of the Groote Kerk. This choir then later developed into an all-male choir. In the new St George's Building of 1834, an unrobed

choir sang from behind a curtain at the east end of the church. Anglican music entered an era of growth and formality with the arrival of the first Bishop of Cape Town, Robert Gray, in 1848. Gray, was highly influenced by the Oxford Movement, and strongly rooted in tractarian ideologies, encouraging high churchmanship (Bethke, 2014, pp. 1–8).

St George's Grammar School was established in 1848 for the purposes of providing treble voices to the choir as per the well-founded British model. Charles Thomas Neumann was appointed cathedral organist in 1864. He founded a stable and enduring Anglican all-male choir tradition in his twenty-four-year tenure. The cathedral choir was singing a full cathedral service by 1850, with commentary made on the good quality of the cathedral choir and equating it to the top colonial ensembles and the best in the Southern Hemisphere (Bethke, 2014, p. 9). The choir did not have the financial means to function as the English cathedrals, that is, by singing the routine of daily offices and services. However, the choir maintained a daily rehearsal schedule which in turn made for sung services of excellent standard (Bethke, 2016, p. 5). Thomas Barrow Dowling succeeded Neumann in 1888 and continued the growth and success of the cathedral music program. The foundation stone of the new cathedral building was laid in 1901, with the incomplete cathedral dedicated in 1909. The cathedral's current Hill organ from St Margaret Church, Westminster, was erected in 1909 with the quire completed in 1935. Bethke (2014, p. 8) remarks that the neo-gothic style architecture of the cathedral is directly linked to Gray's tractarian ideologies. This ideal can be seen to be promulgated in churches designed by Gray's wife. The architecture encourages high churchmanship and affected the states, repertoire and performance of Anglican church choirs, who then appeared robed and seated in the quire and lead worship on behalf of those in the nave. Barrow Dowling's long tenure was succeeded by Alan Hamer, for twenty-five years and then by Keith Jewell, who would be the last British cathedral organist at the cathedral. Jewell maintained a high-church choral tradition, much to the disgruntlement of the choirmen. Choirmen did not like the ritual and ceremony of the high church movement and objected to singing music that accompanied or encouraged such conservative liturgies (Gordon & Bock, 2012, pp. 98–104).

Dr Barry Smith began his tenure at the Cathedral in 1964, inheriting a well-established music department. The choir sang Sunday Eucharist, choral Matins and Evensong with an extensive Anglican cathedral repertoire. This performance tradition had greatly evolved by the later part of Smith's tenure. Matins was replaced by an end-of-month Mass using the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954), with the introduction of orchestral masses. Lighter music had

replaced traditional hymnody, but the cathedral still upheld strong theological and liturgical parameters, always valuing traditional Anglican music. The all-male choir sang all evensongs with a substantial repertoire of canticles and anthems. The cathedral commissioned numerous works by South African composers at the time. The choir was featured on numerous broadcasts by the British Broadcasting Commission (BBC). Smith notes his astonishment that while British cathedrals upheld high standards of cathedral music by employing lay clerks, St George's Cathedral Choir entirely comprised of volunteer singers and still upheld excellent standards. Smith reminisces fondly of his time working with the then cathedral Dean Ted King, saying that his musical knowledge, appreciation and support proved very important to the growth of the cathedral music program. Dean King had a particular aversion toward the Charismatic Movement taking root within the Diocese at the time. Smith's tenure at the cathedral ended after forty-two years of service. He was succeeded by David Orr and then by Grant Brasler, who started his tenure in 2013 (Gordon & Bock, 2012, pp. 105–109).

#### 4.2.2 Current Music Ministry

Interviews for the cathedral were conducted on 15 August 2020 with The Very Reverend Michael Weeder, Dean of the Cathedral, and on 3 September 2020 with Mr Grant Brasler, the Cathedral Organist and Master of the Choristers (Music Director). Weeder and Brasler submitted the pre-interview online questionnaire on 10 and 28 August 2020 respectively. All the information presented below is collated from Brasler (2020a, 2020b) and Weeder (2020a, 2020b).

Michael Weeder started his tenure as the Dean in 2011. After his theological studies at St Paul's Seminary in Grahamstown, Weeder served at parishes both regional and international, greatly varying in musical, cultural and ethnic backgrounds and traditions. Weeder notes that the parishes that influenced his Anglican music knowledge and understanding the most were St Clare's, Ocean View, the parish in which his vocation was established, St Columba, Gugulethu, comprising of Xhosa-speaking congregants and a substantial African music heritage, and St Michael and All Angels, Observatory, a conservative Anglo-Catholic parish. Even though Weeder had no formal music training, did not at any time belong to a choir and cannot read sheet music, he was greatly inspired and influenced by Reverend Fred Marks and Reverend John Hillman at St Nicholas, Matroosfontein, Mr Hadebe at St Cyprian's, Langa, Deon Irish at St Michael's, Observatory and Jonathan Langenhoven at St George's Cathedral in his musical understanding and practice in Anglican church music.

Grant Brasler is a qualified, professional musician, who started his tenure at the cathedral as the Music Director in June 2016. In his twenty-eight years of experience in church music, he served as Music Director and/or Organist at St Paul's, Rondebosch, and Organ Scholar and Assistant Organist at St George's Cathedral. Brasler notes that he has been particularly influenced in his music education by Garmon Ashby, Barry Smith, Jonathan Langenhoven and Vetta Wise. Brasler is a highly accomplished organist and is trained in conducting. He serves in a part-time salaried capacity at the cathedral.

The cathedral's clergy comprises the Dean and assistant priests, with the notable absence of a Cathedral Precentor. The role of the Precentor would be to manage the music and liturgy of cathedral worship. Currently, the Dean in part, fulfills the role of Precentor but cannot fully satisfy the responsibilities thereof in addition to his own responsibilities in the capacity of Dean. According to Weeder, a full cathedral clergy team consists of a Dean, who oversees the running of the cathedral and is a metro personality and leader in the diocese, a clergy pastor to visit and fulfill a direct pastoral role to the congregants and a Precentor, who fulfills the role of Chaplain to the choir school as well as administrating the cathedral ministries. The diocese and cathedral have still not managed to appoint the appropriate candidate. Weeder explains that the appointment of assistant clergy at the cathedral must be done with the utmost care and consideration of the requirements of the job, noting that he has learnt from past experiences in his tenure as Dean that all clergy are not suitable to the cathedral environment. Suitable candidates are a rarity as they are all committed to other parishes. Furthermore, there seems to be a fear among clergy to being employed at the cathedral - they appear to be intimidated by the platform to some extent with some clergy even declining the invitation to preach at the cathedral. It is imperative that new clergy members are liturgically and musically familiar with the offerings of the cathedral as there is no room for mistakes within services considering its public profile.

The cathedral music department is quite substantial due to the status and musical output of the institution. The cathedral has three choirs, each fulfilling a unique role within the output of the music ministry. St George's Cathedral Evensong Choir sings a weekly Evensong service as well as the festive Advent and Carol Services. St George's Cathedral Morning Choir is conducted by the Cathedral Assistant Conductor, Jonathan Langenhoven, and sings the 9:30 am morning Mass each Sunday, except for the last Sunday of the month. The Morning Choir also sings at the festive Midnight Masses of Christmas and Easter. St George's Cathedral

Chamber Choir performs a choral Mass setting for the morning Eucharist of the last Sunday of the month as well as at major Feast Days, often with orchestral accompaniment. Weeder alludes that the large cathedral music department has inter-choir politics that must be continuously monitored and mitigated. All the choirs function brilliantly as independent entities, but they cannot function when working on the same project together.

The cathedral choirs are functioning with a moderate to low number of singers, with the largest choir containing sixteen members. Analysis of the number of voices per part of the three choirs show that certain voice parts, particularly sopranos and tenors, are under-resourced in relation to others. 67% are highly experienced singers, 20% are qualified musicians, 62% of the membership is between the ages of nineteen and sixty years of age and 30% are over the age of sixty. In order to present a summary of the specification data gathered, the following table has been compiled:

**TABLE 1: ST GEORGE'S CATHEDRAL CHOIRS' SPECIFICATIONS**

St George's Cathedral Music Department	Evensong Choir	Morning Choir	Chamber Choir
Sopranos	3	4	6
Altos	5	4	4
Tenors	4	1	2
Basses	4	2	4
<b>Total Number of Singers</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>16</b>
Qualified Musicians	3	0	6
Highly Experienced Singers	9	11	9
Inexperienced Singers	4	0	1
5 to 13 years	1	0	0
14 to 18 years	2	0	0
19 to 30 years	5	0	5

31 to 60 years	4	8	5
61 years and above	4	3	6

The choir members at the cathedral join the choir with the intention to remain for the foreseeable future. This provides a stable, working music environment for the choir. Weeder has indicated that he would like to see the quire stalls populated with more singers in general, specifically, the presence of younger choristers and the return of a treble line, a more enthusiastic atmosphere from dedicated choristers, a greater variance in the demographic of the choirs to represent all ethnicities of the region and a need for more bass voices. Weeder notes that since 1994, the cathedral Morning and Evensong Choirs have slowly become dominated by coloured singers, and he would like to see a more demographically-inclusive choir. Brasler concurs with the shortage of choral singers, and states that he and the choir find safety in a larger number of choir members and acknowledges that all cathedral choirs do need more singers. Recruitment efforts have been implemented via the church pew leaflet and word of mouth. Applicants are informally auditioned when they have made their interest to join the choir, known. Formal recruitment drives and audition processes have been carried out for the treble-line at St George's Grammar School, but Brasler notes that the intention of auditioning for students for quality of voice and musical inclination is superseded by the desperate need for more trebles in the choir and the availability of the student to accommodate the choir's rehearsal schedule. The success rate of the recruitment drives at the cathedral remains unsubstantiated. Weeder highlights the trend that adult choir members mostly join by chance and not through substantial recruitment. Brasler theorises that it might be intimidating for prospective members to join a choir with such a fast performance turn-around. He continues that the greatest challenge in recruitment is to avoid poaching singers from other successful choirs and to find singers who are experienced in the Anglican music tradition. The cathedral music ministry still perpetuates a Euro-centric Anglican tradition, an image that the cathedral does not necessarily want to project. Few people are familiar with this musical tradition and finding experienced singers cut outs three-quarters of the singing population in Cape Town. Recruiting in privileged communities and universities for choir members will attract a certain demographic and class and this will not be perceived as a good thing by cathedral authorities.

The historically significant choir of the cathedral is the Evensong Choir. This choir rehearses once a week for an hour and concludes their preparation with a short rehearsal before the service. Choir members travel between 6km and 21km+ to perform in the cathedral choirs.

Brasler notes that the choir does enjoy a healthy camaraderie. Choir members have developed strong friendships and some members are family-related. The choir occasionally informally meets for a short social after the service. The choir was treated to an official dinner in the distant past, but budgetary constraints have caused socials to remain informal and unofficial among members.

The cathedral's music department is fairly well-resourced in terms of facilities and resources and is adequately staffed. Brasler functions as the organist, conductor and administrator in his position as Cathedral Organist and Master of the Choristers but manages a music staff consisting of an Assistant Conductor, Assistant Organist and Assistant Administrator. The cathedral music ministry functions without the employment of a choir committee. Brasler feels strongly that the employment of a choir committee at the cathedral is not a viable option. He explains that choir committees function well in community choir-settings, but with the set structure and predictability of the cathedral music programme, a committee slows down the administration and decision-making process and complicates straightforward decisions with bureaucracy. Weeder indicated that the cathedral music department would benefit from the employment of assistant staff, the involvement of younger music professionals and the appointment of a suitably qualified Precentor.

The music department is aptly equipped with an organ, chamber organ, six pianos, muniment room and music library, choir vestry, choir robes, quire stalls and music stands. The department is equipped with a well-maintained music library for which new music is purchased when needed. Brasler explains that the organ is a particularly valuable asset. The challenge experienced at the cathedral is a financial one, as the organ requires bouts of larger maintenance and restorative jobs outside of its regular tuning maintenance. The organ should ideally be tuned once a month but is currently tuned eight to ten times per year, which is paid for by the general church budget. Church authorities are supportive of the general maintenance of the organ and understand the asset's value and the importance of keeping it well-maintained. The organ comprises five major sections and each division needs to be cleaned and re-leathered as part of long-term restorative maintenance. These major services have taken place steadily over the past years.

The finances are managed by the music director and Cathedral Finance Administrator in conjunction with the Church Wardens and Dean. The music budget is part of the general fiscal oversight, which is subject to an annual audit. The music department has experienced budget constraints in recent years which has affected basic functionality, such as the freedom to purchase new music. However, budget limitations are adhered to and the finances are strategically managed, with the department having a long-term emergency savings plan. Brasler reflects that at the outset of his tenure, he was part of a cost-saving mission on which the cathedral had to embark as the income of the institution was not covering its running costs. The current music fund has been amalgamated out of what was a dedicated music fund for orchestral masses and a fund for St George's Grammar School treble choristers. The music department's income is largely made up of congregational donations, bequeathed funds, saved music ministry funds, patron support, concert proceeds and the profits from the cathedral Bric-a-brac and Bookshop, which has of late, been closed. Currently, the music department is also receiving funds to run its basic functionality from the general cathedral budget. The income received places the current cathedral music-ministry budget in a fairly stable position. Donations are more freely received when a project-based fundraising appeal is made, such as that of a Christmas orchestral Mass. Brasler expresses his concern for the financial security of the music department post the COVID-19 pandemic. He indicates that there is a sense of uncertainty with regard to casting a music-ministry budget "in stone", as it were. There are some grey areas that require clarity from management with regard to budgeting, but these issues were undefined by Brasler in the interview. He has some reservations about addressing this with management. Weeder (2020b, p. 52) states, "Every year Grant [Brasler] has to make a [budget] submission and part of the budget includes a salary, and then also for your orchestral masses and so forth, so, there is a budget set aside for that. Then people also sometimes enrich the budget by contributions". In conclusion, the cathedral does not have a long-term budgetary plan. Finances are managed on a year-to-year basis.

The Evensong Choir has suffered a great setback in recent years as a result of the loss of the Evensong treble line. The cathedral has a long history of having a fully functioning all-male choir with a treble line of boys. St George's Grammar School was established to supply the cathedral with choristers and did so until recently, when the treble line was diminished to nothing.



Brasler inherited a mixed treble line of St George's Grammar School students, both boys and girls, which had been functioning as such for approximately six years before the start of his tenure. The inclusion of girls into the treble line was introduced during the tenure of David Orr. Having mixed boys and girls in the treble line presents numerous challenges: 1) the maturity levels of boys and girls are not the same between the ages of nine and twelve years old; 2) mixed treble lines do not develop the same camaraderie and team spirit as single gender treble lines; and 3) the voices of boys and girls develop a different timbre as they enter the phase of adolescence - boys would leave the treble line when their voices break while girls could potentially stay in the treble line indefinitely, making for a disproportionate age-gap and a social awkwardness between the younger and older trebles.

Brasler explains that he recruited students from grades three and four and found that most of the boys would remain in the choir until their voices broke while the girls became disinterested by the age of twelve, finding new interests in other spheres of school life. He notes that he was considering the possibility of splitting the treble line into separate lines for girls and boys by starting a group of boys from grades three and four and a group of girls from high school with both treble lines treated equally – one choir would not be prioritised above the other. This would assist in relieving the pressure off students to sing every Sunday of the month - they could then foreseeably sing every alternate Sunday. However, this has not yet come to fruition as advice is needed on the logistics of the matter from someone qualified in working with treble voices in a traditional Anglican setting. Weeder voiced his concerns about gender equality when I posed a question regarding the return of an all-male choir in the cathedral in the distant future.

Historically, St George's Grammar School was housed on the same precinct as the cathedral but has since moved to a larger campus in Mowbray. This physical distance between the school, the lack of a cathedral Precentor and Cathedral Chaplaincy for pastoral care to the school, the development from an all-boys school to a co-education school, fewer Anglican children in attendance at the school and the multifaith ethos of the school has led to the complete dilapidation of the connection between the school and cathedral and the loss of the treble line. Students in the treble line gradually resigned from the choir for numerous possible reasons: 1) reaching a certain age; 2) minor disgruntlements; 3) social awkwardness in the cathedral and choir environment; 4) lack of commitment; 5) lack of incentive; 6) drop in the interest in choir music; 7) not coping with the standard of the choir; 8) dislike of repertoire; 9) issues with travelling the distance from the school to the cathedral; 10) the possibility of being involved in

a different extracurricular activity that could present more immediate or greater gratification; and 11) the lack of understanding and appreciation of the tradition amongst parents and carers who were not necessarily Anglican or Christian. With the school presenting many new opportunities for learners, the school day has become longer and more cumbersome for learners which might also contribute to the possible disinterest of learners in the treble line. Brasler notes that after auditions, trebles were not necessarily accepted into the choir for their musical ability, dedication and discipline, but for their availability of free time to be able to sing in the choir. This might also have contributed to an influx in trebles in the choir that were not suited to the environment.

Numerous meetings with cathedral representatives and the school management have been held regarding the status of the treble line. All the meetings were reportedly amicable and positive in support, but no action was taken by any party. Weeder recalls his meeting with the Headmaster of St George's Grammar School, Julian Cameron, in 2012. Cameron queried the commitment of the cathedral to providing a chaplain for the school, as they were functioning without one. Weeder indicated that the agreement he inherited at the start of his tenure was ambiguous. Brasler notes that there has been no official representative from St George's Grammar School present in the cathedral to show support of the music programme during his tenure, and vice versa, there has been only talk from cathedral clergy to address concerns with the Grammar School management - no such meeting has been actioned. Brasler sincerely hopes it is not too late to rescue a relationship with the Grammar School in the future.

Weeder adds that the Anglican ethos within the school has also weakened. When parents send their children to an Anglican school, they must be willing to have their children "inaugurated [and] initiated into all the conventions of our tradition (Weeder, 2020b, p. 10)". According to Weeder, the Grammar School has a high concentration of Muslim students and embraces interfaith practices. However, he adds that when engaging in interfaith offerings, one must be rooted in one's own denomination in order to return to one's own traditions.

Brasler acknowledges that it would be a viable solution to open the recruitment pool for trebles beyond the walls of the Grammar school, however, he is concerned that students from the privileged all-boy schools in the southern suburbs will not represent the cathedral's vision of transformation and inclusivity. He theorises that less privileged schools that might equalise the demographics and social class of the choir could also be approached, but one must consider choir bursaries and scholarships for trebles who might be disadvantaged, and transport for those

students from the greater Cape Town area. Weeder also mentioned the possibility of having children from communities of the Cape Flats join the cathedral music programme. However, logistical arrangements like transport, funding and staffing are the primary hurdles. It also involves the massive effort of establishing a feeder program that invests in the formation of developing musical literacy.

Brasler explains that in ideal circumstances, there would be a functioning probationer program that would have trebles musically trained with a strong foundation in a pre-chorister phase. It is impractical to host a program of this nature on the cathedral premises considering its locality - it does not have a community living close to the cathedral precinct. The cathedral also does not have many families with young children that would like to have them educated in this way thus making the notion of a pre-chorister program void.

In retrospect, Brasler noted that the replacement of the treble line with adult sopranos has enabled a higher level of musicianship and attempts at more complex repertoire: “I have become essentially more conservative. This is premised on the rationale that a cathedral, the liturgical flagship of a diocese, should aspire to hold the rich and also diverse heritage of Anglicanism to its bosom”. (Weeder, 2020a, p. 8)

The cathedral, as the seat of the Metropolitan of Southern Africa and the Archbishop of Cape Town has a responsibility to be the flagship of creative liturgical innovation and design for the purposes of inclusivity and diversity. It must also maintain high standards in its liturgy, rites and ceremonies. Many laymen and clergymen look to the cathedral as an example of correct and current liturgical practices. Weeder (2020a, p. 8) states, “The demographics of the cathedral, once predominantly coloured membership and white hegemonic presence, is contested by an influx of other South Africans and Africans from beyond our borders. The awareness of the nature of culture and the heightening of the desire for more inclusive representation of the changing demographics cannot be ignored”. This ideology is promulgated within the cathedral’s liturgy and its musical output.

The cathedral adheres strictly to the church calendar and the lectionary published and distributed annually by the Anglican Church of Southern Africa Publishing Committee. The parish makes use of the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) for Evensong and An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) for Mass. The New Revised Standard Version translation of the Bible is used.

All musical selections are made by the music director with assistance from the assistant conductor. These are approved by the Dean before publishing. Occasionally, the Dean also makes hymn selections if he deems it appropriate to the season, biblical lesson or sermon message. The Dean very often makes his repertoire selections to encourage inclusivity and diversity of the music offered. The parish makes use of the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) as their primary hymn book, in conjunction with the New English Hymnal (1986) and the supplement New English Praise (2006), as well as the Hymns Ancient and Modern (2013) which supplement hymns at eucharistic and festive services.

The parish makes use of the pointing for Anglican chant in the Parish Psalter, Nicholson edition, and the Oxford Psalter, which is sung at Mass and Evensong respectively. According to Brasler, the Parish Psalter is the most widely used in the diocese. The Oxford Psalter was introduced to the cathedral by the late Eric Spencer. Brasler prefers this edition as the pointing flows more musically, making use of triplets in its syllabic flow as opposed to duplets and does not sit on one note as a chanting line for too long. The cathedral made use of a custom-made chant book by Barry Smith in the 1960's however this is now only used as a reference for alternate chant tunes. The Parish Psalter is used at the cathedral's 9:30am Eucharist, as it makes use of a more modern English and aligns with the Psalm translations in the An Anglican Prayer Book (1989).

The cathedral provides the congregation with text-only editions of the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) hymnbook for the Office of Evensong. The congregation is issued with a pew leaflet that has the hymns printed for eucharistic and festive services. All choir hymnbooks, psalters and other sheet-music are provided to the choristers by the music department. The cathedral does not make use of the English Cathedral system of a dedicated music pad labelled with the voice part and name of each choir member and that contains all the required music for the service. This was the system at the cathedral in the 1960's to 1990's.

The cathedral makes use of national and international languages within services, most particularly, the languages of the Western Cape, namely isiXhosa, English and Afrikaans. Biblical readings, prayers, eucharistic prayers and hymns are done in various languages within the same service, with the translation of the spoken language provided in the pew leaflet in English. Verses of the same hymn may be sung in different languages. Most congregants tend to sing in their own language only or sing the entire hymn in English. Weeder (2020b, p. 41) states that one should “see it as a symbolic recognition that we are diverse, if not [as a] parish, but as a diocese and I would say we are a pan-African Cathedral”. This is an effort by the

cathedral to encourage the celebration of the cultural melting pot that is Cape Town, with a representation of the hybridity of cultures. Weeder sees the use of African languages in the service as a primary way to Africanise the Anglican liturgy. Brasler comments that in the effort by the church to modernise the liturgy through language, it is ironic that there are only translations of the texts available for the older hymn tunes. The practice of singing hymns in multiple languages at the same time might be disconcerting for some experiencing it for the first time, but Brasler reports that tourists have found it striking and quite positive and it makes for the impression of multi-cultural acceptance.

The congregation participates in singing the mass setting, hymnody, psalter, responses, Creed, and Pater Noster in the eucharistic mass. The Joseph Lees setting for the Pater Noster and the Martin Shaw setting for the Nicene Creed are used. The congregational mass settings of the Ordinary of the Mass include New Plainsong by David Hurd for the Lententide, Holy Trinity Setting by Christopher Tambling for the Sundays of Eastertide and Pentecost, Mass of St George by Barry Smith for the ordinary Sundays of the year and Christ Church Service by Colin Howard for the Adventide. Brasler notes the limitations of the repertoire cycle described above, explaining that introducing a new mass setting into this established cycle proves very challenging as the congregation is comfortable with settings with which they are familiar and clergy do not always have the foresight of, and buy-in to, of the newly allocated repertoire to allow experimentation. Both Brasler and Weeder encourage the active participation of the congregation, with Brasler programming with the intention of the music being accessible to the congregation. Selections are restricted to straightforward settings with repetitive melodies and patterns. The standard of congregational singing in the cathedral is fairly solid. The congregation learns all music of the service by “osmosis”. There have been past occasions where music was taught to the congregation before the service. However, congregations arrive just in time for the Mass and do not fully benefit from the offering.

Furthermore, the cathedral choirs perform a choral anthem at the weekly eucharistic service during the administration of the eucharistic sacraments. These anthems are always appropriate as their texts are more generic and are not necessarily linked to the liturgical season and biblical texts of the day. These can very often be scored for four-part choir, performed unaccompanied or accompanied by organ and could be of any varying genre or style, and early or modern music. It is very often sung in English but occasionally makes use of Latin text. The text of the anthem is also printed into the service booklet for special occasions. Choral anthems at Evensong are

traditionally sung before the sermon, after the Office of the service is completed. Very often, an anthem is sung as an Introit at notable occasions.

The settings of the responses chanted by the choir at Evensong are by William Smith of Durham, Martin Neary, Richard Ayleward, Stephen Carletti, Bernard Rose, and Philip Radcliffe. These are rotated weekly and are cantored, in the absence of an official cathedral Precentor by the Dean, a guest Precentor or a choir member. Cathedral clergy have been known to seek out assistance and advice on the rare occasion in their preparation of the chants for a service. This assistance has come from individual choristers and the music director.

The Evensong Choir has a core set of settings of the Evensong Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis Canticles. The choir has a large repertoire of canticles of more than twenty settings that are rotated, with some settings sung more regularly than others. These settings display a variety of genres and styles with compositions of both international composers, namely Stanford, Wood, Harwood, Hogan, Dyson, Gibbons, Causton, Farrant, Howells, Murrill, Noble, Morley and Sumsion, and South African composers, Carletti and Klatzow. Weeder notes that the cathedral has an established custom of programming the work of South African composers, but Brasler notes the trend to commission new works from South African composers has stopped partly due to the expense and the logistics of describing and guiding inexperienced clergy through the process of doing so. There is however hope that commissioning new works can become part of the cathedral music budget again.

It is the practice of the cathedral to preach a sermon in the Evensong service. In some parishes, the sermon is omitted in its entirety as the rubrics permit this. Anglo-Catholic parishes normally do the Benediction of the Sacrament in the place of the sermon. Brasler explains that this has not been a tradition of the cathedral for at least forty years to do the catholic ceremony of Benediction. It has been suggested by laypeople at the cathedral that the Benediction be reintroduced, but the cathedral does not identify as an Anglo-Catholic parish even if some of its clergy have come from that background. It is however a recent development for the cathedral to pray the Angelus daily. This is seen as quite a conservative Anglo-Catholic practice. The degree of Anglo-Catholic practice within the cathedral is therefore regulated by the Dean.

It was the practice of the cathedral to have a service of Choral Matins after the Eucharist on a Sunday between the 1850's and 1950's. This service is no longer offered at the cathedral. Choral Matins is however, the favoured format of the service when the cathedral is visited by

representatives of the British Royal Family. The cathedral, as the Metropolitan Mother Church of Southern Africa and the seat of the Archbishop of Cape Town has the honour of hosting diocesan events, state occasions and clerical installations and ordinations. Brasler explained that the service of Matins had been replaced in the 1970's, in the time of former Dean King, with the 9:30am Sunday Eucharist.

This Mass was intended to be a platform for liturgical experimentation and inclusivity. Weeder adds that King had unprecedented authority in his position, having served a forty-year tenure as Dean of the Cathedral. King made immediate changes to the liturgy without the need to consult or convince anyone. Brasler explains that the newly designed format of the mass, which is still practised, contained a smorgasbord of accessible, yet liturgically appropriate, lighter hymns and choruses interspersed in the mass between formal hymns from the Hymns Ancient and Modern Hymnbook. The congregation was invited to join the choir in the chanting of the psalm to Anglican chant. Brasler explains that a cycle of approximately eight psalm tunes was allocated, guaranteeing the participation of the congregation. Brasler motivates that this practice should continue at the 9:30am Eucharist, as it has the congregation participating in the Anglican tradition of psalm-chanting. More inclusive liturgical gender-inclusive language usage was undertaken and the *Versus populum* posture was taken by the Presider at a portable altar at the cathedral-crossing. Altar vestments were redesigned to reflect the modernism, progressive Anglicanism and African identity. The Mass of St George by Barry Smith and the Lumko Mass Settings were preferred as congregational eucharistic settings as it was more accessible to congregations and promulgated the notion of an African Anglican Cathedral. The Lumko Mass is also a popular choice at all diocesan services as it is used in parishes across the Province and is accessible to congregations. Even in this time of change, the cathedral always followed the liturgical rites and ceremony-traditions prescribed and required by the An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) for eucharistic Services and the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) for Evensong.

In interest of the progressive nature of the liturgy of the cathedral, the parish does not make use of the Anglican Propers, however, plainsong is regularly used to intone various seasonal prayers such as the Lenten and Advent Prose, Responsory and Introits and for Ordinary time, readings and responses proper to the season at Mass.

Liturgical formalities of services are managed by the various ministries (layministers, servers, music ministry, etc.) independently and approved by clergy when guidance is needed. This was



a decisive movement by cathedral liturgists of the time to embrace more experimental and inclusive liturgical practices, with an emphasis on a united congregation in prayer.

Brasler adds that the cathedral is an institution that is continuously grappling with its identity. Juggling between the contradictory identity of a Diocesan Mother Church and Cathedral as well as a Parish Church, a Church of Catholic liturgical traditions as well as on the forefront of liturgical experimentation and development, and a Church using both the An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) and the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954). In terms of music, there is a continuous drive to be inclusive and diverse in the musical repertoire performed, encouraging new translations of texts to be performed and repertoire that is more accessible and manageable for the participation of the congregation. However, there is also a sense of upholding Anglican tradition and heritage, such as in the singing of the Shaw Creed Setting at eucharistic mass and the consideration to include the Merbecke Creed setting as the older generations would be familiar with this setting, even though these settings sit awkwardly within the service because they make use of an older English. Further to discussion of repertoire choice and transformation, Brasler tells of his experience in the reception of new music that challenges the norm. He scheduled the Chilcott Little Jazz Mass for the Pentecost Service, expecting the clergy's reception to be positive as it embraces the cathedral's drive for transformation and inclusivity. Reportedly, Weeder's reception to the mass was underwhelming, encouraging Brasler to rather programme western classical masses.

The cathedral, as the mother church, hosts many diocesan services. Brasler explains that efforts have been made by diocesan events-managers to make contact with the cathedral music department to discuss repertoire and the music in the service. Unfortunately, the lack of understanding of the intricacies of music department logistics, lack of effective communication and last-minute arrangements have caused diocesan services to be a jurisdictional challenge. Much is expected of the cathedral choirs, with very little communicated to them. Diocesan services are also notoriously lengthy, sometimes reaching three hours long and require another commitment from choristers who lead busy, professional lives.

It was the intention of Dean King to consciously redesign the 9:30am Eucharist into a less formal, and more inclusive, atmosphere, purposefully eliminating catholic ceremonial traditions like bells, incense and robed choirs. Currently, the service has seen the return of those liturgical traditions in a hybrid service straddling old and new liturgical practices. Brasler comments that there is a sense that choirs would like to sing more elaborate settings of the



eucharistic Mass instead of the congregation singing a simple eucharistic setting. This has not been encouraged by clergy as the 9:30am Mass allows for the active participation of congregants. Weeder notes that it has been a trend to see laypeople taking on more priestly tasks within the diocese, such as a layminister reading the Gospel in the Mass. This is not a practice at the cathedral, but it speaks to the active participation of laity within the mass. Brasler explains that recent years have also seen the slimming down of liturgical texts in the eucharistic Mass, making for a shorter Sunday morning Mass. Brasler comments that the one shortcoming of the cathedral is that clergy are too concerned with meeting everyone's expectations, and in so doing, watering down the cathedral's liturgical and musical offering.

The cathedral offers newer forms of worship such as the Taizé meditative services in Lententide and Jazz Vespers on two Sundays of the year. The Taizé service makes for a quiet reflective environment for an intimate gathering of congregants. The Taizé worship choruses are freely accompanied by piano. The service of Jazz Vespers was introduced by Weeder in 2018. In the absence of the cathedral Evensong choir, a worship band from within the greater Cape Town Diocese was invited to lead the congregation in the service of evening prayer with worship music in the Jazz genre. Weeder recalls that his motive was to make both classical and jazz genre worship-music available, making a more youthful and varied congregation feel welcome in the cathedral. At the first Jazz Vespers, he invited a worship band from the Anglican church in Belhar. The jazz ensemble was formed of the standard rhythm section with four female vocalists and their sound-amplifying equipment. Weeder reports that the music was not suitably balanced for the acoustic of the cathedral building. It was too loud and did not encourage congregation participation. He feels that the musicians might have accepted the opportunity to perform in the cathedral with a specific intention as one of them remarked "we're going to show the Cathedral how to worship (Weeder, 2020b, p. 8)". Weeder explains that his intention was to phase the jazz idiom into a Sunday 9:30am mass to develop a youthfulness within the service led by a youth choir, but the unfortunate experience of the Jazz Vespers stifled his plans. Brasler reports that this service format was not entirely successful as the music did not comfortably integrate into the liturgy.

The cathedral offers an orchestral mass on the last Sunday of the month as well as on high feast days. This tradition was started in the tenure of Dr Barry Smith and Dean King and continues strongly today. These masses are performed by St George's Chamber Choir. Masses performed in 2019 included *Missa Brevis* in F by W.A. Mozart, *Mass* in C by Franz Schubert, *Kleine Orgel*

Messe by Haydn and Mass in G by Schubert. Brasler notes that Schubert and Mozart masses are particularly well-received by clergy and the congregation - this influences his repertoire scheduling choices. These masses require a large expenditure of the music-department budget as it involves the employment of several ad-hoc orchestral musicians. These masses are funded using bequeathed funds, saved music-ministry funds and occasional assistance from the Friends of St George's Cathedral Foundation. Brasler notes the challenges of staging an orchestral performance. Rehearsals with the full choir and orchestra take place before the service on the day. There is always a serious limitation of rehearsal time and a host of logistical practicalities to consider. It would be ideal to rehearse in the cathedral building with the orchestra and choir or have another rehearsal with the orchestra prior to the performance day. This will require the luxury of a larger budget and therefore is impossible under the current circumstances. Brasler also notes the limited selection of repertoire that can be performed. Any repertoire that needs to be rehearsed beyond the time available to the orchestra on a Sunday morning, or requires a larger orchestra cannot be programmed in light of budget limitations. Rehearsals with hired soloists for the orchestral masses happen in the week preceding the performance with the music director.

The choir performs a requiem for the feast of All Souls each year, alternating the performance of the Gabriel Fauré (1893 version) Rutter edition, and Maurice Duruflé (1948) Durand edition. Choral music is also provided for solemn holy days of Ash Wednesday and Good Friday. Programmes include early music settings of the day's texts and psalms chanted by a smaller vocal ensemble. Brasler adds the practice of employing a vocal ensemble at these services was established in Smith's tenure, as the choir would often need a break from one of the many consecutive services of Holy Week and the intimate nature of these penative services allow for the use of a smaller choir. Substantial choral works are sung annually with the availability of funding. Traditionally, the choir performs a setting of the Passion in the place of Evensong on Palm Sunday. The choir also performs a large music concert on Good Friday afternoon. Works performed here have included JS Bach's St John's Passion and Mozart's Requiem.

The Evensong Choir has sung under the baton of various national and international guest conductors in recent years and has undertaken a project of performing evensong in local parishes around the greater Cape Town area. This project was inspired by an annual initiative of the Choir of St Paul's Cathedral, London, to make music in local parishes and was suitably initiated by Dean Weeder and cathedral assistant clergy member, Reverend Shaun Cozett, at St

George's Cathedral. This outreach initiative is to take the cathedral Evensong to communities, where congregations do not have the privilege of enjoying a full sung Evensong. The parishes of Manenberg and Plumstead were visited in 2019. The cathedral choir and clergy were warmly welcomed by parishes at these events. This community outreach initiative was deemed a huge success by all parties involved. The cathedral choir has travelled internationally in the distant past and nationally in the tenure of David Orr. The opportunity for travel in recent years has not arisen due to the cost factor, especially considering that there are members of the choir who are families from the same household.

The cathedral music department has not made any formal CD recordings in the recent past. Brasler notes that the lack of formally recorded choir-performance material has been truly noticed as the cathedral has taken on a stronger Facebook media presence in the time of the COVID-19 pandemic. There has been a desire to showcase the cathedral choir in the online services offered, but there has been a dire shortage of recorded material.

The cathedral administration, including, the executive body and leaders of ministries meet quarterly for regular planning meetings. This platform is used to plan the upcoming quarter and table any matters that need to be discussed at management level. Brasler acknowledges that clergy see the music ministry as central to the worship experience at the cathedral, casting great importance on the success and smooth administration of the programme. Weeder highlights clergy's support of the music ministry, listening in on rehearsals on occasions in the cathedral for balance and quality. Clergy hold a weekly meeting on a Wednesday to confirm arrangements for the upcoming Sunday and to discuss some long-term planning. There is no need for a weekly meeting involving all ministries for the ordinary upcoming Sunday Mass. All ministries are required to submit their contributions to the church pewleaflet on time as the cathedral finalises and publishes this on Friday each week. Brasler explains that in the absence of a Precentor, he has been tasked with editing the music and liturgical details on the pewleaflet, especially for major services like orchestral masses. He expressed his discomfort with editing the liturgical texts in the leaflet as he felt he did not have the authority to do so. He inherited a cathedral liturgy that was loaded with supplementary liturgical texts that made the service "bulky". With the assistance and authority of the Dean, the liturgy has been stripped down to a more simplistic form, resembling more of what is found in the An Anglican Prayer Book (1989). Brasler wishes that liturgical service-booklets be discussed in a formal setting and finalised for printing well in advance of the upcoming liturgical season, Unfortunately, little

substance of the liturgical book is discussed from year to year as it is always edited at the last minute for printing.

The cathedral choirs are affiliated with the RSCM Cape Town Branch. Although the cathedral choir members do not regularly attend RSCM events, Brasler has indicated that he has been involved, by attending and hosting RSCM events in recent years. The cathedral music department also freely avails itself to be used as an educational platform for singers, organists and upcoming conductors. This practice is supported and encouraged by the Dean.

### **4.3 Anglican Church of Saint Michael and All Angels, Observatory**

In order to fully understand the structure, operations and output of the current music ministry of St Michael and All Angels, the history and establishment of both the parish and the music ministry are outlined below. It is then followed by an extensive report on the current status of the music ministry.

#### **4.3.1 Establishment of the Parish and its Music Ministry**

The Royal Observatory, after which the area of Observatory is named, was opened in 1827. A member of His Majesty's Astronomers, a clergyman named Fearon Fallows, soon established a small community of staff and Dutch farming families and held services in the lounge of the Observatory building, which was equipped as a chapel. The community of Observatory then became established through the laying of infrastructure for the main road in 1830, railway line in 1864 and a tramline in 1890. 1881 saw the establishment of a primary school and 1864 saw a substantial growth in the community of one hundred workers of the Observatory glass-works station (Carter, 2020, Chapter 1).

Due to substantial growth in the community and a strong Anglican presence, the foundation stone of the new Anglican church was laid in 1898. The church was then furnished with all the interior essentials, including a new harmonium ordered from England. Choir cassocks and surplices were purchased in 1899 and two quire stalls with seating to accommodate sixteen choirmen and twenty-four choirboys were fitted in the temporary timber chancel. The parish was consecrated in 1899. The foundation stone for the stone chancel and vestry was laid in 1904 and the consecration of the new additions to the church followed in 1905. The first organist and master of the choristers, F.A. Burgess, was appointed in 1902. He established a fully functioning music ministry and retired in 1926 after a successful tenure. The Norman and Beard

organ was installed in 1905. The instrument is the largest parish church organ in Africa and is renowned for its excellence in construction quality and sound (Bethke, 2014, p. 11; Carter, 2020, Chapters 3–4, 6).

The mid-1990's brought a wave of liturgical experimentation in the interest of new views in theology and growing secularisation of society. The Anglican Church of Southern Africa published numerous experimental liturgies in response to the growing movement of modern churchmanship. The charismatic movement influenced the musical output of many parishes, encouraging active participation of the congregation as a consequence of the new theological views of Vatican II. The parish of St Michael's ignored the pressures of liturgical, ceremonial and musical changes, opting to maintain staunch Anglo-Catholic worship. Musically, this saw the choir performing complicated musical settings at the Mass, with the congregation only participating in hymnody and chanting the Nicene Creed and Pater Noster. (Bethke, 2016, pp. 8–9).

#### 4.3.2 Current Music Ministry

Interviews about the parish were conducted with The Venerable Reverend Timothy Lowes, Rector of the parish and Advocate Deon Irish, the Titular Organist and Master of the Choristers (Music Director) on 13 August 2020. Lowes and Irish submitted the pre-interview online questionnaire on 11 August 2020. All the information presented below is collated from Irish (2020a, 2020b) and Lowes (2020a, 2020b).

Timothy Lowes started his tenure as the Rector in December 2019. After his theological studies at the Theological Education by Extension College in South Johannesburg and UNISA, Lowes served at parishes in the Gauteng province namely, St Mary's DSG, Pretoria, St Francis Waterkloof, Pretoria, St John's College, Johannesburg and St Anne's Silverton, Pretoria. Lowes notes that the parishes that influenced his Anglican music knowledge and understanding most were St Alban's Cathedral, Pretoria, where he was a choirboy, St John's College, Johannesburg and St Francis Waterkloof, Pretoria. Lowes has had music training in singing technique and the reading and performing of chant and belonged to a parish- and community choir, even though he was not musically literate. He was greatly inspired and influenced by Charles Norburn, George King, Ralph Renken and a Mr Paxinos in his musical understanding and practice in Anglican church music. St Michael's clergy comprises the rector and an assistant priest. The rector oversees the smooth running of all the ministries of the parish.

Deon Irish is an advocate, who serves in a part-time volunteer capacity as the Titular Organist and Master of the Choristers having started his tenure as the Music Director in December 1972. In his sixty-two years of experience in church music, he served as Organist at St Peter's, Camps Bay and at St Michael's. Irish notes that he has been particularly influenced in his music education by Barry Smith, John Birch, Shirley Gie and The Reverend David Binns. Irish is a highly accomplished organist and is trained in conducting. He received the most prestigious award of Associate of the Royal School of Church Music in October 2020 for his dedication, long service and substantial contribution towards Anglican church music in South Africa.

St Michael's music department produces music of an exceptional quality on a regular basis, with a large repertoire that accompanies the traditional Anglo-Catholic Mass. St Michael's choir sings a choral setting of the Mass every second Sunday of the month and an Evensong on the last Sunday of every month. The church observes all major feastdays, even if they appear on a weekday, as well as minor feastdays and saints' days, even if they appear on a Sunday of the year. The choir also sings the special Advent service, Easter Vigil, Ash Wednesday, Maundy Thursday and Good Friday services.

The choir is functioning with a sufficient number of singers for the repertoire performed. The choir contains eighteen members, allowing for repertoire that requires more than the standard four parts. Irish notes that he invites ad-hoc singers to join the choir ranks when there might be a shortage in parts due to a larger work to be performed, the absence of regular choir members or an increase in numbers needed for a special occasion. Analysis of the number of voices per part show that the choir is well-balanced with the numbers in the soprano- and bass parts being slightly more than the inner voice-parts. This is an appropriate arrangement for the repertoire performed by the choir. 50% are highly experienced singers, 38% are qualified musicians, 77% of the membership is between the ages of nineteen and sixty years of age and 16% are over the age of sixty. In order to present a summary of the specification data gathered, the following table has been compiled:

**TABLE 2: ST MICHAEL'S CHURCH CHOIR SPECIFICATIONS**

St Michael's Music Department	Choir
Sopranos	7
Altos	3

Tenors	3
Basses	5
<b>Total Number of Singers</b>	<b>18</b>
Qualified Musicians	7
Highly Experienced Singers	9
Inexperienced Singers	2
5 to 13 years	0
14 to 18 years	1
19 to 30 years	3
31 to 60 years	11
61 years and above	3

All choir members join the choir with the intention to remain for the foreseeable future. This provides a stable, working, music environment for the choir. Lowes has indicated that he is completely satisfied with the number of singers that participate in the parish choir. In light of this, no special recruitment efforts have been made to obtain new members in the choir. Generally, choir members join through word of mouth. Irish indicates that he will soon begin considering recruitment efforts for the choir to ensure the sustainability of the choir program. Auditions for new members of the choir are fairly rare and are done in an informal and unstructured way i.e. largely discussion based. Irish notes that he does not necessarily seek out people with a religious affiliation to belong to the choir but is more interested in people who are good and fast music-readers, fast learners and people who are dedicated.

This choir rehearses once a week for an hour and thirty minutes and concludes their preparation with a short rehearsal before the service. Choir members travel between 6km and 10km to perform in the choir. Irish notes that the choir enjoys a healthy camaraderie with choir members having developed strong friendships and some members being family-related. The choir occasionally informally meets for a short social after the service and, from time to time, is further treated by Irish as a thank-you for their dedicated service to the choir.



The music department is well-resourced in terms of facilities and resources and is fully staffed. Irish functions as the organist, conductor and administrator in his position as Titular Organist and Master of the Choristers and manages a music staff consisting of an Assistant Organist, Richard Haigh, an organ scholar and a choir librarian. The music ministry functions without the employment of a choir committee.

The music department is aptly equipped with an organ, chamber organ, harmonium, one piano, choir rehearsal room and music library, choir vestry, choir robes and quire stalls. The department is equipped with a well-resourced and maintained music library for which new music such as mass settings, orchestral scores and choral anthems are purchased when needed. Irish explains that the organ is a particularly valuable asset for the parish as he believes that competent and qualified musicians would not be interested in performing at the parish if the organ is not well-maintained. The organ needs to provide the organist with an artistic milieu that satisfies. The organ is fully tuned four times a year with three additional ad hoc fine-tuning sessions. Generally, tuning will happen prior to festal services. Irish notes that he books separate appointments for organ maintenance and tuning because there will always be the tendency for maintenance to take the priority.

The finances are strategically managed by the music director with the assistance of the Parish Treasurer and includes a long-term emergency savings-plan. The music department's income is largely made up of congregational donations, bequeathed funds, personal private donations, general church budget and income from sung funeral- and wedding services. The budget has the expenditure of the organist's fees, assistant organist, organ scholar and the remainder of the budget allocation is towards general music funds. Irish notes that patrons prefer to financially support a project that is tangible and where the appropriate use of their money is evident – this is evangelisation in a sense. In his experience, music directors need to venture out and find patrons, even if the source of the funding is not connected to the parish. Irish notes that endowments towards the music fund from deceased estates make for the most effective long-term music financial planning.

Irish explains that when he started his tenure at St Michael's in 1972, there was a mixed choir of ladies and men inherited from Richard Cock. With the encouragement of the rector at the time, Irish reinstated the traditional choir of boys and men at the parish. The first boys for the treble line were selected from the boys in the Sunday School. Soon, the choir was well-established with members carrying the extraordinary commitment of singing two services every



Sunday for the entire year, except for three weeks of holiday in January. Irish (2020b, p. 7) explains “the nature of society was so different that that sort of time commitment was not something unusual in that period. [...] It was still in the days where the Sundays’ observance act was very tight. There was no entertainment on Sundays or anything else, so people came to church because basically they had nothing else to do anyway”.

The treble line rehearsed twice a week. Boys finished school at 3pm which meant they were home while their parents were still at work. Choir practices were from 5pm to 6:30pm, two nights a week. Parents enjoyed this arrangement as it kept children occupied and off the streets in the afternoon. Irish notes that recruitment of boys was never a problem. In fact, there was a high number of boys who wanted to join the choir at that time. The treble boys had substantial training in vocal training and sight-reading. In the average week, they sang five to seven hymns, two psalms, a mass setting, canticles, responses and a morning and evening anthem, resulting in them learning a large repertoire.

The 1980’s saw a change in schools as they all started substantial afternoon sports and extracurricular activities. “The deep representation of fundamentals changed in pattern and so suddenly you found that the kids became less and less keen, the parents became less and less keen because the kids were tired, etcetera” (Irish, 2020b, p. 7). Boys were then only able to accommodate one rehearsal per week in their schedule, which meant that the boys would never be able to perform at a high standard. The decision was made to replace the boy treble line with female sopranos in 1985. Irish concludes the discussion on the history of trebles in the parish saying that although he misses the training sessions with the boys, he never regretted the decision of ending the boy choir tradition, especially not from a musical point of view.

Irish theorises that the all-male treble line will be virtually impossible to resurrect in a parish or cathedral environment in the greater diocese of Cape Town due to gender equality that has become a prominent movement. The only way a church could resurrect the boy choir tradition would be to have an agreement with an all-boys school. Furthermore, the church will then need to run a male and female treble line to give both genders equal opportunities.

According to Lowes (2020b, p. 7), “St Michael’s reflects one of the last parishes in the Anglican Province which seeks to hold onto traditional church music and liturgy.” Irish explains that the fundamental Anglo-Catholic ethos of the parish is not motivated by a single person or by the rector but is a group mindset of people. The parish makes use of the South African Book of

Common Prayer (1954) and the King James translation of the Bible. The Anglo-Catholic tradition of the parish is also upheld by ensuring that the rector and clergy employed at the parish are suitable for the liturgical environment. Irish notes that the last three rectors of the parish were employed after a considerable amount of research by the parish. Irish (2020b, p. 42) adds that a clergyman who accepts the position of rector with the idea of changing church practices which are rooted in a forty-year tradition within his tenure is a “recipe for disaster”. Change within a traditional parish must happen subtly, carefully and slowly.

The parish produces its own unique church calendar. It is largely based on the published church calendar in the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) and makes light reference to the lectionary distributed annually by the Anglican Church of Southern Africa Publishing Committee. The calendar runs from the first Sunday in Advent to the Feast of Christ the King in the following year, with all the Sundays and all feast days which will be observed. The calendar and liturgical formalities for feast days are arranged by a liturgical group of sub-deacons and is managed by the rector. Other ministries then make their arrangements based on the decisions made by the liturgical group. Lowes clarifies that the calendar from the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) is used for Sundays and the lectionary of the year provided by the diocese is used on weekdays.

All musical selections are made by the music director. Irish notes that rectors have never been interested in being part of the repertoire-programming process. If clergy has requested something specific to be programmed, Irish has tried to accommodate their request. Irish explains his stance that all music programmed for a service should be theologically sound and should serve the liturgy in the same way that psalmody did in the Old Testament. Irish (2020b, p. 4) states that church music has “always been there as an accompaniment to worship, as an enhancer of worship and as an adjunct to the liturgical process. It’s not an independent thing on its own at any stage. People who talk about not liking choir services and things because they’re concerts, I think just miss fundamentally the very entire basis of what it’s about”. When music is programmed, Irish considers the liturgical text, the liturgical season, the particular feast, the Office and the ceremony such as weddings or funerals, in order to enhance the worship experience. Effective programming underscores the teaching of the experience and is appropriate in every sense, including in the sense of the text setting and the sense of the mood and character of the music. Irish does not describe the repertoire performed within the parish as being conservative or progressive but defines it as a balance of music from the renaissance,

restoration and classical periods with the addition of music from the second half of the twentieth century.

Irish explains the process he undertakes when drawing up a music programme and schedule. A list of works that has not been performed by the choir in a while as well as a list of new works for the year are drawn up. These are plotted on the church calendar, starting with mass settings for the appropriate season, bearing in mind that certain feast days have repertoire that is cycled annually. Orchestral masses are plotted strategically as the choir performs approximately seven a year. Consideration is given to the spacing of larger works and works from varying genres across the year as well as to the impact of secular school and university calendars on the availability of choir members. Furthermore, choral anthems and other repertoire are slotted in where they are appropriate to the liturgical season. With all those considerations, a cohesive and manageable programme can be drawn up successfully. Irish notes that he has had some interest from certain individuals in the congregation who have suggested pieces of repertoire that they thought would be appropriate for the choir - some congregants have even purchased and donated the scores to the choir. Choir members have also suggested pieces for programming in the past.

The parish makes use of the Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) as their primary hymn book in conjunction with supplementary hymnal for tunes and texts for special services or occasions. Irish notes that he inherited the Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) as the hymnbook of the parish at the start of his tenure. He indicated that considering a newer hymnal for the parish possesses a few challenges in itself. Firstly, the exorbitant cost of replacing hymnbooks would be unaffordable for the parish - the depreciation of the Rand value since 1968 has made replacing the hymnbook a near unattainable luxury. Secondly, the Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) suits the liturgical life of an Anglo-Catholic parish like St Michael's. It was founded as the middle road between the English Hymnal, which had been in use before, and the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983), which is geared for a more broad-church tradition. The Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) was published in a time where the church still observed major Saints days on Sunday and therefore has a more Catholic tradition as it has the liturgical seasons as well as the major Saints days of the year clearly delineated. After the liturgical reforms of 1975 and following, the practice of observing major saints days stopped and Sundays became dedicated to observing the Sundays of the liturgical season with the Saints' day falling on a Sunday moved to the following Monday or

the next available day. As a result, there was little need to sing a Saints hymn for most congregations. The only Saints hymn sung would most likely be the Saint hymn applicable to their own feast or title. The third reason is that the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) has transposed the range of the hymns down to a more comfortable tessitura for the average congregant. This hymnal was geared towards promoting the active participation of the congregation, thus making the range of the hymn melody more accessible to amateur singers. Unfortunately, this has stifled the projection of sound of the choir when they sing the hymn. The Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) is more suited to the vocal range and capabilities of choristers.

The parish provides the congregation with text-only editions of the Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) hymnbook. The congregation is issued with a hymnal, a South African Book of Common Prayer (1954), and a Specialised St Michael's Order of Service Booklet. All choir hymnbooks, psalters and other sheet music are provided to the choristers by the music department. The parish does not make use of the English Cathedral system of a dedicated music pad labelled with the voice part and name of each choir member containing all the required music for the service. Music is laid out by the choir librarian for the ease of collection by choir members.

The congregation participates in singing the mass settings (in the absence of the choir), hymnody, responses, Creed and Pater Noster in the eucharistic Mass. The Merbecke setting for the Pater Noster and the Martin Shaw or Merbecke setting of the Nicene Creed are used. The congregational mass settings of the Ordinary of the Mass are the Communion Setting by Merbecke for Lententide, the Anglican Folk Mass by Shaw for Adventide and the Communion Setting in D by Wilson for the remaining Sundays of the year. The congregation has learnt the music of the service by "osmosis" and the standard of congregational singing in the parish is fairly solid. The choir performs a different setting of the Mass every alternate Sunday. The selection is programmed for performance every six months from an extensive repertoire of some sixty choral settings, including acapella, organ-accompanied and orchestral masses.

The choir performs a choral anthem when they are present at the eucharistic service, during the administration of the Eucharist. These anthems are always appropriate as their texts are linked to the liturgical season and biblical texts of the day. These can very often be scored for four-part choir or larger if need be, performed unaccompanied or accompanied by organ or orchestra and could be of any varying genre or style, early or modern music. It is very often sung in

English but regularly makes use of anthems with texts in other languages. Most of the time, the alternate language will be Latin. The texts of the anthem and orchestral masses are provided for the congregation if these are not part of the standard liturgy. It is common practice at some churches to sing a choral anthem as an Introit - this is not the practice at St Michael's. Irish disagrees with the practice of singing a choral anthem as an Introit as the Office of Evensong must start with the Responses with its opening text 'O Lord, open Thou our lips'. Liturgically, it is not proper to sing anything before the opening text of the responses. Choral anthems at Evensong are traditionally sung before the sermon, after the Office of the service is completed. When an anthem is not sung in English, the title of the anthem and the English translation of the text are announced and read by the conductor at the completion of the Office.

The parish makes use of the pointing of the Parish Psalter, Nicholson edition, for Anglican chant, which is only sung at Evensong as per the Anglo-Catholic tradition. It is the tradition of some Anglican parishes in the greater Cape Town Diocese to have the congregation sing the appointed psalm to Anglican chant. This is not a practice at St Michael's. However, Irish presented an interesting commentary on the practice, explaining that there must be an understanding that congregants share fully in the worship experience by listening and not by participating. The Eucharist Prayer in the mass is valid even though the congregation did not participate in the saying thereof, and likewise, the sermon was valid even though the congregation did not preach this. Therefore, if the congregation does not participate in a piece of music, this does not make the performance of the piece invalid within the liturgical setting. This being said, Irish acknowledges that congregants must still be given the opportunity to sing in mass where appropriate.

The choir has a core set of settings of the Evensong Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis Canticles. The choir has a large repertoire of canticles of some thirty settings that are rotated, with some settings sung more regularly than others. The settings of the Evensong Responses chanted by the choir are by Byrd, Tomkins, Smith of Durham, Clucas, Rose, Reading, Irish and Ayleward. These are rotated monthly and are cantored by the rector, a guest Precentor or the conductor.

By permission of the Rubrics and in its Anglo-Catholic tradition, a sermon is not preached in St Michael's Evensong service but a Benediction of the Sacrament is done in its place. Irish notes that the tradition of Evensong with the Benediction of the Sacrament was common practice in many parishes in Cape Town in the 1960's, including St James the Great, Sea Point, St George's Cathedral, Cape Town, St Mary's Church, Woodstock, St Luke's Church, Salt

River and St Michael's Church, Observatory. It is part of Western Catholic tradition and is a marvellous devotional service. It has become quite a useful practice for churches who are short of clergy, as it relieves the parish priest of preparing another sermon.

In the proud heritage of Anglo-Catholic worship at St Michael's, the parish ministries refer to the recommended practices in the liturgical rites and ceremony traditions prescribed in 'Ritual Notes: A Comprehensive Guide to the Rites and Ceremonies of the Book' edited by E. Lamburn for the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954). These rubrics are not followed strictly but are used as a guide. Liturgical formalities of services are managed by the various ministries (layministers, servers, music ministry, etc.) independently and approved by clergy when guidance is needed. All ministries function fairly autonomously and are required to submit their contributions to the church pewleaflet on time as the parish finalises and publishes this on Friday each week. Lowes notes that the music ministry is very much a 'dominant presence'. Layministers and altar servers on duty would refer to the musical structure of the mass as a dictating factor to their ceremonial function. Lowes also expresses his appreciation for the framework and structure that St Michael's liturgy and music brings to the Mass.

The parish is one of the last staunch Anglo-Catholic churches in the province and makes regular use of the Anglican Propers from 'The Gradual', Burgess Edition. Plainsong is regularly used to intone various seasonal prayers such as the Lenten and Advent Prose, Responsory and Introits and for Ordinary time, readings and responses proper to the season at mass. Irish explains that plainsong has been part of the church tradition even post reformation as Thomas Cranmer himself authorised the very first mass setting to be used by the newly established Church of England, which was the Merbecke Communion Service and which is derived directly from the plainsong tradition. St Michael's still acknowledges this rich history of plainsong within the Anglican Church by chanting the Pater Noster to the Merbecke setting every Sunday. Irish explains that the Merbecke Pater Noster is deliberately chanted unaccompanied, in recognition of the Anglo-Catholic heritage of the parish. The parish is proud and rooted in its Anglo-Catholic traditions and does not experiment with newer forms of worship such as the Taizé meditative services, for example. Irish notes that experimentation with modern liturgies does not fit into the liturgical practices or cultural mix of the congregation.

The parish offers an orchestral Mass on feast days and special occasions. This tradition was founded by Irish with great encouragement from Dr Barry Smith, the music director of St George's Cathedral at the time. At first, orchestral masses were performed very occasionally

and then started the tradition of performing them for Christmas, Easter and the Feast of the Assumption. The frequency of performing orchestral masses gradually increased. Masses performed in the last twelve months included Mozart Missa brevis in F K192, Mozart Missa in C, K.259 ("Orgelsolo-messe"), Haydn Missa in B-dur "Theresienmesse", Mozart Missa brevis in B-dur K275, Schubert Messe in G-dur and Haydn Missa brevis in F ("Jugendmesse"). These masses required large expenditure as it involved the employment of several ad-hoc orchestral musicians. These masses are funded using personal, private donations. In 2009, the parish embarked on a project called the 'Haydn Project'. The choir endeavoured to perform nine Haydn orchestra masses in one year, a huge and ambitious undertaking by any South African parish choir. The choir recently performed an orchestral Evensong, with the canticles and anthem accompanied by orchestra. This is a very uncommon practice and a very unique practice for the parish.

The choir performs a requiem for the feast of All Souls each year, alternating the performance of the Gabriel Fauré Requiem and Rheinberger Requiem in D minor. In addition to this special service, the choir performs a setting of the Passion in place of Evensong on Palm Sunday. The choir sings the full liturgy on Good Friday, including the Solemn Reproaches and a setting of the Passion according to John. Traditionally the organ is not used at the Mass. The choir also sings in the Ash Wednesday service - again the organ is not used in the Mass. The choir sings an Advent Lessons and Carols Service on the first Sunday of Advent. This service is then repeated at St Mary's Catholic Cathedral, Cape Town, with the choir performing as a guest choir, as an ecumenical practice.

The choir has performed outside the parish setting for their Christmas Concert at Hillcrest Quarry and a Bach Concert at the Endler Hall, Stellenbosch. The choir has also been in collaboration with other musicians, institutions, guest choirs and local school choirs. Irish explains that he tries to do at least one big musical project per year and also tries to create some novelty in the choir's output.

Irish acknowledges that clergy see the music ministry as central to the worship experience at the parish, casting great importance on the success and smooth administration of the programme. Lowes highlights clergy's support of the music ministry, listening in on rehearsals on occasions, noting their dedication and selfless commitment to the excellence of music in the parish. Irish notes that he and the choir have always had excellent relationships with parish rectors. Choir members have always volunteered their time to parish fundraisers, integrating



completely into the parish environment. There is no need for a weekly meeting involving all ministries for the ordinary upcoming Sunday Mass. Meetings are only convened when discussions need to be had for an upcoming special occasion or for unique feastdays. Normally a meeting would take the form of a liturgical ceremonial and logistic rehearsal. This would be to remind the altar party of the choreography of a special service such as Good Friday. Irish notes that in a liturgically structured and traditional church like St Michael's, there is no extensive planning or rehearsals to be done as arrangements do not change from year to year. A review and criticism of what is done in Mass is a rare occurrence - both the clergy and music director have expressed their openness and appreciation to any criticism voiced from a qualified opinion. (Lowes, 2020b, p. 13) adds, Irish has "been very helpful in terms of pointing out when I do things incorrectly, and I've been very comfortable with that, there is no malice intended, it's just he likes excellence and I like excellence".

The choir is affiliated with the RSCM Cape Town Branch, although the choir members do not regularly attend RSCM events. The music department also freely avails itself to be used as an educational platform for singers, organists and upcoming conductors. This practice is supported and encouraged by the rector. Irish was extremely involved with the RSCM for the first fifteen years of his tenure at St Michael's. He attended many summer schools' courses with the treble boys as it provided them with wonderful exposure.

Lowes notes the congregation's overwhelmingly positive reception of the congregation to the traditional Anglo-Catholic liturgy and especially the music. Irish notes that he has been approached by diverse members of the congregation expressing their gratitude and appreciation of the high standard of music performed in their service and how they have been spiritually moved by the experience thereof.

#### **4.4 Anglican Church of the Holy Nativity, Blackheath**

In order to fully understand the structure, operations and output of the current music ministry of Holy Nativity, Blackheath, the history and establishment of both the parish and the music ministry are outlined below. It is then followed by an extensive report on the current status of the music ministry.



#### 4.4.1 Establishment of the Parish and its Music Ministry

A new housing development started next to Kuils River in 1974, in an area called Blackheath. By 1975, enough homes had been built and families established to pique the interest of Bishop George Swartz, who discussed the possibility of beginning an Anglican presence in the community with The Reverend Tim Bavington, the rector of the Church of the Transfiguration, Bellville, at the time. The Reverend Bob Commin, assistant priest at St George's, Kuils River, then chapelry of the Church of the Transfiguration, was tasked with visiting the area and investigating the possibility of establishing an Anglican presence (Buckley, 2017, paras. 1–4; Commin, 2017, paras. 1–4).

Commin met with Hazel Buckley, a resident of Blackheath, and arranged for the first eucharistic service to be held in Buckley's home on Christmas Day, 1975. Due to the success of the first service, it was arranged for a regular monthly eucharistic service to be held in Buckley's home. The Reverend Barry Wood, The Reverend Robin Burnett and The Reverend Michael Dyers invested their time and expertise into establishing the Anglican community (Buckley, 2017, paras. 3–5; Commin, 2017, paras. 5–7). A church building in the Blackheath industrial area that had previously been used by another denomination was purchased and became the Church of the Holy Nativity as the first Eucharist in the building was held on Christmas Day in 1975 (Commin, 2017, para. 7).

In its formative years, the parish had a number of organists, namely, a Mrs Whittaker, Mr Frye (known as Abassie), Irma Engel, Marion Booysen and Gavin Isaacs, as well as church musicians, Claude Palmer, a guitarist, and Adele Anthony and Ronel Rabie, flautists. Mass was sung to the Betty Pulkingham setting, 'Mass for the King of Glory' and hymns were sung from the Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950). With the charismatic music movement at its most influential, they also made use of the Anglican Renewal Ministries Songbook (Petersen, 2017, p. 1).

The first rector of the parish, The Reverend David Daniels, was appointed in 1988. Daniels wanted to establish a formal robed Anglican choir in the parish and approached Hilton Petersen with the proposition in 1991. The Petersen family were parishioners at St John the Evangelist in Crawford at the time and was highly involved with the choir and altar-serving ministries. The family moved to their new home in Blackheath in 1988. After joining Holy Nativity in 1992, Petersen founded a formal structured choir after five months on 12 September 1992. The first

choir had forty-six excited and motivated members. Robes for the new choir were made by Stephanie Smith in the same year. Choir numbers stabilised at thirty-two members up until 1998. The choir further became affiliated with the RSCM in 1994 (Petersen, 2017, p. 1).

The choir then settled into its niche, with hymns, Anglican chant and the occasional choral anthem becoming standard practice. Ashley Petersen, son of Hilton Petersen, became an assistant organist in the parish in 1998 and was appointed parish organist in 2002. In 2010, A. Petersen started the choir tour series, which encompassed touring to one of South Africa's major cities in October each year. This included Kimberley, Grahamstown and Johannesburg. In 2011, A. Petersen officially became the Director of Music after his father's retirement (Petersen, 2017, p. 2).

#### 4.4.2 Current Music Ministry

Interviews about the parish were conducted with The Venerable Reverend Leslie Adriaanse, Rector of the parish and with Dr Ashley Petersen, the Director of Music and Organist on 21 September 2020 and 15 August 2020, respectively. Adriaanse and Petersen submitted the pre-interview online questionnaire on 18 September 2020 and 3 August 2020, respectively. All the information presented below is collated from Adriaanse (2020a, 2020b) and Petersen (2020a, 2020b).

Leslie Adriaanse started his tenure as the rector in January 2013. After his theological studies at St Paul's Seminary in Grahamstown, Adriaanse served at Christ the Redeemer, Westridge, St Joseph the Worker, Bishop Lavis, All Saints, Hopefield, Good Shepherd, Grassy Park, Holy Trinity, Paarl and Church of the Resurrection, Bonteheuwel. Adriaanse notes that the parishes that influenced his Anglican music knowledge and understanding most were Holy Trinity, Paarl, St Joseph the Worker, Bishop Lavis and Church of the Resurrection, Bonteheuwel. Even though Adriaanse had no formal music training, did not at any time belong to a choir and cannot read sheet music, he was greatly inspired and influenced by Henry King, Dr Franklin Lewis and Roy Benjamin in his musical understanding and practice in Anglican church music.

Ashley Petersen is a medical doctor, who serves in a part-time volunteer capacity as the Director of Music and Organist at Holy Nativity, having started his tenure in October 2010. In his thirty-one years of experience in church music, Petersen notes that he has been particularly influenced in his music education by Hilton Petersen, Barry Smith, Deon Irish, Jonathan Langenhoven and Richard Haigh.

The Holy Nativity Choir is unique as it has reached considerable success and status within a reasonably short existence, with the parish choir formally established in September 1992, marking its 29th anniversary in 2020. Holy Nativity Choir sings a choral setting of the mass every Sunday with a break from the morning Mass on the last Sunday of every month in order to sing Evensong. The church observes all major feastdays, even if they appear on a weekday, as well as minor feastdays and Saints' days, even if they appear on a Sunday of the year. The choir also sings the special Advent service, Easter Vigil, Ash Wednesday, Maundy Thursday and Good Friday services.

The choir is functioning with a relatively high number of singers, containing twenty-five members. Petersen notes that he invites ad-hoc singers to join the choir ranks when there might be a shortage in parts due to a larger piece of repertoire performed, the absence of a regular choir member or an increase in choir members needed for a special occasion. Analysis of the number of voices per part of the choir shows that certain voice parts, particularly altos and basses, are under-resourced in relation to others. 36 percent are highly experienced singers, 8% are qualified musicians, 56% of the membership is between the age of nineteen and sixty years of age and 36% are over the age of sixty. In order to present a summary of the specification data gathered, the following table has been compiled:

**TABLE 3: HOLY NATIVITY CHURCH CHOIR SPECIFICATIONS**

Holy Nativity Church Music Department	Choir
Sopranos	10
Altos	4
Tenors	7
Basses	4
<b>Total Number of Singers</b>	<b>25</b>
Qualified Musicians	2

Highly Experienced Singers	9
Inexperienced Singers	14
5 to 13 years	2
14 to 18 years	0
19 to 30 years	3
31 to 60 years	11
61 years and above	9

All choir members join the choir with the intention to remain for the foreseeable future. Six of the choir's founding members, Hilton Petersen, Bridget Petersen, Craig Petersen, Arthur Rabie, Vanessa Mathias and Ashley Petersen are still members of the choir. This provides a stable, working music environment for the choir, rooted in a proud tradition of pioneering through new challenges, education and development. Petersen notes that choir recruitment advertisements are regularly made through the church magazine, pewleaflet, social media and via word of mouth. Anyone is welcome to join the choir with the music director not requiring any audition of new candidates. Petersen has a welcoming demeanour to prospective choir members. "If there's a willingness, that's all you need. If you are willing, you might not even be proficient in [reading music], [and you] might not even be able to read music for that matter, but if you are willing, that already tells you that you'd be able [...]. And I think that's the important thing" (Petersen, 2020, p. 5). Petersen emphasises the importance of recruitment in the choir, especially of younger members. It has given him a great sense of security and drive to have younger members in the choir. Unfortunately, there has been very little drive from the clergy in choir recruitment.

This choir rehearses once a week for an hour and thirty minutes and concludes their preparation with a short rehearsal before the service. Choir members travel less than 5km to perform in the choir and are in full representation of the demographic of its region. Petersen notes that the

choir has quite a good ‘social compact’, with the October choir tour contributing greatly to the social life of the choir. Even though there are naturally personality clashes in the choir, the choir values one another greatly. “They joke a lot; we laugh a lot. So I think that’s a good space that we are in, in terms of our social standing” (Petersen, 2020b, p. 62).

The music department is aptly equipped in terms of facilities and resources and is comfortably staffed. Petersen functions as the organist, conductor and administrator in his position as Organist and Director of Music and manages a music staff consisting of an Assistant Organist, Stephen Furches, a choir librarian, an assistant administrator and a choir treasurer. The music ministry functions successfully with the employment of a choir committee consisting of the director of music, treasurer, secretary and various volunteer assistants. This committee plays an integral part in planning, arranging accommodation, meals, flights and performances and managing the finance, including the choir’s monthly subscription fee, for its annual October national tour.

The music department is equipped with an organ, piano, music library, music stands, choir robes and quire stalls. The parish will soon have a choir room built which will primarily be a choir rehearsal venue and double as a facility to host music lessons. The department is equipped with a well- resourced and maintained music library for which new music such as mass settings, orchestral scores and choral anthems are purchased when needed. Petersen explains that a two manual pipe organ was installed in the parish in 2017. This was a notable turning point in the musical life of the parish and choir. The addition of the organ made for a more serious sense of musicianship among choir members, who are now striving for a greater level of excellence.

The finances are strategically managed by the music director with the assistance of the choir treasurer and includes a long-term emergency savings plan. The music department is funded by congregational donations, bequeathed funds, personal private donations, saved music ministry funds, choir member subscription fees and income from sung funeral and wedding services. Petersen notes that there is no music fund represented on the general church budget. The general budget has contributed greatly to the installation of the organ and the maintenance thereof, however furthermore, the music budget is managed autonomously. If the music ministry needs more funds, a loan can be made from the general church budget, but this has to be repaid. The church has an organ fund that it will continue supporting for the larger maintenance work on the organ.

Adriaanse notes that it was both his and Petersen's wish to include more youth and trebles in the parish choir. Petersen notes that recruiting younger choir members has become a real impetus in his role and director of music. Petersen avoids having trebles in the choir that are too young. One of the major challenges Petersen experienced was to balance the social dynamic and the learning speed of the younger members of his choir and the more advanced older members. There is also the challenge of being relatable and engaging to young trebles. Petersen's medium to long term goal is to get more youth involved in the church music programme, whether for instrumental lessons or to join the choir ranks. Ultimately, he would like to establish a children's choir within the parish.

The parish adheres strictly to the church calendar and the lectionary published and distributed annually by the Anglican Church of Southern Africa Publishing Committee. The parish makes use of the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) for Evensong and An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) for Mass. The New Revised Standard Version translation of the Bible is used.

All musical selections are made by the music director with the rector respecting the selection and the music director's expertise. Petersen would describe the repertoire performed within the parish as being progressive as he draws his repertoire from fairly new composers and publications, but the selections are in no way charismatic. There is a definite trend toward the traditional repertoire.

Petersen distributes a choir schedule with the rehearsal plan and repertoire programme for the year in mid-January. This document will stipulate the hymns, service settings, canticles, anthems, responses and any other music that needs to be performed for the year. Petersen emphasises the importance of the repertoire being appropriately chosen for the ability of the choir and the style of music which they will enjoy. It is important to know the choir's strengths and weaknesses in order to be able to challenge and grow their musical ability.

Petersen regularly plans to introduce his choir to new repertoire. He explains his methodology - the choir sing ten evensongs per year, which is every last Sunday of the month except for January, when the choir is on leave and December when the choir has a huge musical load to carry. Out of those ten evensongs, three of them would either have a new anthem or canticle setting. Petersen notes that in this way, he achieves a balance of challenging the choir but also allowing them to be comfortable with familiar repertoire.

The parish makes use of the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) as their primary hymn book in conjunction with supplementary hymnal for tunes and texts for special services or occasions. Petersen notes that he inherited the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) as the hymnbook of the parish at the start of his tenure. He is satisfied with the current hymnbook in use; however, he does point out that the range of the hymn melody is rather low, which affects projection of sound and the lilt of the hymn. Petersen plays some of the tunes out of Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised (1950) in a key that is more suited to the vocal range and capabilities of choristers. He has experimented with the new edition of the Hymns Ancient and Modern (2013), but in his experience, the new edition of the book has too many new melodies with which the congregation is unfamiliar. Petersen says he find the New English Hymnal (1986) the most comprehensive and all-inclusive. It also has a gentler phasing in of new hymn tunes, which is more accessible to congregational use.

All congregants own a personal copy of the Hymns Ancient and Modern New Standard (1983) hymnbook and An Anglican Prayer Book (1989). The parish does not provide the congregation with any books in the pews. Petersen notes that the church requires congregants to own their own copies of the worship books as an encouragement to worship within their homes. Approximately 90% of the congregation own a personal set of books. Petersen notes that he will insert a new hymn into the pewleaflet if he is programming a hymn that is not in the congregant's hymnbook. Petersen has experimented every three months or so with teaching the congregation a new hymn before the start of mass. He notes that some congregants engage enthusiastically in this practice, but there are congregants that are perfectly comfortable with not engaging in the singing of hymns too.

All choir hymnbooks, psalters and other sheet music are provided to the choristers by the music department, with choir members who take ownership and care of their own allocated hymnbooks. The parish makes use of the English Cathedral system of a dedicated music pad labelled with the voice part and name of each choir member containing all the required music for the service. Music is laid out by the choir librarian for the ease of collection by choir members. Petersen acknowledges that this system requires extra labour-intensive administrative hours to maintain.

The congregation participates in singing the mass settings, hymnody, responses, psalm-singing to Anglican chant, Creed and Pater Noster in the eucharistic Mass. The Merbecke, Lees and Franklin, settings for the Pater Noster and the Shaw, Merbecke and Simper settings of the

Nicene Creed are used. The congregational mass settings of the Ordinary of the Mass are the Communion Setting by Merbecke for Lententide, the New Plainsong Mass by David Hurd or the Schubert German Mass (English translation) for Adventide, the Communion Service (Series Three) by Rutter for Eastertide, the Mass as set for Liturgy '75 by Franklin for Trinitytide and the Holy Trinity Service by Tambling, the Mass of St George by Smith, the St Lawrence Mass by Shaw, the New People's Mass by Murray and the Mass of the King of Glory by Pulkingham for the rest of the Sundays. The congregation has learnt the music of the service by “osmosis” and the standard of congregational singing in the parish is fairly solid. The selection is programmed for performance every six months from an extensive repertoire of choral settings, including a cappella, organ-accompanied and an annual orchestral Mass. Petersen comments on the drive to encourage congregational members to actively participate in the music of the liturgy. Very often congregants prefer not to participate in hymn singing, opting to enjoy a well-trained choir sing the hymn, while they listen and are spiritually moved. Petersen (2020, p. 22) says “we underestimate the importance of passive participation in worship”.

The choir performs a choral anthem or motet at every Sunday eucharistic service, during the administration of the eucharist sacraments. These anthems are always appropriate as their texts are linked to the liturgical season and biblical texts of the day. These are very often scored for four-part choir or smaller, performed unaccompanied, or accompanied by organ, and could be of any varying genre or style, early or modern music. It is very often sung in English, but the preferred alternate language of Latin could be sung on feastdays and special occasions. Petersen adds that Latin was first introduced into the congregation in 2008 at the Maundy Thursday Mass as the congregation is normally quite small. It was very well-received by the parishioners. The English translations of the Latin text of the anthem and orchestral Mass on Christmas Day are provided for the congregation so that they can fully appreciate the music. It is on occasion that the choir performs a choral anthem as an Introit to Evensong. Choral anthems at Evensong are traditionally sung before the sermon, after the Office of the service is completed. When an Evensong anthem is not sung in English, the English translation of the text is not provided to the congregation.

The parish makes use of the pointing of the Parish Psalter, Nicholson edition, for Anglican chant, which is sung at both Evensong and morning eucharistic service. Petersen notes that there was no chanting in the congregation before 1992 and the establishment of the choir. His father was accustomed to the Nicholson edition, as it was the edition used at St John's,



Crawford. He introduced the edition to the congregation when the parish choir was founded. It is the tradition of some Anglican parishes in the greater Cape Town Diocese to have the congregation sing the appointed psalm to Anglican chant - this is the practice at Holy Nativity. The parish will alternate between the choir chanting the psalm to the text in the Nicholson psalter one week and the choir and congregation chanting the psalm together to the text printed in the An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) the next week. Petersen reserves five accessible psalm tunes for the chanting of the psalm by the congregation. He notes that he has experimented with the John Scott St Paul's Cathedral edition of the psalter but prefers the Nicholson edition as the Scott edition makes use of too many triplet syllabic patterns.

The Choir has a large repertoire of canticle settings in rotation for Evensong, with some settings sung more regularly than others. These include Wood in D, C Minor and E flat (No.2), Shephard Canticles for Parish Choirs, Vaughan Williams setting for Village Choirs, Bairstow in E flat, Hampson in G, Harris in A and A minor, Darke in A minor, Brewer in D and F, Dyson in D, Stanford in B flat and C, Noble in B minor, Harris in E flat, Stainer in B flat, Walmisely in D minor, Morley Fauxbourdons, Archer Berkshire service, Aston St Andrews' Service, Ives Litchfield Service and Anglican Chant settings (Parish Psalter Sets A, B, C, D) for congregational Evensongs. The settings of the Evensong responses chanted by the choir are by Tallis, Sheppard and Gibson. These are rotated on occasion and are cantored by the Rector or by a Precentor.

It is common practice at Holy Nativity, that the Office of Evensong is concluded with the Benediction of the Sacrament. Petersen notes that this is part of the parish's catholic expression of their faith as the Eucharist is the central act of the corporate worshipping community. "The benediction cannot be seen as anything else but just that. A central act of what we are and who we are as people. So, when the benediction as being something completely Catholic, that's a problem, because the eucharist itself is catholic because of its universality" (Petersen, 2020b, p. 39).

Holy Nativity has developed liturgical practices that straddle the Anglo-Catholic and modern worship tradition of the Anglican church. In this unique blend, the parish does not particularly emphasise the instruction of the rubrics but generally follows the liturgical rites and ceremony traditions prescribed and required by An Anglican Prayer Book (1989) for eucharistic services and the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) for Evensong. These rubrics are followed strictly at all times. Liturgical formalities of services are managed by the various

ministries (layministers, servers, music ministry, etc.) independently and approved by clergy when guidance is needed. All ministries function fairly autonomously and are required to submit their contributions to the church pewleaflet on time as the parish finalises and publishes the pewleaflet on Thursday each week. According to Adriaanse, there is a shared interest in serving at a standard of excellence in the Mass, with Petersen being particularly driven to reach a standard of excellence in all ministries of the Mass. Petersen acknowledges that the liturgy and service is formed around the music of the Mass. Layministers and altar servers on duty would refer to the musical structure of the Mass as a dictating factor to their ceremonial function. According to Adriaanse, Petersen has even trained up the confirmation candidates for the confirmation service ceremony. He has a hands-on approach in his dedication to excellence. Petersen explains that there are no experimental or new liturgies such as the Taizé meditation service in practice at Holy Nativity. The newer forms of worship services have not been requested by congregants as these are not inherently part of the liturgical identity of the parish.

The parish, through the motivation and drive of Petersen, introduced the Anglo-Catholic tradition of chanting the Anglican Propers in Mass in 2008. Holy Nativity chants the Propers from 'The Gradual', Burgess Edition. Petersen notes that there was some reservation from the congregation when the chanting of the Propers was first introduced to the parish, as people associated the plainsong chant with being too 'Catholic' in nature. It is now however standard practice in the parish and congregation members have reported that they have come to appreciate the Propers in mass as it "brings a certain sense of order, it just draws everything closer, and brings everything back together again", "it brings structure and it brings a certain type of hush" into the mass (Petersen, 2020b, p. 31).

Plainsong is regularly used to intone various seasonal prayers such as the Lenten and Advent Prose, Responsory and Introits and for Ordinary time, readings and responses proper to the season at Mass. It must be noted that both the psalm sung to Anglican chant and the Propers are sung at the Sunday Eucharist, a unique arrangement only done at Holy Nativity parish. This speaks to the current liturgical and musical practices at Holy Nativity, straddling both Anglo-Catholic and current liturgical traditional. Petersen also notes that the Propers align with the lectionary calendar in the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) and not with the modern lectionary associated with An Anglican Prayer Book (1989), resulting in an incoherency of texts at times, as the Propers usually refer to texts from the Gospel of the day.

The choir performs an annual orchestral Mass on Christmas Day each year. This tradition was founded by Petersen, with great encouragement from Adriaanse, in 2012. Petersen notes that the performance of the orchestral Mass is the highlight of the church musical calendar for the choir members, clergy and congregation alike. Masses performed in the last years included Schubert in G (D167), Mozart's Missa Brevis in C (KV259), Haydn's Missa Brevis in F Hob XXII:1 and Missa Brevis Sancto Joannis De Deo (Little Organ Mass). These masses required large expenditure as it involved the employment of several ad-hoc orchestral musicians. These masses are funded using donations from the congregational, personal private donations and the general church budget.

The choir performs a requiem for the feast of All Souls each year, alternating the performance of the Fauré Requiem and the Bottligliero Requiem settings. In addition to this special service, the choir performs a service of hymns, anthems and readings in place of Evensong on Palm Sunday. The choir sings the full liturgy on Good Friday and the Ash Wednesday service. Other choral services include the annual Procession and Advent Carols as well as a Nine Lessons and Carols Service.

The choir has collaborated with other musicians, institutions and guest choirs. The choir has also performed as a guest choir at other parishes, including singing Evensong at St George's Cathedral. The choir has an annual 'Choir Tour Week' in October, a tradition established by Petersen in 2010, to travel nationally to a parish in another major city. These tours were paid for by the choir members themselves. The first choir tour was to Port Elizabeth, where they performed in St Mary's Cathedral. Petersen notes that the choir enjoys travelling to the cathedrals of the country to experience the excellent acoustics. He adds that he has made fantastic network connections with clergy and music directors from across the country. There is the plan to travel internationally in the far future, however, Petersen notes that the first challenge is to establish a younger core group of singers in the choir, between the ages of twenty and forty.

Petersen and Adriaanse explain that the parish had a charismatic worship band, comprising two female singers, a guitar player and a backing track. The worship band would perform every second Sunday of the month in a contemporary worship service. Petersen says there was a period of disgruntlement in 2004 as a group of congregants was lobbying for the worship-band ministry to be expanded to encompass a full band of instruments, however this did not come to fruition. A drumkit was purchased by the parish for this purpose and congregants were invited

to join the band, but to no avail. Petersen says this project never took off, with 2006 being a turning point for the congregation, where there was a renewed interest in, and appreciation for, traditional Anglican church music. Petersen explains that the clergy and certain members of the congregation expected a large influx of younger people in the congregation for the contemporary worship service, but this was not the case. In fact, congregants attended and participated fully in the 7am regular mass and people opted not to attend the 9am contemporary service. Those who did attend the contemporary service did not actively participate in the worship music and this was ultimately discontinued in 2019.

Petersen acknowledges that clergy see the music ministry as central to the worship experience at the parish, casting great importance on the success and smooth administration of the programme. Adriaanse highlights his appreciation of the music ministry by listening in on rehearsals on occasion in a display of support as well as to expand his own knowledge. He notes the utmost dedication and selfless commitment of Petersen and the choir to the excellence of music in the parish. Petersen adds that the choir truly enjoys the votes of appreciation from the clergy and congregation. There is no need for a weekly meeting involving all ministries for the ordinary upcoming Sunday Mass. Meetings are only convened when discussions need to be had for an upcoming special occasion or for unique feastdays. Normally, a meeting would take the form of a liturgical ceremonial and logistics rehearsal. This would be to remind the altar party of the choreography for special services around Easter and Christmas. A review and criticism of what is done in Mass is a rare occurrence. Petersen notes that he is certain that clergy would not be open any criticism. However, he insists on voicing it when the need arises.

The parish has a good social media presence on Facebook. The choir is also active in making CD recordings and promotional videos. Petersen notes that the parish also receives good and regular support from congregants from across the diocese in attending its performances, as well as from the Bishop of False Bay, who also regularly attends the choir's performances, especially the Carol services. Petersen would rank his choir at one of the flagship choirs within the False Bay Diocese.

The choir is affiliated with the RSCM Cape Town Branch and regularly attends RSCM events. Petersen also regularly attends seminars and workshops geared towards choral conducting and is currently the chairperson of the RSCM Cape Town Branch. He reports that RSCM events are poorly attended nationwide, with a marked decrease in interest in the RSCM, which has made for debates among RSCM management, begging the following questions: 1) Is the RSCM still

relevant? 2) Have parish music ministries converted to charismatic practices entirely? 3) Are the RSCM events offered meeting the needs of the parish choirs? 4) RSCM branches across the country have changed their approaches, but with what success? Petersen exemplifies by indicating that the RSCM Branch in Port Elizabeth has now moved its annual summer school course to a winter school course to better accommodate the schedules of possible attendees. However, even with this move, attendance is still less than thirty people, affecting the financial feasibility of hosting events of this nature. Petersen notes that the RSCM is currently making a sincere effort to address these challenges.

Petersen notes that he has been approached by congregants on several occasions expressing their gratitude and appreciation of the high standard of music performed in their service and how they have been spiritually moved by the experience thereof.

## Chapter 5      Data Analysis

A substantial wealth of data has been collected by the researcher for the purpose of this study in the form of online questionnaires and interviews with the clergy and their music directors. Being a study that investigates church administration and that could potentially criticise current practice within a church parish, interview participants were warm and accommodating, open to discussing any topic arising, embracing the topic of The Plight of Traditional Anglican Music in the Western Cape and sharing their opinions freely and openly. So much so, that an unprecedented 336 transcribed pages of interview data has been collected in the research of this thesis. This is a true indication that clergy and music directors have accomplished much in the past years, attributable to the heritage of Anglican music in the Western Cape, but also share concerns raised by the researcher for the sustainability of traditional Anglican music within parish churches for future generations. The research presented below reports on the South African reality of concepts defined in the Chapter Two of this dissertation.

### 5.1 Liturgy

Brasler notes that programming of modern settings of the canticles at Evensong does prove to be changing as the Office of Evensong is still said out of the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954). The modern words of the canticles do not sit comfortably within the liturgical language of the service. Modern commissions typically set music to modern translations of the text, contributing to the challenges experienced with modernising the musical settings of Evensong.

There is also a strong move towards gender-neutral worship language and the use of spoken English. Brasler prefers to choose texts that suit the language of the prayer-book being used. He also mentions that language use in the liturgy has been discussed with the choir on more than one occasion and there seems to be no strong objection towards the old English texts. There is also a move towards using inclusive language at Mass. Texts in the Nicene creed have been edited at the cathedral morning Mass to emphasise the unity of the congregation as a community. Instead of “ ‘I’ believe in God the Father”, the church uses “ ‘We’ believe in God the Father”. Petersen strongly disagrees with this practice, arguing that “you cannot profess something on behalf of someone else” (Petersen, 2020b, p. 50).

In Weeder's reflection on his tenure at St Michael's, Observatory, he mentions his uncomfortableness with the language of the King James Version of the Bible. He acknowledges its beautiful poetic use of the English language but sees its language usage as offensive to woman. Weeder alludes to how women might feel uncomfortable – first, they are excluded from the inclusivity in the Biblical texts read, and then, as an extension, they are excluded from serving in the sanctuary at St Michael's too. Lowes acknowledges that some might find offence in the language usage at St Michael's.

Irish comments on the movement to use gender-neutral language within mass. In the languages of English and German, there is a structure [where] the masculine pronoun is occasionally a neutral pronoun. 'Man' does not mean 'a male person' in this case. When the text says, 'man that is born of a woman', it is not referring only to a male person that is born of a woman, but is referring to all humankind. The congregation needs to be literate to understand the contextual use of the language. "You have to be totally illiterate, to think that when a choir sings 'man that is born of a woman', they're talking only about men. You need to be literate" (Irish, 2020b, p. 44). Irish says that historical texts must not be changed in language usage as it ruins the poetry in the process, especially if the change is done to satisfy illiterates.

## **5.2 Anglican Church Music**

Irish notes that in defining Anglican church music, one must consider both pre- and post-reformation history of the Anglican church. According to Irish, the Anglican church is a branch off from the Roman Catholic faith. Therefore, the heritage, liturgical and musical traditions feed into the musical style and practices of Anglican music. Irish refers to the great Anglican reformers of Thomas Cranmer, the creator of the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954), and King Henry VIII, the King that broke with Rome, establishing the English Church. He highlights that it is erroneous to assume that these great reformers completely broke with the traditions of Rome. In fact, the funeral mass of Henry VIII was traditionally Catholic, with the requiem at St George's Chapel, Windsor Castle, the body carried in a candlelit procession and a solemn Mass of requiem said in Latin by Archbishop Cranmer, with the Bishop of Winchester as Deacon. This highlights the retention of catholic traditions of the early English Church, as "Henry's break with Rome was purely political. It had nothing to do with religion at all and so his creation of this English Church under himself was still very much a catholic church. Nothing changed" (Irish, 2020b, p. 31).

According to Irish, Anglican traditional music can generally be summed up as largely choral music, based on biblical texts with sound theology in the poetic use of texts and the unique use of the organ within the liturgy. According to Petersen, one thing that sets Anglican music apart from other denominations would be Anglican chant. Irish makes an interesting observation on the Protestant influence on Anglican church music. He exemplifies that Mendelssohn's choral anthem 'Hear my Prayer' is considered by many to be a quintessential Anglican Evensong anthem, however, the piece was composed with a German Lutheran Church setting in mind. Petersen states that some would consider Byrd a typical Anglican composer, even though he was a Roman Catholic. "The Anglican Church has appropriated to itself music which was sympathetic to its own character, its own ethos" (Irish, 2020b, p. 19).

### **5.3 History of Anglican Church Music and Liturgy in South Africa**

Irish sheds light on the excellence of Thomas Cranmer in his design of the Book of Common Prayer. His skill was most apparent within the prevailing conditions of the sixteenth century. He designed a liturgy and book that were intended for use in royal courts and established cathedrals as well as in small village parishes. When understanding the context in which the book was conceived, the prayer book lends itself to be malleable in all parish circumstances.

Weeder explains that from the very beginning of his ministry, he was greatly influenced by The Reverend Bob De Maar's stance and teaching on liturgical matters, which was to be "committed to honouring the spirit of the rubric of the prayer book [...], yet also alert to how emerging culture requires contextual expression suited to the need and urgencies of our time" (Weeder, 2020a, p. 8). Weeder notes that the prayer book encompasses the Anglican identity based on tradition, reason and scripture. Weeder (2020a, p. 9) continues, "The Book of Common Prayer is the foundation reference in our sensitivity to liturgy and context. In the early years of the presence of the Anglican Church on African soil, in our instance - the Republic of South Africa - the Church was cognisant of its association with the British Empire. The law-suits of the early, founding years in the colony helped the Church to unclutter itself from being the church of the establishment."

Adriaanse refers to the Gray-Colenso controversy. He acknowledges that Gray, with his wife Sophy, played a pivotal part in the establishment of the Anglican Church in South Africa, but comments that his inherent loyalties were always to the Archbishop of Canterbury and to the British Crown. Adriaanse resolves that Colenso is redeemed because of his ecclesiastic



contribution to the Anglican Church in Southern Africa, in creating an inclusive church for the Zulu people at the time. In hindsight, the root of the Gray-Colenso controversy was based on a personality clash and ideological differences.

Lowes reflects on his time as Archdeacon in the Diocese of Pretoria. High-church practices were frowned upon by the Bishop of Pretoria at the time and parishes were strongly discouraged from using the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) for a period of fifteen years. The culture of high churchmanship was politicised and seen as white elitism. Lowes notes that in his career as priest, he has worked in traditional Anglo-Catholic churches, charismatic churches and as chaplain to schools. He adds that he feels ‘hugely privileged’ to have the opportunity to serve as rector at St Michael’s.

Weeder reflects on his time as a deacon when he was exposed consciously to the Anglo-Catholic tradition of music and worship. This was soon to be aborted in 1975 and onward, when the charismatic movement swept across the Anglican diocese leading to the abandonment of the prayer book. Only the privileged parishes that carried some authority could hold their ground to such revolutionary changes in the church, such as the parish of St Michael’s, Observatory.

According to Weeder (2020b, p. 3), “there is a coherency about the Anglican prayer book and the musicality of it”, adding that Evensong must not be seen as only an Anglo-European celebration but as a service that has been inspired by the liturgy of North Africa and traditions such as the lighting of candles that stem from the Orthodox faith. With the international liturgical legitimacy of the Anglo-Catholic heritage, Weeder expresses his gratitude to parishes like St Luke’s, Salt River, and St Michael’s, Observatory, for upholding the Anglo-Catholic liturgical practices.

Weeder talks of the theatrical and moving nature of celebrating Mass according to the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) during his tenure at St Michael’s, Observatory. Nothing prepares one for the formality and strict structure of the occasion. The intense choreography creates a heightened sense of reverence and saying mass *Ad Orientum* and having one’s voice resonate in the Apse, together with the incense and beautiful music, makes for a truly moving experience.

Lowes and Weeder talk of the conservative nature in which rural and Xhosa-speaking parishes still have the uninterrupted tradition of chanting the entire mass. Weeder highlights the

congregations of St Columba, Gugulethu, St Paul's, Zolani and St Francis, Zwelethemba, in his experience of African Anglican liturgical music, noting that the charismatic movement did not impact Xhosa-speaking churches. The Xhosa-speaking Anglican church also has a strong liturgical tradition that takes influence from the Order of Ethiopia.

Irish makes reference to the ever-evolving liturgy of the Church of Southern Africa. He notes that the Western Catholic Church has had four liturgies in its two-thousand-year history, yet the Anglican churches in Southern Africa have had numerous new liturgies, including the 1968 Liturgy for Africa, 1975 Liturgy and new alternative liturgies currently in use. Reinventing the liturgy to solve the current problems within society and the church is futile, because that change is rooted in that moment in time and will be entirely out of fashion in fifteen years' time. Churchgoers cannot appreciate the gravitas of the liturgy if it is changed often. The heritage of internalising and memorising texts with generations before one has prayed is lost. When saying the liturgical texts, "they should be part of your fabricated being. You should be able to breathe the liturgy. You should be able to sigh the liturgy. You should not have to think about the liturgy and you should never have to think what's the next word - ever" (Irish, 2020b, p. 43). Other than change the liturgy to suit the present times, "why not rather inculcate people with the tradition that has stood the test of time and which has artistic integrity and merits as there is no reason why that integrity and merit does not continue forward?" (Irish, 2020b, p. 46). Irish notes that one's personal taste as to what is liked within the liturgy and church music is entirely based on that with which one is familiar and comfortable.

Petersen acknowledges that the Anglican liturgy, music tradition and churchmanship is extremely varied, which makes the Anglican denomination so unique. He remarks that if you compare liturgical traditions of Anglican churches in a 10-kilometre radius, you will have a large variety of traditions displayed, all appropriate within its own setting.

## **5.4 Catholic and Anglican Ecumenical Relations**

When asked about the Anglican ecumenical relation with the New Apostolic Church, Brasler (2020b) states that "there are probably a lot of things an Anglican church could learn from New Apostolic programs in terms of their organisation. Their reach and their sort of bringing everybody in the church into the program which I think doesn't easily happen in any Anglican church really that you have that kind of involvement." Weeder (2020b, p. 40) concurs with this

sentiment adding, “I don’t agree a lot with the theology of the new apostolic church, but hell they’ve got a model of music development.”

There have been New Apostolic Church members that have performed as part of the cathedral music ministry in the past. Brasler reports that this has been met with great discouragement to those members from New Apostolic Church authorities. He theorises that the fact that Anglican churches pay their musicians might be an incentive for New Apostolic musicians to be tempted to perform in Anglican churches. It could also be the root of the concern of New Apostolic Church authorities.

Brasler commented on Anglican ecumenical relations with the Catholic Church from a musical perspective. He notes that there have been a number of Catholic choir members join the cathedral choir, showing great interest in the music ministry of the cathedral. There is great value in what the cathedral has to offer its musicians through high standards of music-making, numerous opportunities to perform and an educational environment for upcoming church musicians. Furthermore, in his capacity as the organ lecturer at UCT South African College of Music, he adds that there are three organ students at the university, all of them Catholic, of which two play the organ in Anglican churches and Catholic churches. This speaks to the freedom of the ecumenical relation as well as the serious lack of competent organists within the Anglican Church.

Petersen compares the administration and social media presence of the Anglican Dioceses of the Cape Town region and the Catholic Diocese of Cape Town. He laments the lack of structure surrounding the social media presence of the Anglican Diocese. He resolves that the Anglican Church of Southern Africa has the funds to run a television channel, much like the New Apostolic Church’s NAC TV. This would be an opportunity for the Anglican Church to evangelise, grow its membership, and broadcast Anglican music of excellent quality while unifying its church on a national scale.

## **5.5 Styles of Worship**

All churches studied offer a number of opportunities for lay members to participate in a ministry of the church. The cathedral, St Michael’s and Holy Nativity offer the following ministries: Altar Servers, Layministers, Choir, Sidespersons, Parish Council, Church Wardens, Sacristans and Flower Arrangers with Holy Nativity hosting an Anglican Women’s Fellowship, ‘Friends’

as community charity group, a Senior Citizens' Group and the cathedral hosting Bell Ringers. There is a consensus from the rectors that the youth are attracted to become involved in the Altar Servers ministry. Besides the youth finding their niche in formation classes such as confirmation and junior church classes, Weeder (2020b, p. 7) attributes the lack of youth involvement in the church to "the quality of our worship is not necessarily family friendly. It might be appealing to the parents, but not necessarily the children". Irish promotes the practice of taking young children to mass. It makes them comfortable with the environment and develops an appreciation for the liturgy. Weeder theorises that youth might be drawn to be an altar server because the cathedral's music programme contains repertoire that is outside their comfort zone in terms of what is expected of their voice. Youth are more 'pop-music and relaxed-music orientated' and find it challenging to bring themselves to sing the music practised in church. I posed another possible reason: that the commitment required of the altar servers is substantially less than that which is required from a chorister. Weeder concurred with this possibility.

Adriaanse theorises that youth might be drawn to be an altar server due to the rank and promotion system inherent to the altar servers' ministry. Children can join as a member at a very young age, as young as four years old, by becoming a boat child and then in time, be promoted to become an acolyte, crucifer, thurifer and master of ceremonies. This system motivates children to remain a server – there is even a possibility of being awarded a medal if they are a member of the Guild of the Servers of the Sanctuary, a diocesan guild.

Lowes explains that St Michael's does not have a thriving and substantial youth group ministry as the immediate area of Observatory has changed substantially over time and there are very few young families that stay close to the church. Most congregants travel long distances to attend Mass at St Michael's because of diverse reasons, but most especially because they are spiritually moved by the beauty of the liturgy and the music. Therefore, the average age of the congregations could be sixty and above. Lowes notes that not all youth are moved by the charismatic music trend. By effective marketing of the unique brand of Anglican worship at St Michael's, he hopes that what St Michael's parishioners hold so dear, would be spiritually invigorating to the youth. Social media platforms such as Facebook and YouTube have proved highly successful in this mission, especially in the time of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Some international sources have reflected on a movement of younger people drawn to conservative Anglo-Catholic worship. Brasler acknowledges that the trend might be based on

the younger parishioners feeling a lack of substance in the liturgy, or they might be looking for a liturgy that is less interactive and creates a reflective environment. The Office of Evensong is one such environment. Brasler notes that he has not seen a notable influx of young people drawn to the cathedral's Evensong service.

Weeder acknowledges that there is no strong focus on liturgical education within the cathedral's confirmation class sources and Sunday School. The education is very general and encompasses more bible studies. According to Weeder, students who attend the confirmation class come from a very basic formation of churchmanship. The first year is therefore geared to introduce them to the rhythm of worship. This is one of the reasons Weeder introduced the Anglo-Catholic tradition of chanting the Nicene Creed at the 9:30am Sunday morning Mass, to introduce the youth to a wholistic church experience. He encourages young families to seat their children towards the front of the cathedral nave to see the Anglican liturgy in practice as the cathedral offers a lot of colour in their worship vestments, ornate rites and ceremonies and excellent choral and organ music that captures the imagination of a young child.

All conductors' interviews describe the music performed by their choirs as mostly traditional Anglican choral music. Brasler debates as to whether worship band charismatic music should be considered progressive as the repertoire performed by these bands are worship songs composed thirty to forty years ago. In essence, worship band music has also aged.

Brasler, Irish, Petersen and Lowes agree that there is merit, practicality and a sense of heritage in issuing congregants with a copy of a full hymnal for services and that the use of leaflets with hymns printed should be reserved for the rare occasion. Families should be given the opportunity to own hymnals and prayer books as these become treasured family inheritances in time. Brasler notes that providing congregants with printed music-editions of the hymnbooks is a novelty but does merit much as there are not enough musically literate people for it to make a perceptible difference. Petersen theorises that this might be a good opportunity to expose laypeople to sheet music and by exposure and integration, they might become familiar with the workings of sheet music, perhaps leading to more laypeople feeling comfortable enough to join the choir.

Introducing the congregation to new hymns is done by the choir leading new hymns or lesser known hymn tunes. Brasler comments that he prefers not to teach hymns to the congregation before the mass as is the practice in some churches, but emphasises that congregations need to

be exposed to new hymn tunes and challenged to learn them, else the core set of comfortable hymn tunes will reduce to a small number over time.

There has been a movement in some Anglican parishes in the greater dioceses of Cape Town, to make use of a projector screen instead of hymnbooks. Irish objects to this practice, saying that it makes for a psychological difference for the congregant. The notion that the church-goer engages in corporate worship but is himself engaged in the text and act of worship through the use of the liturgical texts of the mass and the hymnbook provided, means their own experience is performing a liturgical function. The idea of singing from a screen has the congregation participating in a performance in a sing-along setting, removed from the immediate experience of engaging with their own hymnbook. Petersen also objects to this practice as churches should encourage congregants to worship within their homes too, and therefore having physical book copies of the liturgy of the church is essential.

Other than the Cathedral's Morning Choir, the Evensong and Chamber Choirs hardly ever make use of a descant soprano line in the last verse of hymns. Brasler prefers to reserve them for special occasions and strategically programmes them when they will be most effective, particularly because they depend on a strong soprano line. Irish notes that is also not common practice for St Michael's Choir to sing descants. It is reserved for the very rare occasion. Petersen is hugely enthusiastic about the singing of descants. Holy Nativity makes use of approximately five descant books, with the Little Book of Descants by Archer being Petersen's preference. Petersen notes however that descant-singing is not standard practice for his choir but is reserved for special occasions. Approximately one descant is sung in the eucharistic Mass every six weeks and one every third Evensong.

Brasler speculates that South African Anglican choirs who sing traditional liturgical music find themselves in a somewhat restricted position in terms of further developing choir repertoire. He explains that the cathedral tends to operate in a Eurocentric Anglican environment, where one tends to refer to music that comes from the English tradition and did not develop to repertoire published post-1960. He further theorises that traditional Anglican church music has become too complicated and even unsingable for South African choirs because of technical requirements, and the number of singers required.

Brasler reflects on the juxtaposition of African-worship music and English music. Early missionaries Africanised church music by translating music texts into the vernacular. It further

developed with the addition of rhythmic percussive accompaniments and African-style singing inflections and timbre. This is now considered to be the African traditional form for a larger population of the Anglican Church in South Africa. Notably, Anglican chant still seems to be the only form used both in isiXhosa and English-speaking churches. Most Xhosa-singing Anglican choirs only read tonic solfa. Perhaps this is part of the reason that other Anglican repertoire is inaccessible to them. Similarly, there are few Anglican church choirs where there is a complete comfortable overlap from one extreme of a Western choral sound to an African choral sound. Most university choirs are flexible in singing traditional African and Western repertoire because of the synthesis of people from different backgrounds, who can bring those different traditions into a choir and express them authentically within the same organisation. There is a certain level of musical education that facilitates this. Brasler certainly encourages the incarnation of African worship music with traditional Anglican music but advises against the trend of performing American charismatic worship songs in the liturgy, as is the trend in some parishes, as this is not inherent in the South African culture. An initial solution, in practice at diocesan services at the cathedral, is to invite a guest choir who specialises in African worship music. The guest choir and cathedral choir then alternate in performing in the church service. This upholds the excellence of each style of music. A long-term solution might be to employ a conductor trained in the African worship repertoire to teach and conduct a cathedral choir or set up a fourth cathedral choir dedicated to African repertoire. In the years post-1994, there was an assumption that a middle ground between African church repertoire and traditional English repertoire would emerge, but there have been no such developments. Brasler emphasises the importance of bringing people together by the overlapping of musical style.

There is no aversion by any of the clergy or musical directors interviewed to the singing of Latin text within the mass, as long as it is not regularly and excessively practised. It is appreciated when familiar Latin texts are performed and if the congregation is unfamiliar with the text, the translation is announced within the service or printed in the pewleaflet. Brasler notes that all orchestral masses are performed in Latin and are received by the congregation with great appreciation. Lowes acknowledges that Latin has a place within the church because of its tremendous foundational significance in the liturgy, and the history and life of the church. However, excessive use of Latin might hinder the spiritual experience of the average congregant.



Brasler sheds light on the exorbitant cost of new repertoire and the temptation of some music directors to make extensive use of photocopies and transgressing copyright laws. This further encourages the use of resources in the cathedral music library and restricts the purchase of new repertoire.

All music directors interviewed, acknowledge that there is a shortage of well-trained experienced and competent organists in Cape Town. Brasler adds that most competent organists are committed to performing in churches, making the pool of available employable organists very small.

Brasler explains that part of the solution would be that all parishes are proactive in identifying someone within their community to be trained to become the next church organist. The challenge with this is a question of access to facilities to rehearse and offer organ lessons. It seems that church authorities not trusting enough of people to grant them access to the church precinct as it compromises property security. These challenges can demotivate any scholar from taking up the opportunity of learning to play the organ.

As the organ lecturer at UCT, Brasler theorises that ideally organists should be trained up at school level. Generally, students take up organ as an instrument at tertiary level, with many students taking it up as a second or third instrument - university regulations have made this more difficult in recent years. Taking up the organ as an adult is noble, but the limitation of practice time means that organists never reach an adequate level of performance.

Petersen acknowledges that it is a ‘massive challenge’ to find competent organists who are capable of playing all the required repertoire of the Anglican music tradition. He resolves that organ scholarships should be a budgeted item of the diocese and fund the education of at least three organ scholars, annually. He further notes that donations are collected for clergy funding, regularly. Collections should be made on a diocesan level to fund music education in the church on the premise that once the student’s studies are complete, they plough back into the diocese through their music service.

## **5.6 Role of the Music Director in Anglican Church Music**

The following section reports on the challenges experienced by the interview candidates in their roles as musicians and conductors and their personal professional development.



All music directors interviewed agree with the literature evidence that an all-round choral conductor should be proficient in a keyboard instrument, choral training, and singing and conducting technique. Petersen acknowledges that it is a very good ‘fail-safe’ principle to be proficient at all the skills required of the choral conductor, however, the likelihood of finding a conductor with all these traits is highly unlikely. He theorises that the compromised quality of Anglican music could indeed be attributed to under-skilled music directors. Irish notes that it is invaluable for the conductor to be proficient at the keyboard, especially in rehearsal circumstances to guide the choir through a cappella works with the ability to make corrections instantly and assist with pitching. In the learning process, the conductor can highlight leads from the keyboard, particularly with music which has difficult interval jumps. When the piece is accompanied, the conductor can play the accompaniment in the rehearsal as this is occasionally in opposition to the choir part. All three music directors are primarily proficient at the organ.

Brasler and Irish have received formal training in conducting technique. None of the music directors have received formal training in choir rehearsal methodology and singing technique. Rehearsal methodology and singing technique have been learnt by all three musicians through their own singing in, and rehearsal of, choirs. Irish notes that after the primary importance of being able to play a keyboard instrument, of secondary importance is the conductor’s ability as a singer or trained vocalist. He notes that the best training for a conductor is to have sung in a choir as a child and student as that is where the foundation of choral rehearsal methodology is learnt. Brasler acknowledges that proper training in singing would enhance a conductor’s capability. He also points out that the likelihood of a conductor being equally proficient in all three aspects are very rare and that one aspect will always be the stronger- and dominant skill. Brasler explains that it has long been a cathedral tradition, in the 1970’s, before Barry Smith’s tenure and at the beginning of his time at the cathedral, that the music director would not conduct the choir but would lead the choir from the organ loft while at the organ. A choir member would then beat time from his backrow position within the stalls. Irish notes that he conducted the choir from the organ in the traditional English parish style for many years.

Furthermore, Brasler notes that there are challenges at the cathedral with regard to the ability of some individuals to both play the keyboard and conduct. He explains that the cathedral assistant conductor is proficient at conducting but requires a rehearsal accompanist and the assistant organist is proficient at the keyboard but is not entirely comfortable with rehearsing

and conducting a choir. This creates logistical challenges in circumstances when members of the cathedral music staff are not available.

All the music directors interviewed make choir music available to choristers in advance for them to study at home, but Brasler adds that choir members have an expectation to learn music within the choir rehearsal. Petersen generally makes the music available to the choir one week in advance, sometimes providing the choir with a YouTube clip or piano sound-clip highlighting their voice part to facilitate the music-learning process as the vast majority of his choir are not musically literate. Petersen acknowledges that there have been instances where an anthem had not been learnt by the choir within the time stipulated and an alternate anthem had to be substituted. Understandably, he is not very happy when these circumstances arise.

Brasler acknowledges that traditionally Anglican music directors are primarily organists who manage and conduct the choir, therefore conducting technique is not always perfect, yet suffices to serve its purpose when conducting a choir, accompanied by organ. However, he does highlight the challenge of working with professional musicians within an orchestral mass setting, where conducting technique is paramount as it communicates subtleties and needs to structure music that has not been rehearsed at length.

All the music directors interviewed are influenced in some way by national and international church music trends. Brasler notes that he has watched services from Washington National Cathedral, St Martin in the Fields, London, and Trinity College, Cambridge, noting quality and standard of performance, repertoire choice, liturgical practices and conducting technique. Irish enthusiastically follows international parishes on Facebook and YouTube that are similar to St Michael's, taking note of their liturgical music performed. He notes that there are a number of interesting and informative social-media groups that focus on ritual and liturgy. Irish believes that it is part of his core function as a music director, to keep abreast. Petersen notes that there are a number of wonderful churches to follow on social media, including St Clement's, Philadelphia and Washington National Cathedral. However, "whilst there are very good parishes and cathedrals being showcased, there's also a lot of bad things happening. Lockdown has shown us [...] the way services are cut, what is cut out of services. What is happening out there is terrible and the saddest part of it all is those churches are livestreamed!" (Petersen, 2020b, p. 55).

The music directors were asked from whom they obtain music advice, if any. Brasler has regular engagements with Dr Barry Smith, as he served in the same capacity as Cathedral Music Director for a substantial and transformative tenure. He had many conversations with the late Eric Spencer, a retired UK organist and choir director, who served at St Mary's Cathedral, Port Elizabeth, and successfully dealt with cathedral music-ministry challenges in a South African- and UK context. Spencer worked extensively with treble choristers and was well-versed in a great heritage of traditional English music. Irish describes the Anglo-Catholic traditions of St Michael's as 'maverick' within the South African context. Therefore, Irish has found himself in a collegiate advisory capacity with music directors like Ashley Petersen and Peter Kimberley. He notes that his music programme published on St Michael's website serves as inspiration to other conductors.

Brasler says he has also served in an advisory capacity to many students starting out in a church-music ministry.

The following section reports on the challenges experienced by the interview candidates in their roles as leader and mediator. It will also discuss their rehearsal methodology.

Regular attendance at choir rehearsals and performance is paramount to the success of the ensemble. Irish and Brasler indicate that a hard and fast attendance policy is not in place but there is an expectation that choir members provide them with the courtesy of planning their schedules ahead and notifying them timeously if they are unable to make a commitment. Brasler also acknowledges that the more able musicians in the choir are involved in multiple choirs and they tend to lead very busy rehearsal lives. Choir members generally attend rehearsals but lead very busy professional and family lives, which makes it very difficult to be at all choir rehearsals and performances. He has considered the option of scaling back the amount of performances by performing every alternate week and having fewer rehearsals, but foresees this making the situation worse.

According to Irish, a degree of flexibility regarding the rehearsal-attendance policy is essential. He explains that he runs a choir with very competent musicians who are all busy in their own right. He values the amount of time members sacrifice for the church in lieu of spare time that often conflicts with quite pressing demands from their own work environments and family lives. There must be an understanding of the unpredictability of the schedules of choir members. Irish notes that the only way to mitigate the issue is to have a big enough body of singers so that

losing singers does not jeopardise the rehearsal or performance, or to have a list of adhoc deputy singers you can call on to stand in for a regular choir member.

Petersen explains that he had enforced a choir-attendance policy stipulating that in order to sing on the performance day, choir members must have attended the previous rehearsal. He admits that this policy had its flaws, because it was not worth compromising the worship experience due to a lack of choir members. Currently, attendance is monitored through reasonable mutual understanding between chorister and director. Petersen notes that it is near impossible to have a hard attendance policy when considering work- and family commitments.

In retrospect, Brasler says that he avoids conflict situations within the choir by minimising the level of detail of people's personal lives of which he is aware. Also, as a professional musician, one works with many people that makes it near impossible to take a personal interest in everyone's lives. The choir tends to get on with the pastoral side internally and the music director can just proceed with the music.

Some choral directors see it as valuable to explain to the choir why they have chosen a particular piece of repertoire and its liturgical and historical significance. Brasler categorises this as a rehearsal methodology of which he seldom makes use.

All music directors interviewed do not make use of choir warm-ups. There is simply no time within the limited rehearsal time to do warm-ups and teach vocal technique. Anglican choir rehearsals seem to be a pressured environment where a substantial amount of repertoire needs to be covered in a short time. All three music directors have a strategic order in which they rehearse pieces of repertoire - some start with pieces within an easier tessitura such as the hymns, moving onto the psalm to encourage unified ensemble singing and then onto anthems and larger settings. Brasler explains that choir warm-ups are very valuable but are more practical for choirs who rehearse over a period of many weeks and only perform quarterly.

Brasler acknowledges that there is a distinct need for choirs to be taught vocal technique, but proposes that it might need to be done fifteen minutes before the rehearsal and hosted by a choir member who is studied in the subject or by a professional vocal coach. Furthermore, he welcomes the idea of hosting vocal lessons for cathedral choristers at their own expense with a vocal coach before and after choir rehearsals but doubts its feasibility due to financial circumstances of the members. He defuses the proposal of inviting a professional vocal trainer to work with the choir for two sessions, explaining that these courses leave the choristers

frustrated as they receive tips but do not have the vocal trainer present in the coming weeks to continue the process, yielding no lasting result.

Irish notes that it is very difficult to formulate a coherent rehearsal plan considering the schedules of all choir members. Some choristers arrive late due to other rehearsals and work responsibilities and others need to leave at a certain time for family commitments. Essentially, it hinges on prioritising the rehearsal time for certain pieces of repertoire, based on when they need to be performed and the level of difficulty or unfamiliarity to the choir. Irish adds that one needs to learn to accept a standard which is perhaps not exactly what one would like but it is the best that can be achieved, under the circumstances. It is more important that the scheduled work is performed rather than cancelled because one does not achieve the desired quality. Quality of a piece of repertoire in a church-parish environment is very often achieved when a large work is performed again after a long while. Choir members seem to recall the work and the conductor is able to polish it from an established standard. Petersen concurs with this stance, adding that the music director must trust that the choir will give their best effort at the performance. Irish notes that a church conductor must accept that achieving recording quality performances is a rarity, but through hard work and perseverance, “you’ll get something that is just absolutely fabulous and you almost surprise yourself at how wonderful it’s turned out” (Irish, 2020b, p. 12).

Petersen explains that he generally starts rehearsals with the Choristers’ Prayer, followed by the note-bashing of the appointed psalm for the upcoming service. The anthem is then rehearsed. Petersen endeavours to make the rehearsal an educational environment. He would often do some light research on a piece of music to provide a contextual background for the choir. This in itself assists the choir in their musical interpretation of the work. An effort is also made to keep rehearsals fun and light-hearted. Petersen notes that it can become a serious environment very quickly. He further notes that rehearsal times could be extended at Easter and Christmas, but a conscious effort is made to keep rehearsals balanced in work and social, jovial and short, for most of the year.

The following section will report on the role of the interview candidate as a leader as he ministers through music, displays leadership and fulfils his role as administrator.

Weeder truly admires Irish’s dedication and passion in his role as music director at St Michael’s, Observatory. He remembers Irish’s many hours of rehearsal at the organ and the long choir

rehearsals. He is grateful for the strong learning curve he had to endure in his tenure at St Michael's. He reflects on his relationship and friendship with Irish during his time at the parish, noting that there were disagreements and altercations, but there was always an immense respect for one another.

Irish notes that St Michael's Choir is performance-orientated which thus sets the tone in rehearsals through the professionalism of the music directors, and his expectation of his singers' reciprocation thereof. He notes that the conductor should have a different approach when working with children, real amateurs and community choirs, where the element of fun is essential. Furthermore, the choir must be committed and dedicated and have a sense of discipline.

Petersen notes the importance of being the motivational speaker to your choir when it is required. It is important to connect with people within the choir. These skills are paramount, as the conductor could have the purest intentions, with the nicest manner in which statements are posed to the choir, and still offend individuals if the choir does not have a connection with the conductor. It is important to understand the psychology of the choir. "Sometimes you can say something today and it'll be wonderfully received. You say it next week and there's a complete opposite affect and often in the very same people" (Petersen, 2020b, p. 2). Petersen emphasises the importance of being socially connected to the choir, as the music director can soon forget, with all the pressures the job entails, that he is working with people. Furthermore, he advises that if these qualities do not come naturally to the music director, a special effort must be made to learn these skills to have better working relationships with choristers. Music directors should get to know choristers outside the rehearsal and performance environment, to understand their thinking and background, even if this means making a special effort to engage with them socially outside of the church environment.

Brasler makes use of the Anglican Church of Southern Africa's annual lectionary as an authority when planning the cathedral annual programme and schedule. He notes that he does not make use of the lectionary provided in the South African Book of Common Prayer (1954) as it makes use of older forms of the church calendar. The cathedral tends to celebrate the Sunday of the year and not prioritise minor feast days in the liturgical calendar, however, minor feast days do occasionally influence repertoire choice. Major feast days are always observed at the cathedral.

Brasler confirms that attendance does not fluctuate due to the liturgical season but fluctuates due to outside commitments. He continues by saying that attendance over the Easter and Christmas Holidays are expected to an extent as it is the high season of the church. He encourages choir members to vacation with their families at other times of the year.

Petersen and Irish provide their choir members with a comprehensive rehearsal schedule for a year and six months, respectively, detailing the choir rehearsals, Sundays on which the choir is not needed, performances and upcoming repertoire. Lowes notes that the process of drawing up a choir schedule and repertoire programme is entirely the responsibility of the music director. Brasler explains that with the absence of a cathedral Precentor, the drawing up of a choir schedule becomes challenging. Currently, with no published schedule, Brasler assumes choir members have learnt the rhythm of the cathedral calendar, and by using the lectionary, can establish themselves when the choir would be required to perform. It also restricts the repertoire selection, as choir members could excuse themselves from a Sunday performance, meaning the planned repertoire would need to change accordingly. Brasler also finds the printing of a schedule might be too dictatorial in a volunteer choir. He prefers facilitating and enabling performances rather than dictating. With a large and active music department comprising of three choirs, the role of the Precentor would be to oversee the music-ministry planning. Weeder indicates that he would like to see a return of a comprehensive music schedule, printed annually in a music booklet, which has not transpired in recent years. This schedule should embody the vision of transformation and diversity of the cathedral.

Brasler continues by explaining that the cathedral circumstances also make it challenging when attempting to schedule Sundays when the choir is not needed. Cathedral clergy would ideally like Evensong to be sung every Sunday of the year. This places tremendous demands on the cathedral choir. Traditionally the cathedral choir was forced to take a Sunday off when it corresponded with the school holidays, as the treble line would take leave at that time. January would seem to be the ideal time for the cathedral choirs to take leave. Unfortunately, with Cape Town being a popular tourist destination and the cathedral one of Cape Town iconic landmarks, clergy have indicated that they would like the choir to return earlier in January to provide music for services with tourist congregations. It has been the practice at the cathedral, like in English cathedrals, to invite guest choirs to sing Evensong in January. Both Weeder and Brasler report that the quality of the available local choirs is not of cathedral standard as the choirs of high quality are also unavailable when they are enjoying their January leave. Tourists and visitors to



the cathedral then associate the possible substandard performances of guest choirs with the cathedral music ministry which does not bode well for the image the cathedral is trying to project.

The cathedral music ministry currently does not have a five-year growth plan, or long-term plan or goal in place. Brasler does not seem to have one in mind and a prospective vision is not shared and discussed with cathedral administration as a common goal. With the challenge of the absence of a functioning treble-line, it was the intention to get an outside mediator and advisor in the form of a guest Precentor from King's College, Cambridge, who visited the Cathedral early 2020, to assist the music director and clergy to develop a long-term plan to reinstate the cathedral treble line and improve the music ministry in general. This would have been an ideal opportunity for open discussion as the guest would have been highly qualified in the field and trusted by both clergy and music staff. Unfortunately, this guest's visitation was stifled by the COVID-19 lockdown.

## **5.7 Relation to Clergy**

Lowes emphasises the importance of smooth leadership transition. It is important that the rector enters the role gently and understands and embraces the traditions of the parish he is entering. Changes should be made when it is absolutely necessary and made slowly, with the utmost sensitivity and consideration. Lowes (2020, p. 11) adds "when I used to train young priests I used to say if you have to tell everybody that you're the rector all the time, you're not, okay. Just be the rector. You don't go telling people "I'm the rector", then you're not the rector!"

Weeder reflects regrettably in retrospect on some circumstantial decisions that were made at the start of his tenure as Dean of the Cathedral - decisions that have greatly affected all aspects of ministry. Weeder notes affectionately that there is no handbook to becoming the Dean of a cathedral.

Brasler explains he is meant to report to the cathedral Precentor as his immediate superior for a weekly planning meeting. Unfortunately, this post has been vacant at the cathedral for a number of years with Brasler having a Precentor as his immediate superior for the first year of his tenure, only. Generally, meetings were informal and occurred monthly, but there was never a scheduled weekly meeting. Brasler hoped that in the absence of a Precentor, there would be a clergyperson tasked with hosting these meetings, or that the Dean would take on that



responsibility. Brasler notes that a weekly meeting where matters could be unpacked, would mitigate a cross point in cathedral administration and lead to a resolution of friction among staff members and members in ministries. Clergy have always had an open-door policy, but he feels it is not his responsibility to continuously arrange such meetings. Brasler expresses his regret that the basic management structure and formality of a weekly meeting for liturgy and musical issues is not functional.

Irish indicates that he has good working relationships with parish council, clergy and with the rector. Lowes adds that the relationship between music director and rector is based on the mutual respect of qualification, experience and respect for one another's role. Petersen notes that he and the choir have always had excellent relationships with parish rectors, but has always been assertive in his approach, to the benefit of the current musical and liturgical traditions of the parish.

Even though choirs often run autonomously to the other ministries and involve ad-hoc singers, musical professionals or people from other denominations or religions, it is important for clergy to be aware that the choir is also a part of the parish congregation and therefore needs pastoral care. When individual members of the choir, or the choir as a whole, are experiencing hardships, it is the responsibility of the clergy to intervene sensitively and pastorally. Brasler indicates that he had asked for assistance from clergy several times before, hoping that they could be more involved in mitigations. All these times have been unsuccessful, reasoning that the choir might be seen to be performing an add-on to the church and that clergy struggle to connect with choristers.

Weeder and Brasler note that the music ministry is very rarely on the agenda of the parish council. Brasler indicated that relationships appear strained between the music ministry and parish council as there appears to be no direct interest in the output of the music department. In contrast, Irish and Petersen note that music is regularly discussed in parish council, with the councillors taking a keen interest in the smooth-running and success of the ministry.

Brasler explains that he is not a member of parish council as he is employed by church management and the parish council and would like to keep that professional distance. He mentions that he rarely has had to meet with church wardens and parish council - these occasions were normally to address general parish crisis situations. Franklin James, the cathedral Operations Manager, has taken great interest in the preservation and servicing of the

cathedral organ, even requesting to be given a tour of the inside of the organ to fully understand, from a practical perspective, its challenges, and to be well-informed when structuring a business plan to mitigate and plan for any eventualities. Brasler greatly appreciated the interest displayed by cathedral management in this way.

According to Irish, every parish operates in terms of departments or ministries which see to the various facets of running a successful church. These ministries are all interlinked, and it is essential that all ministries have representation on the parish council to ensure that council discussions are not impoverished. Special care is taken at St Michael's election meeting that all ministries are represented at parish council. Irish notes that he is a member of the parish council and explains that every parish ministry leader, including the music director, should ideally be a member of parish council, if not an elected member, then an ex-officio member, as parish council or clergy do not know how that ministry functions effectively unless that ministry has a voice on council.

Petersen notes that he is also a member of parish council and is a church warden of the parish with Adriaanse noting that music is regularly on the agenda at parish council meetings. Petersen notes that his management role in the parish has hugely benefitted the music ministry in the parish.

## **5.8 Financial Management**

Irish's financial future planning methods to ensure growth and sustainability must be highlighted as particularly interesting. Members who would like to donate funds to the choir are invited to bequeath funds to the choir, posthumously. Lowes is aware of this practice and supports it.

A discussion of Weeder's vision of including youth from the Cape Flats in the cathedral music program has been completed in a previous section of this dissertation. Weeder notes that finance needs to be purposefully collected and invested into a diverse and inclusive music-feeder program at the cathedral to ensure a multi-ethnic and inclusive choir and music program in five to ten years' time. Weeder (2020b, p. 17) states, "once you operate on that [financial] basis, because the budget commitment says something about your commitment and your intention within the faith community. There is a definite action and a 'put your money where your mouth is' attitude."

## 5.9 Education and Development

According to Irish and Brasler, one of the major criticisms of the offerings of the RSCM Cape Town Branch is that they host the majority of their workshops and day courses to accommodate as many participants as possible. In the process, it has lost the interest of experienced choristers and conductors, as the courses attract a majority of inexperienced singers from amateur church choirs. The committee, in an attempt at inclusivity, has tried to bridge the substantial gap between highly experienced choristers and amateur choristers and has discredited the quality of the service provided as regards experienced singers. Irish explains that in the 1970's and 1980's, the RSCM endeavoured to teach and expose people to different and exciting repertoire that they might not be able to do in their own parish. Participants would then go back into their parish and communities and want to perform repertoire that is more adventurous or at a higher standard than what they had done before – this is the goal of education and training. Then came a fundamental change in the offering of the RSCM at their workshops and courses. They tried to provide participants with accessible repertoire that they would be able to perform with their own parish choirs. The RSCM were thus promoting music of a mediocre standard to accommodate workshop attendants who were of a lower standard to make them feel welcome, and in turn, they lost loyal members that are used to a higher standard of music.

Brasler served as a RSCM committee member of the Cape Town Branch a number of years ago. He indicated that he mentioned at that time that the trend of the RSCM had become to cater for amateur choirs only to the detriment of the credibility of their offering. He notes that he has seen an improvement in their offering in recent years. Furthermore, Brasler theorises that some experienced singers are disinclined to participate in RSCM workshops or courses because it requires a long commitment of their time. Often workshops would start at 10am on a Saturday, with a note-bashing session of the course repertoire to accommodate amateur singers and concludes with a service at 6pm.

Irish notes that he has noticed that the RSCM now has a new vision. They are now trying to inspire choral music within a context of parish worship – a step in the right direction.

Brasler draws attention to the Sunday School and confirmation classes, stating that the church education is not age-appropriate for the learners. Many drop out because the level of education is too elementary. The schools do not have a diocesan-approved curriculum with the required resources of qualified teachers and teaching-material. There also seems to be a disconnect

between the Sunday School and confirmation programme as regards a lack of continuity. There is also a distance between what is taught in the church education programme and what the church is doing on any given Sunday. The church has also failed to educate students effectively to be fully aware of the meaning of the liturgy and the Mass - the youth are not rooted in their liturgical heritage and traditions. Lowes notes that the first step to the retention of youth in the church is to educate them in the liturgical traditions and rich symbolism of the church i.e. why rituals are done in a certain way and why certain texts are said. Petersen explains he has been hoping for a volunteer to teach the Holy Nativity confirmands about the value of church music in the worship. Unfortunately, this has not materialised. Petersen notes that a new confirmation curriculum has been released two years ago but unfortunately, no music and liturgical education is included.

Both Adriaanse and Weeder were seminarians at the St Paul's Seminary in Grahamstown, with Adriaanse being one year below Weeder. Weeder recalls there being no formal lectures taught in church music but remembers the Thursday afternoon or Friday morning singing rehearsal, with cassock donned, compulsory for all seminarians to prepare the music for the upcoming Sundays. Adriaanse confirms this recollection, adding that seminarians were extensively rehearsed in the music of the liturgy and hymns. This included exposure to many hymnbook resources and various Mass settings, most notably the Lumko Mass. Adriaanse remembers music being offered in a variety of styles and genres. He adds that the seminarians were even invited to sing at the St Patrick's Catholic Church in Grahamstown, highlighting their proficiency in singing. Weeder notes that the Lumko Mass setting was introduced to the seminarians in his final year of study and then subsequently spread from 1985 onwards to become a regular, utilised setting of the Mass in the church province, particularly under the mentorship of the late Reverend Mlamli Mfenyana. Weeder states that the theological education at St Paul's Seminary was of a very Western-oriented formation, yet there were limitations to the courses offered due to the South African economy of the time. Adriaanse explains that seminarians came from different cultures of churchmanship, reflecting a diverse Anglican formation of Anglo-Catholics, Evangelical Anglicans, Charismatic Anglicans, and Pentecostal Anglicans. Irish notes that fifty years ago, all seminarians at St Paul's Seminary were expected to be members of the cathedral choir. Back then, plainsong and musical training were part of the fabric.

Weeder has been a member of an informal liturgical study group since 1985. Over time, the more able and informed mentors of this group of reference have passed. Esteemed amongst this group had been his first rector, the late Reverend Bob de Maar. Lowes has a keen interest in keeping in touch with liturgical traditions and is a member of the Choral Evensong Association and a ritual notes group. Adriaanse keeps abreast of his own personal studies and improvement through theological resources from the St Paul's Seminary. No clergy member is currently attending workshops and seminars in liturgical music.

Lowes recalls courses in church music taught in the curriculum during his studies, focussing on the role which music plays in worship, the various diverse types of church music one could potentially encounter, and the historical role that music played in church worship. Reference was made to the important role chant played in the formative years of the church and about its imminent decline. Discussions about the practicalities of chant, voice projection, and the non-necessity of electronic amplification, were held. Lowes notes that no practical instrumental lessons or chant lessons were offered.

The clergy interviewed are all connoisseurs of musical excellence and support the arts with great enthusiasm. Unfortunately, as a trend, which is assumed as standard across the diocese, neither clergy member has received musical training, cannot read sheet music and all have deep-seated insecurities about their ability to sing. There is a great reluctance on the part of clergy to sing in the Mass and Brasler acknowledges that there is a discomfort in addressing this with clergy. Irish confirms that all the plainsong sung by the clergy is printed within the traditional missal. Petersen adds that there is also a version of the plainsong responses to the Mass in the Anglican Folk Mass by Shaw. Clergy have confirmed that they do not make use of any printed music authority of the plainsong sung by the Celebrant in the Mass and that they have learnt these chants by association and exposure. Lowes speaks to this trend - at the commencement of his tenure at St Michael's, it had been thirty years since he had sung some of the intonations required of him within the Anglo-Catholic Mass. He was surprised at how easily he could recall the chants and use YouTube and other internet sources to revise some chant traditions. Weeder and Adriaanse note that they do not prepare any chanting in advance of a Mass. In fact, Adriaanse avoids chanting in the mass in its entirety.

Brasler theorises that this practice has contributed to the great inconsistencies in plainchant sung within the diocese. The trends from certain priests are adopted by others which have made for bizarre renditions of these set chants. In the past, the church would have had a clear aural

tradition of chants that was passed down, but with the introduction of new liturgical texts, this tradition has been lost. As an example, Brasler notes that all clergy seem to be completely comfortable to chant the *Veni Creator* as the same version is sung in all parish churches across the Province at all confirmations and ordinations. Brasler suggests these chants be standardised by a clerical and music authority within the diocese.

The notion that clergy might opt for using a worship band in church as the easy solution to providing church music to the congregation was defused by all interview candidates. Weeder reasons the clergy's varied stance towards traditional Anglican music to their varied background and the churchmanship with which they grew up. This influences their opinion on music, as ordained clergymen. Brasler reasons that clergy are educated in different schools of theology, in different time periods and that clergy are educated about the importance of liturgical music to varying degrees. He suggests that there should be a central diocesan authority that monitors the musical developments of parishes. Many older, more Anglo-Catholic minded clergy have retired, and that body of knowledge will soon be lost to the church. Brasler comments that the Anglican Church manages by allowing certain parishes to operate autonomously. The diocese seems reluctant to be the central authority on all matters. Therefore, there is very little uniformity in worship across the Anglican churches.

Irish theorises that clergy might opt for using a worship band in church as a desperate attempt to recapture something of the past in the current services, in terms of attendance and the role of the church in a post-Christian society. Irish explains that clergy of the 1960's would remember that the most fervent supporters of the 1970's charismatic movement within the Anglican Church would have been quinquagenarians, who had grown up pre-World War I, when the Anglican Church was at its most prosperous and Anglicans had significant status in society. The British monarch who was in power, government officials and society's upper class were mostly Anglicans, which meant full Anglican congregations, full choir stalls and highly educated clergy where bishops had doctorates. By the 1970's, the growing secularism of society had changed churchmanship in its entirety - congregations were ageing and youth were secularised, making for a panicked reaction from clergy. Congregants who had lived in the time of prosperity in the church desperately wanted to rekindle the church of the past, even if it meant changing the liturgy and musical heritage of the Anglican church. Irish concludes that growing the congregation numbers in the church will certainly not be achieved by programming popular-style worship music in the Mass.

## 5.10 The Future Prospects of Anglican Church Music

Clergy and music directors were asked if they felt an obligation to safeguard the traditional Anglican musical heritage for future generations.

Brasler reflects that in his music career as a church musician of the Anglican Church, he has become less inclined to fight small battles, such as the exclusion of worship song, for the posterity of the traditional Anglican musical heritage. Brasler states “I probably would be you [the researcher] now, quite a staunch defender of it [traditional Anglican music] ..., at the same time knowing that change is there and sometimes one hits a point where you can’t fight any longer on certain things and I think I’m also now as an older person less inclined to go down the battles I’ve seen some people do in their later career for sometimes I think, battling the wrong thing, and a ghost that wasn’t there”. He has grown to accept of an all-encompassing approach to music ministry, but still finds the most comfort in the spiritual and worship expression of choir and organ music, and would be disappointed to see that tradition disappear in time.

Weeder guards against being too enthusiastic about the future of traditional Anglican music within the diocese. He says there is a rich musical heritage in the Xhosa-speaking congregation that will be passed on, but he observes that in other parishes, clergy are allowing and encouraging an Americanisation of church culture. It is very often not contested because it comes as a budget-friendly option.

Irish hopes the legacy of his tenure leaves a foundation that is strong enough to last into the future. He hopes there will be a musical legacy of understanding of the right thing to do and the reason it is done in that way.

Lowes (2020, p. 36) laments, “If this kind of music disappeared, it would be a disaster. It would be a disaster for spirituality, it would be a disaster for church, it would be a huge loss because quite honestly it brings with it, discipline, beauty, mysticism.”

Petersen foresees a very gloomy state of affairs for the future of Anglican choirs. He theorises that the next twenty years might bring the end to the parish choir tradition with only the cathedral choirs still functioning fully. Petersen (2020, p. 70) states, “I think we are going to be flogging a dead horse but as long as we are flogging, we should continue flogging because

things might change, you never know, but if things were left unchanged now, as we are, very gloomy prospects.”

Brasler finds comfort that the cathedral still offers guests from the greater diocese and international locations a musically impactful service of a high standard, especially at Easter and Christmas. Some people travel from great distances to enjoy the music that the cathedral has to offer in services like Evensong, which is not done in the majority of parishes anymore, especially for older people who grew up knowing these traditions and services, as well as for younger church-music enthusiasts.



## Chapter 6            Conclusions

St George's Cathedral is indeed a magnificent building with a splendid acoustic. Its rich history as the foundation of the Anglican Church in Southern Africa, has made it home to British colonialists and to the new, integrated, democratic and multicultural South African society. The cathedral holds national and international status as the mother church of the Province of Southern Africa, the seat of the Archbishop and the Suffragan Bishop of Cape Town, and the 'people's cathedral', a place of hope, reconciliation and prayer.

Against this backdrop lies the rich tradition of music, liturgy and worship - a church with a long and prosperous heritage of traditional Anglican music. As a cathedral, it boasts fantastic music facilities, one of South Africa's best organs, choir vestries, muniments room, rehearsal rooms and spacious choir stalls. Worshippers at the cathedral are privileged to be lead in spirituality by a substantial music department of three choirs, all fulfilling varying roles in the church life and producing music of a high standard.

In its role and status as the mother church to such a large and diverse society and to an Anglican church which embraces multiple liturgical and musical traditions, the cathedral finds itself grappling with its identity. It sees itself as a flagship of liturgical and musical excellence within South Africa, in its attempt to uphold high standards in some conservative Anglo-Catholic traditions, as well as to promote new liturgical practices. With the increase in secularisation of society, political and societal moves for increased cultural, race and gender inclusivity, and the recognition of the heritage of all people, the cathedral is desperately moving towards change to remain relevant to all society. This attempt at relevance manifests in its liturgical practices that incorporate new, experimental liturgies, and musical output that embraces the African musical culture.

In the constant plight to remain relevant to society, the cathedral has evolved greatly in its church practice. This, in some ways, has affected the music ministry of the church, negatively.

In this precarious position, the cathedral needs to have a unified management of clergy, music director, parish council and administration staff with clear, communicated and agreed-upon core values, ideals, expectations and shared vision for the cathedral of the future. These fundamentals are the foundations for strategic current, and future planning and affects the way in which management approaches the running of the cathedral. In an understaffed cathedral,

with the most notable absence of a qualified and experienced Precentor, strain is taken by the remaining staff, stretching their responsibilities in order to maintain the weekly function of the cathedral. However, the absence of strong and definitive leadership in the liturgical and music practices of the church and the reservation to take initiative from the ministry leaders, indicates the clear underlying issue of the absence of unified values, ideals, expectations and a shared vision.

If these fundamentals were clearly discussed and defined, there would be a structured plan, in all ministries, in the progression of the cathedral. However, the absence of this has resulted in strained management relations due to undisclosed expectations, lack of effective and open communication and varying visions of worship practices. There is an acknowledgement from clergy and music director that: 1) the cathedral has lost its treble line as well as the working relationship with the Grammar School; 2) there is inter-choir politics; 3) there is a distinct lack of youth participation in the music program with no education- and development plan; 4) the choirs do not represent all cultures and demographics of the city; and 5) the repertoire is still very English in style. Despite these concerns, no structured and formal discussions have yet been made to address them. There is some expectation by clergy and the music director that these issues will be resolved within a certain timeframe - this timeframe however remains undefined.

There seems to be great reservation on the part of clergy and the music director to take the initiative and action to sort out the clear disparities in operations. The preferred course of action is to wait for another party to present a solution. Perhaps this is because both parties do not feel fully equipped to address these issues, independently.

Due to the status of the cathedral within the Anglican Church of Southern Africa, there is little doubt that music and choir-singing will remain part of the cathedral heritage. It would appear that the intention of management is to maintain the current Anglican music tradition practised. The challenge in achieving this would be to embrace new musical styles without losing the current musical tradition, to win the buy-in of cathedral choristers in this time of change, and to ensure the future of the cathedral ministry through youth music education.

St Michael's Church is one of the last parishes in the Anglican Province of Southern Africa to hold on to staunch Anglo-Catholic traditions in liturgy, music and churchmanship. These tractarian ideologies manifest themselves in a unique display of a strict and uncompromising

liturgical regime that is well-planned, resourced and administered by a management team that shares high-churchmanship ideals in the execution of excellence in music and liturgy. St Michael's is secure and unwavering in its identity as an Anglo-Catholic church, triumphant as the flagship of liturgical and musical excellence within South Africa. The parish caters for a niche congregation that, in its majority, happens to be the aged. However, the threat of becoming irrelevant to future generations does not affect the liturgical output of the church as it is proud of that for which it stands which, in turn, attracts interests of individuals from across the diocese.

Added to this backdrop is the rich tradition of Anglican liturgical music performed. The parish has a long and prosperous heritage of traditional Anglican music. As a parish, it is proud to be equipped with South Africa's largest parish church organ. Worshippers at the St Michael's are privileged to be led in spirituality by a very active music department, which has a choir that performs regularly at eucharistic services and at Evensong.

The parish has a driven, motivated and highly experienced music director which leads the music ministry through meticulous scheduling and planning regular performances of a high standard by the choir. The music director is cognisant of his succession planning, having employed an assistant organist and organ scholar. There are excellent and highly supportive management relations between clergy, parish council and the music director with all parties acknowledging the central role of music in worship and sharing the same vision for the future of St Michael's. The clergy employed are sufficiently educated in Anglican music practices and are always open to learning the musical traditions to maintain excellence in worship.

It is the constant plight of the church to ensure the sustainability and future of the traditions practised. There is an acknowledgement from clergy and music director that the congregation and choir are ageing, and that recruitment needs to be done to sustain the musical culture. However, the biggest challenge for the music ministry is to recruit competent and dedicated musicians. With the choir's fast turnaround of repertoire, it is not an environment for beginner musicians as they will very quickly find themselves functioning inadequately in a performance-based environment. Furthermore, the challenge to get youth involved in all aspects of ministry in the church is paramount, as the future of the Anglo-Catholic tradition is based on teaching the youth the value of performing rich traditions and instilling in them an appreciation for the faith of the church.

At present, there is little doubt that music and choir singing will remain part of the church's heritage. The unique Anglo-Catholic faith draws people to the congregation, and the current excellence produced by the music department draws musicians to participate. There is no doubt that traditional Anglican music will be part of the congregation's identity in the future. The challenge in ensuring these prospects is to actively recruit and educate, particularly through youth music education.

Holy Nativity is a relatively young, Anglican congregation of only forty-five years since its establishment. With the musical tradition taking root in 1992 the liturgical, music and worship traditions of the parish have undergone substantial change within the past twenty-eight years. The success of this parish is what it has managed to achieve in a relatively short existence in a Cape Flats community.

The parish has a large dedicated choir that sings a regular eucharistic Mass and Evensong, with a well-resourced music department and a substantial repertoire programme. The music ministry is directed by a driven, inspired, and motivated music director who is liturgically, musically and theologically experienced. The choir has a very active annual programme, with repertoire and rehearsals scheduled to ensure the performance of exciting, effective and inspiring repertoire for the benefit and appreciation of the congregation.

Through the vision of the music director and the choir's drive for excellence and success, the clergy have been supportive in all the new endeavours undertaken by the choir, including the tradition of touring nationally (one of the few Anglican parish choirs in South Africa that have the opportunity to do so).

Excellent management relations between the music director and clergy, and the shared drive for the prosperity of the church music programme manifested in the historic purchase of a pipe organ. This is a clear indication of the dedication of the parish to excellence in liturgy and worship.

Currently, the parish embraces a curious mix of Anglo-Catholic and modern church practices, but in its experimentation to find its worship style, there has been a willingness from congregation and clergy alike, to embrace conservative traditions. Even though there has been experimentation in the church with charismatic music, this has not detracted from the quality, or reception and position of the choir in the parish and the importance of traditional Anglican music.

It is the constant plight of the church to ensure the sustainability and future of the traditions practised. There is the constant limitation brought by the shortage of finance to the possibility of growth and development of the choir. Though the music ministry has overcome financial burden in the successful purchase of assets, it displays the constant potential and drive for growth, thus always needing more finances. It is a challenge for the music ministry to recruit competent and dedicated young choristers. The choir is also largely comprised of inexperienced singers, with some singers not being musically literate. There is the intention to provide youth and choir members with much-needed music education for the future success of the music ministry.

At present, there is little doubt that music and choir-singing will be part of worship for the foreseeable future, but with the relatively short existence of the choir and the music director playing such an integral role in the success of the music programme, there is a minor insecurity of the quality of music in the future. The challenge in ensuring these prospects is to actively recruit and educate, particularly through youth music education.

As a trend across all church parishes studied, there must be an acknowledgement that they all uphold high standards of music performance and strive to uphold, preserve and kindle effective congregations for traditional Anglican music. All music directors schedule music of liturgical and theological significance, appropriate to the occasion. There is a shared disdain and disparagement for charismatic music within the church by all music directors, especially with regard to its banality and lack of theological significance.

The cathedral is the only parish studied in this dissertation that is particularly afflicted by the societal pressures to become more culturally relevant and diverse in its musical and liturgical practices. Perhaps this is inherent as its role as cathedral to a multi-ethnic and diverse cosmopolitan city. The cathedral feels an obligation to be experimental and at the forefront of liturgical developments, while the other two parishes in the study can remain relatively conservative. The other parishes seem to function autonomously from diocesan pressures and therefore have it slightly easier in maintaining a stable musical and liturgical tradition into the future.

There are a number of shared afflictions that all three parishes display in varying degrees. All choirs have gratitude and support shown by its clergy, of its musical output and are left to a large extent to function as an autonomous music ministry. However, with the continuous efforts

by the cathedral to change the liturgy, there is a greater weight in clergy opinion to the functioning and output of the music department.

Research shows that seminarians are not adequately educated in the historical significance and fundamentals of liturgical music and its role within the Anglican church tradition. There is also no musical authority at seminaries in the education of prospective clergy in the basics of musical literacy, singing technique, and the skill of chanting, which will become part of their role and work as clergy. There seems to be a great focus on preparing seminarians to grapple with theological, psychological, management, and family problems, with no emphasis on the liturgical traditions of high church. Thus, clergy are inadequately prepared to make educated and informed decisions due to the lack of experience in the output of the church. Therefore, churches have varied traditions, very often not inspired by the Anglican heritage. There are also some insecurities and trepidation of clergy to chant and sing in the Mass. This shortcoming therefore affects all parishes in facets of the music ministry across the diocese. Clergy clearly show support for, and appreciation of, the music ministry, but are unqualified to engage critically and effectively on a musical level with church musicians. As church musicians are expected to have an understanding of theology, church traditions and liturgical practices, surely clergy must be expected to know the basics of the musical traditions of the church?

All music directors interviewed are organists, experienced conductors and choral singers, but none have had formal training in the current practices of choral-rehearsal methodology. This mostly prevents them from making educated and constructive comments about on vocal placement and technique in choir rehearsals.

All the choirs studied have a substantial turnaround of repertoire and function in a performance-based environment. All choirs would prefer more members within their ranks. There is a desperate need to recruit suitably capable musicians, who can read and learn music at the required frequency. The succession of the music director, and of ageing choir members is tenuously unconsidered in all parishes. There is a distinct awareness that parishes are facing issues regarding recruitment of choir members, yet very little strategic planning and action has been seen to be taken. None of the parishes have an active recruitment feeder plan. Some might say a feeder plan is not an essential in a parish environment, but this is to the detriment of the preservation of the Anglican music heritage for future generations.

All persons interviewed acknowledge that there is a serious shortage of capable and qualified Anglican church organists. Further acknowledgement is to the lack of youth participation in the music ministry. With ageing choristers and church musicians, it is essential to have some form of music education for the youth in the parish. No parish seems currently successful at implementing the education of the youth and inspiring them to join the choir.

There is a consensus from all interviewees that a flourishing music ministry requires a substantial budget. No parish studied is currently experiencing the effect of a lack of funds, yet there is a critical awareness of the importance of ensuring the sustainability of funding a music programme. Organ maintenance is funded out of the general parish budget in all three parishes but there is a consensus that maintenance costs are expensive. In all cases, growth and development is always in relation to the availability of funds.

There is a shared sense of concern from all music directors and clergy interviewed of the impact that the COVID-19 pandemic might have on liturgical music. A key concern is whether all choir members will return after they have become accustomed to the new realities of life during nationwide lockdown. Weeder's conclusions ring almost prophetically as he reflects on the future of Anglican music: "At the same time the internet, of globalisation impacts on our understanding and experience of culture demands more gracious fluidity of liturgical expression. The post lockdown era will no doubt impact on choir and liturgy" (Weeder, 2020a, p. 8) - an uncomfortable reality for Anglican traditionalists.

In summation of the findings presented and in answering the primary and secondary research questions, it can be confirmed that traditional Anglican church music will remain part of the musical offering of the church for the foreseeable future and is not experiencing an immediate threat of decline. Music programmes are currently well-founded and established in their output of traditional music, which is cherished as a heritage to preserve by both music directors and clergy. The plight of Anglican church music is primarily rooted in its lack of recruitment, future planning, education of clergy and youth, the influence of music not suitable for Anglican liturgical use, and the increasing secularisation of society. This threatens the far future of Anglican church music. All music directors and clergy are indeed cognisant of the long-term challenges to upholding the heritage of traditional music.

## Chapter 7      Recommendations

In light of the findings of this thesis and the conclusions drawn, it is appropriate to theorise the possible preventative methods which can be implemented and possible interventions that could be considered to mitigate the diminishing of traditional Anglican church music in South Africa. This section aims to provide practical and accessible solutions in some instances. The following recommendations can be considered:

The support and appreciation of clergy is essential to the morale of the choir and the music director. However, it is not enough to idly stand by and just be supportive. Music directors and choirs need clergymen to be present, visually and administratively involved in the choir. On one level, this might mean that clergy should engage with choristers about their experience in the choir, being truly interested in their spirituality and the enjoyment thereof. If unfavourable sentiments arise, these can be addressed sensitively, effectively and objectively. Clergy are to remember that choristers are also part of the parish congregation and because of their heavy involvement in the church, need pastoral engagement, maybe in the form of a friendly conversation, on a regular basis. On another level, this might require clergy humbling themselves and joining the ranks of the choir for their own personal improvement. This strongly drives the message that: 1) the choir is open to anyone participating and is accessible to all; 2) the contribution of the choir is highly valued; 3) it builds camaraderie between laypeople and clerical ranks by opening the lines of communication; 4) it improves clerical music education and appreciation; 5) it mitigates choir politics; 6) it makes for controlled rehearsal circumstances; and 7) it heightens clergy's awareness of the functionality, needs and shortcomings of the choir.

The church parish as a whole, must have a unified vision for the future and this must include the growth and development of the music ministry. This vision must be based on a series of formal meetings of frank and open discussions between clergy, the music director, parish council and administrative staff. Hopefully these will result in clearly communicated and agreed-upon core values, ideals and expectations, including a growth and sustainability plan, that will be promulgated within the parish in the following five to ten years. Meetings should be convened in an open, unbiased environment, based on mutual respect and qualified decisions. Research must be presented as evidence and a basis for recommendations within the meetings. These fundamentals will form the foundations for strategic current and future



planning, affecting the way in which all things are managed and approached within the parish. In order to mitigate friction between ministry leaders and management, all responsibilities of the role-players should be stipulated in formal documents or contracts. Every parish ministry leader, including the music director, should ideally be a member of parish council, if not an elected member, then an ex-officio member, to be a voice for their ministries when needed and to ensure that decisions made by council do not negatively affect the output of individual ministries.

There is no doubt that society has changed its moral compass and that some churches see a necessity to modernise the liturgy in an attempt to remain relevant and embrace all cultures, genders and heritage in society. Care must be taken when making changes to the liturgical practices of the church by: 1) being well-informed and educated in the heritage and traditions of the church before making conclusions; 2) ensuring that when making changes that both its catholic and apostolic heritage are incorporated equally; 3) calling for a heightened sense of formality, dignity and pious reverence for the church and the sacrament; and 4) maintaining the sanctity of Mass so that it is not compromised by the pressures of secular society.

There is no diocesan interest in the manner in which parishes run their music ministries. This is a fundamental shortcoming, especially considering the vast number of clergy who are not musically educated and informed enough to make sound decisions as well as underqualified church musicians in the diocese.

A diocesan liturgical music committee should be formed under the auspices of the bishop to function in an authoritative and advisory capacity for all clergy and music ministries in the diocese. The bishop should hold honorary membership of the committee which should be comprised of the Dean of Liturgical Studies, clergy who are educated and experienced in liturgical music, music directors who have tertiary-music qualifications, or a substantial experience in liturgical music and suitably qualified and knowledgeable church musicians. This should be chaired by a high-ranking, educated clergyman. The duties of the committee would be to: 1) ensure the musical output of churches are of a regulated standard; 2) provide union support for church musicians and educational support for church musicians and clergy; 3) draw up a standard policy of accepted and encouraged music practices across the diocese; 4) manage and administer a Guild of Church Musicians and Choristers for the purpose of regular appraisals; and 5) promote and support the music education of youth within parishes. A salaried

diocesan regional director of music should be appointed to assist music ministries that need upliftment.

A diocesan music fund should be created under the patronage of the Archbishop for the establishment of at least two organ and choral conducting scholarships for tertiary education in the diocese, with the binding clause that the qualified musicians will plough back into Anglican music ministry. The fund could also sponsor efforts from youth-music developments within the diocese, remunerating efforts of youth involvement, integration and education in music.

The RSCM could provide courses for targeted audiences, making certain to expose attendees to a musical standard to which they can aspire. Certificated short courses should be arranged to educate music directors in: 1) rehearsal methodology; 2) vocal placement and technique; 3) conflict resolution; 4) tasteful and effective integration and application of music styles representing various cultures within the liturgy; 5) choir building and recruitment; 6) effective growth and sustainability planning; 7) history and appreciation of the Anglican music heritage; and 8) effective ways to recruit trebles and run a youth choir within a parish. The RSCM could investigate the possibility of publishing repertoire suitable to the Anglican liturgy that encourages integrated multicultural musical traditions. In the effort to promote youth development, the RSCM could host an Anglican youth choir festival or workshops for treble voices only.

Seminaries must provide all prospective clergy with compulsory and adequate course work in the basics of musical literacy, singing technique and the skill of chant, the history, role and importance of liturgical music and its development through the centuries, in order to adequately prepare clergy to make educated and informed decisions from experience in the output of the church liturgical music. Continuous liturgical workshops should be arranged by the Dean of Studies with a focus on: 1) conflict resolution; 2) tasteful and effective integration and application of musical styles representing various cultures within the liturgy; 3) choir building and recruitment; 4) effective growth and sustainability planning; 5) history and appreciation of the Anglican music heritage; and 6) effective ways to recruit trebles and run a youth choir within a parish.

The Sunday school and confirmation class curriculum should be drawn up and taught by qualified educators from the parish on a Sunday or weekday evening. The syllabus should be approved by the bishop, clergy, theologians and curriculum advisers before being put into

practice. The Sunday school must be structured with an annual promotion through the education system culminating in a two-year confirmation class programme. The Sunday school education level must be aligned to the learners' school level. Educational resources must be made available by the diocese to all parishes, to ensure proper education for all Anglican children. A special effort needs to be made to educate students effectively to be fully aware of the meaning of the liturgy and the Mass, the rich symbolism of the church and the musical practices of the Anglican tradition to inspire an appreciation for the Anglican liturgical heritage and traditions. An examination board can be established to regulate the full and comprehensive church education of confirmands. An appreciation for church music must be cultivated within the youth by the church from a young age. An education programme for adults must also be hosted by the church, where courses in Bible studies, liturgy, rites and ceremonies and the role of liturgical music and practices are taught.

It is of paramount importance that music ministries, especially parish choirs, are run with effective administration from the music director. This would involve the publishing of an annual music repertoire programme and rehearsal and performance schedule. It is only fair to the choir members who sacrifice their time to the music ministry to display a respect to their private and professional lives in this way. A formal annual meeting of choirs can be held where the matters of: (1) recruitment; (2) schedule; (3) repertoire; (4) external performances; (5) attaining and maintaining music department assets; (6) fundraising and budgeting; (7) future projects; (8) long term vision and a plan of growth and sustainability; and (8) the ongoing music education of choir members could form part of the agenda. This will empower choristers and make them feel a sense of responsibility for the success of the church music program.

Music directors must guard against accepting the status quo of the music ministry within the parish and diocese. It is important for music directors to have great tenacity and dedication to ensure the growth and sustainability of traditional Anglican music. Recruitment, and youth education are of paramount importance to this cause and must be made the priority of all music ministries. Community engagement by the church is important, even collaborating with local schools to get youth involved in the church environment.

The Anglican Church of Southern Africa should investigate evangelising on a more public and formal platform - perhaps through an Anglican television channel, much like the New Apostolic Church's NAC TV or via Christian radio. This would be an opportunity for the Anglican Church

to evangelise, grow its membership and broadcast Anglican music of excellent quality while unifying its church on a national scale as well as promoting Anglican liturgical music.

Music directors should not underestimate the importance of choir appraisal and properly acknowledge choir members for the dedication towards the music department.

In summation, there is indeed hope for the the future of the great heritage of traditional Anglican church music. It is a heritage that we all must treasure and protect in order for it to be preserved for future generations. We are all responsible for the perpetuation of our shared heritage. The future depends on the education of music and specifically, the rich Anglican music tradition.

## References

- Abbey Choir sings for Pope in St Peter's. (2012). Retrieved May 23, 2020, from <https://www.westminster-abbey.org/abbey-news/abbey-choir-sings-for-pope-in-st-peters>
- About RSCM. (2020). Retrieved September 27, 2020, from <https://www.rscm.org.uk/about-rscm/>
- ACNS. (2019). Pope Francis and Archbishop Justin Welby plan united visit to South Sudan. Retrieved May 23, 2020, from <https://www.anglicannews.org/news/2019/11/pope-francis-and-archbishop-justin-welby-plan-united-visit-to-south-sudan.aspx>
- Adam, A. (1992). *Foundations of Liturgy: An Introduction to Its History and Practice* (1st ed.). Minnesota: The Liturgical Press.
- Aigner, J. (2016). 9 Reasons Every Church Needs to Sing Hymns. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.patheos.com/blogs/ponderanew/2016/01/26/9-reasons-every-church-needs-to-sing-hymns/>
- Aigner, J. (2018). How offering different worship styles contributes to church decline. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.patheos.com/blogs/ponderanew/2018/07/05/worship-styles-contribute-church-decline/>
- Aigner, Jonathan. (2018a). How Offering Different Worship Styles Contributes to Church Decline. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.patheos.com/blogs/ponderanew/2018/07/05/worship-styles-contribute-church-decline/>
- Aigner, Jonathan. (2018b). How to Get Along With Church Musicians: A Guide for Pastors. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.patheos.com/blogs/ponderanew/2018/06/11/how-to-treat-church-musicians-a-guide-for-pastors/>
- Alfred, P. (1970). *The Oxford Companion to Music*. London : Oxford University Press. Retrieved from <https://archive.org/details/oxfordcompanion00scho/page/32/mode/2up>
- Anglican choir to sing for the Pope. (2012). Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2012/06/anglican-choir-to-sing-for-the-pope.aspx>
- Archbishop of Cape Town Enthroned. (1996). Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/1996/09/archbishop-of-cape-town-enthroned.aspx>
- Arinze, F. [Apostolate for F. C. (2007). Question and Answer Session with Francis Cardinal Arinze - Totus Tuus Conference [video file]. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r5DEtgR8UxE&list=PLnXfjIWJOcdxLHL8wPwNOZRZxpCzjaq62&index=2>
- Artopium's Music Dictionary. (n.d.). Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://musicterms.artopium.com/a/Anthem.htm>
- Bartle, J. (2003). *Sound Advice: Becoming a Better Children's Choir Conductor*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Berg, M. (2017). Church of England Resurrects Tradition to Attract Millennials. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://churchleaders.com/news/international/310736-evensong-church-of-england-resurrects-tradition-attract-millennials.html>
- Bethke, A.-J. (2012). *Contemporary musical expression in Anglican Churches of the Diocese of Cape Town: developments since the liturgical, theological and social revolutions of the twentieth century*. University of Cape Town.
- Bethke, A.-J. (2014). The roots of Anglican Music in Southern Africa: A historical survey of Anglican Music in the Cape. *Anglican and Episcopal History*, 83(1), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.2307/43049819>
- Bethke, A.-J. (2015). Repertoire performed in Anglican parishes in the Diocese of Cape Town: congregational music and local developments, 2009–2012. *Journal of the Musical Arts in Africa*, 12(1–2), 33–55. <https://doi.org/10.2989/18121004.2015.1129148>
- Bethke, A.-J. (2016). Music in the South African Anglican Diocese of Cape Town from 1900 to the Present: Toward a History of Anglican Music in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa. *Yale Journal of Music & Religion*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.17132/2377-231X.1006>
- Brewer, G. (2016). 4 Purposes of Music in Worship. Retrieved May 11, 2020, from <http://www.cfdiocese.org/bishopsblog/4-purposes-of-music-in-worship/>
- Brockhaus, H. (2018). Pope Francis: Sacred music points to the beauty of Paradise. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.catholicnewsagency.com/news/pope-francis-sacred-music-points-to-the-beauty-of-paradise-21149>
- Buchanan, B. (2009). *The A to Z of Anglicanism*. Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.
- Buckley, H. (2017). *The History of Holy Nativity*. Cape Town.
- Bugenhagen, J. (2019). Choir Shutdown Continues: No End in Sight. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://holyherald.com/choir-shutdown-continues-no-end-in-sight/>
- Calitz, C. J. (2011). *The free song (hymn) as a means of expression of the spirituality of the local congregation with specific focus on the situation of the Dutch Reformed Church in South-Africa*. University of Pretoria.
- Carter, R. (2020). History of the Parish. Retrieved September 1, 2020, from [www.stmichael.org.za/index.php/history-and-liturgy2/11clergyfromtheCathedralandfromWoodstockandRondeboschwereabletoholdtheserviceswithHolyCommuniononceamonth](http://www.stmichael.org.za/index.php/history-and-liturgy2/11clergyfromtheCathedralandfromWoodstockandRondeboschwereabletoholdtheserviceswithHolyCommuniononceamonth).
- Cathedral choirs - Sing and they will come. (2014, March 4). Retrieved September 28, 2020, from <https://www.economist.com/prospero/2014/03/04/sing-and-they-will-come>
- Challies, T. (2017). What We Lost When We Lost Our Hymnals. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.challies.com/articles/what-we-lost-when-we-lost-hymnals/>
- Chaney et al. (2004). The Anglican Musical Tradition: Introduction. *Sacred Music America*. Retrieved from <http://sacredmusicamerica.com>

- Chapman, M. (2006). *Anglicanism: A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Chappell, P. (2010). 7 Biblical Purposes for Music. Retrieved May 11, 2020, from <https://paulchappell.com/2010/02/08/7-biblical-purposes-for-music/>
- Christianity in the UK. (2020). Retrieved May 23, 2020, from <https://faithsurvey.co.uk/uk-christianity.html>
- Chron Contributor. (2020). How to Be a More Effective Church Choir Director. Retrieved September 1, 2020, from <https://work.chron.com/effective-church-choir-director-5370.html>
- Clarke, L. (1922). Evensong Explained, with Notes on Matins and the Litany. Retrieved May 20, 2020, from [http://anglicanhistory.org/liturgy/clarke\\_evensong.html](http://anglicanhistory.org/liturgy/clarke_evensong.html)
- Coghlan, A. (2018). Divinely Reticent. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2018/12/divulging-the-secret-of-the-famous-kings-sound/>
- Colson, J. (2012). *Conducting and rehearsing the instrumental music ensemble*. Lanham: The Scarecrow Press, Inc.
- Commin, B. (2017). *In The Beginning....* Cape Town.
- Creswell, J. Creswell, J. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (5th ed.). California: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Cromwell, M. (2018). An Engaged Choir Is A Happy Choir. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://theresourcefulchurchmusician.com/an-engaged-choir-is-a-happy-choir/>
- Cuming, G. (1969). *A History of Anglican Liturgy* (2nd ed.). New York: Palgrave.
- Dailey, P. (2011). *The Book of Common Prayer: Past, Present and Future*. (P. Dailey, Ed.). London: Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Danyew, A. (2016). 10 Secrets for Running a Successful Choir Rehearsal. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.ashleydanyew.com/posts/2016/10-secrets-for-running-a-successful-choir-rehearsal>
- Das, D. (2011). Anthem. Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/art/anthem>
- Davies, M. (2017). Lack of funds hampers parity for girl choristers. Retrieved July 13, 2018, from <https://www.churchtimes.co.uk/articles/2017/17-november/news/uk/lack-of-funds-hampers-parity-for-girl-choristers>
- Davis, E. (2018). 'It's ludicrous that the government doesn't understand the importance of music' – Andrew Lloyd Webber. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.classicfm.com/music-news/andrew-lloyd-webber-classic-brits/>
- Dawson, C. (2009). *Introduction to Research Methods A Practical Guide for Anyone Undertaking a Research Project* (4th ed.). Oxford: How To Books Ltd.
- Dean, C. (2018). Is the organist a thing of the past? Churches reveal a huge shortage of new musicians - forcing worshipers to sing along to recorded music. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-5568461/Churches-reveal-huge-shortage-new-organists.html>



- Demol, K. (1998). Sound Stewardship: How Should Christians Think About Music? *Pro Rege*, 26(3), 1–20.
- Estrella, E. (2019). What Does a Choir Director do? Retrieved September 1, 2020, from <https://www.liveabout.com/information-on-the-choir-choral-director-2456661>
- Evans, M. (2006). *Open up the Doors: Music in the Modern Church* (1st ed.). London: Equinox Publishing Ltd.
- First all-girl cathedral choir in southern hemisphere. (2016). Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2016/02/first-all-girl-cathedral-choir-in-southern-hemisphere.aspx>
- Ford, B. (2008). *The American Gradual: Chants of the Proper of the Mass adapted to English Words* (2nd ed.).
- Fortescue, A. (1910). Liturgy. Retrieved May 13, 2020, from <https://www.newadvent.org/cathen/09306a.htm>
- Francis, L. J., Lankshear, D. W., & Jones, S. H. (2000). The Influence of the Charismatic Movement on Local Church Life: A Comparative Study among Anglican Rural, Urban and Suburban Churches. *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 15(1), 121–130. <https://doi.org/10.1080/135379000112170>
- Fraser, G. (2014). If religion exists to make raids into what is unsayable, musicians penetrate further than most. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/belief/2014/feb/28/religion-exists-unsayable-musicians-penetrate-further>
- Galbraith, D. (2010). *Aspects of Koinonia: Developing an Ecclesiological approach to music in the contemporary Christian Worship*. Bangor University.
- Gledhill, R. (2018). Why are thousands of people who've never set foot in church before suddenly showing up for choral evensong? Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.christiantoday.com/article/why-are-thousands-of-people-whove-never-set-foot-in-church-before-suddenly-showing-up-for-choral-evensong/112048.htm>
- Gomes, R. (2019). Pope: sacred music helps faithful participate actively in liturgy. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://www.vaticannews.va/en/pope/news/2019-09/pope-francis-sacred-music-association-cecilia-audience.html>
- Gordon, M., & Bock, M. (2012). *St George's Cathedral: Heritage and Witness*. (Mary Bock and Judith Gordon, Ed.). Claremont: Pretext.
- Gradual. (n.d.). Retrieved May 20, 2020, from <https://episcopalchurch.org/library/glossary/gradual>
- Graham, M. Derksen, J. Winters, K. (2007). Anthems, Motets, Psalms. Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://www.thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/anthems-motets-psalms-emc>
- Graham, J. (2012). Save the church! (kill the organs). Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://www.bostonglobe.com/opinion/2012/10/24/revitalize-catholic-church-let-kill-all-organs/9FpzZPSQzhfd4uUeCJNDbK/story.html>



- Graham, Y. M. (2018). I dread the extinction of boys' choirs. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2018/06/i-dread-the-extinction-of-boys-choirs/>
- Grossman, C. L. (2014). Many church choirs are dying. Here's why. Retrieved November 14, 2017, from <http://religionnews.com/2014/09/17/many-church-choirs-dying-heres/>
- Grove, A. et al. (2018). The Major Differences Between Anglicanism and Catholicism: A Brief History of Catholic-Anglican Relations. Retrieved from <https://www.learnreligions.com/anglicanism-vs-catholicism-542550>
- Guzman, S. (2014). The Four Ends of Mass. Retrieved March 24, 2020, from <https://www.catholicgentleman.net/2014/10/four-ends-mass/>
- Hallowell, B. (2011). Worship Wars: Is the Worst Fight in Your Church Over the Style of Music? Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://www.theblaze.com/news/2011/11/27/worship-wars-is-the-worst-fight-in-your-church-over-the-style-of-music>
- Hayward, C. (2003). Music, worship and the church. *Cambridge Papers towards a Biblical Mind*, 12(1). Retrieved from <http://www.jubilee-centre.org/music-worship-and-the-church-by-christopher-hayward/>
- Hebert, L. J. (2018). Music and the Education of the Christian Soul. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.crisismagazine.com/2018/music-and-the-education-of-the-christian-soul>
- Hefling, C., & Shattuck, C. (2006). *The Oxford Guide to The Book of Common Prayer: A Worldwide Survey*. (C. Hefling & C. Shattuck, Eds.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Henschen, J. (2018). The Tragic Decline of Music Literacy (and Quality). Retrieved October 6, 2018, from <https://www.intellectualltakeout.org/article/tragic-decline-music-literacy-and-quality>
- Hill, B. (2011). *A Short Report on their present situation, recruitment methods and sustainability*.
- Hindson, E. E., & Mitchell, D. (Daniel R. . (Eds.). (2013). *The Popular Encyclopedia of Church History*. Oregon: Harvest House Publishers.
- Hodgson, T. (2017). *Basic Education Rights Handbook - Education Rights in South Africa* (1st ed.). Johannesburg. Retrieved from <http://section27.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Chapter-10.pdf#targetText=The South African Schools Act,be conducted at public schools.&targetText=The Schools Act also allows for the establishment of private schools.>
- Hohstadt, L. (2018). Current and Future Worship Trends. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://lowellhohstadt.com/future-worship-trends/>
- Jason, L. Glenwick, D. (Ed.). (2016). *Handbook of methodological approaches to community-based research qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Johnson, T. (2012). Is organ music killing our churches? Retrieved October 25, 2018, from [https://www.episcopalcafe.com/is\\_organ\\_music\\_killing\\_our\\_churches/](https://www.episcopalcafe.com/is_organ_music_killing_our_churches/)
- Kandra, G. (2018). Boom: how one priest transformed a parish with sacred music and traditional worship. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://www.patheos.com/blogs/deaconsbench/2018/03/boom-one-priest-transformed-parish->

sacred-music-traditional-worship/

- Kandra, G. (2019). Millennials in London drawn to ‘smells and bells’: ‘Church shouldn’t pretend to be your nightclub.’ Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.patheos.com/blogs/deaconsbench/2019/01/millennials-in-london-drawn-to-smell-and-bells-church-shouldnt-pretend-to-be-your-nightclub/>
- Kauflin, B. (2017). The importance of music in the church and why you should enjoy singing-up on Sunday. Retrieved May 11, 2020, from <https://bransgoreandhinton.org/2017/01/14/the-importance-of-music-in-the-church-and-why-you-should-sing-up-on-sunday/>
- Keith, S. D. (2013). *The Perceived Role of Music in the Pentecostal and Charismatic Worship Experience*. University of Louisiana at Lafayette.
- Kim, H. (2008). *Humanism and the Reform of Sacred Music in Early Modern England*. Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited.
- Kothari, C. (2004). *Research Methodology: Methods and Techniques* (2nd ed.). New Delhi: New Age International (P) Ltd.
- Kumar, R. (2011). *Research Methodology A Step-by-Step Guide for Beginners* (3rd ed.). London: SAGE Publications Ltd. Retrieved from [www.sagepublications.com](http://www.sagepublications.com)
- Kwasniewski, P. (2018). Exclusive NLM Interview with Archbishop Sample: Why Young People Are Attracted to Traditional Liturgy. Retrieved October 25, 2018, from [http://www.newliturgicalmovement.org/2018/10/exclusive-nlm-interview-with-archbishop.html?utm\\_source=dlvr.it&utm\\_medium=facebook&m=1#.W7uIK63RbN4](http://www.newliturgicalmovement.org/2018/10/exclusive-nlm-interview-with-archbishop.html?utm_source=dlvr.it&utm_medium=facebook&m=1#.W7uIK63RbN4)
- Larmondin, L. (2001). Joint worship features dancing bishops and shaking maracas. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2001/07/joint-worship-features-dancing-bishops-and-shaking-maracas.aspx>
- Lerner, F. (2019). In Defense of “The Traditional English Mass.” Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://anglicanpatrimonycatholic.wordpress.com/2019/01/29/in-defense-of-the-traditional-english-mass/>
- Lisk, E. (2006). *Conductor, Teacher, Leader*. Galesville: Meredith Music Publications.
- Liturgy and Anglican Identity. (2005). Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2005/12/liturgy-and-anglican-identity.aspx>
- Macupe, B. (2017). Court rules that public schools cannot promote one religion over others - The Daily Vox.
- Marczyk, G. DeMatteo, D. Festinger, D. (2005). *Essentials of Research Design and Methodology*. (N. Kaufman, A. Kaufman, Ed.). New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc. .
- Marshall, T. R. (2019). *Infiltration: The Plot to Destroy the Church from Within*. Manchester: Crisis Publications.
- Marty, M. E. (2007). *The Future of Classical Music in the Church*. Retrieved from <https://ism.yale.edu/sites/default/files/files/The Future of Classical Music in the Church.pdf>

- Mathis, D. (2012). What Happened at Vatican II. Retrieved September 24, 2019, from <https://www.desiringgod.org/articles/what-happened-at-vatican-ii>
- Meakin, T. (1990). *A Basic Church Dictionary*. Norwich: The Canterbury Press. Retrieved from <https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=7M0xYV79jRcC&lpg=PA94&pg=PA94#v=onepage&q&f=false>
- Meier, G. (2009). *The Score, the Orchestra, and the Conductor*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Meikle, J. (2014). Schoolgirls end Canterbury's tradition of male-only singing. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2014/01/schoolgirls-end-canterburys-tradition-of-male-only-singing.aspx>
- Merriam Webster. (2020). Merriam-Webster Dictionary. Retrieved May 13, 2020, from <https://www.merriam-webster.com/>
- Montagna, D. (2017). Pope Francis calls for end to "mediocrity, banality and superficiality" in liturgical music. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <https://aleteia.org/2017/03/08/pope-francis-calls-for-end-to-mediocrity-banality-and-superficiality-in-liturgical-music/>
- Mouton, J. (2000). *How to succeed in your Master's and Doctoral Studies* (1st ed.). Cape Town: Van Schaik.
- Mulgrew, C. (2020a). Five life skills every choir leader needs. Retrieved September 1, 2020, from <https://www.totalchoirresources.com/five-life-skills-every-choir-leader-needs/>
- Mulgrew, C. (2020b). What makes a great choir leader? Retrieved September 1, 2020, from <https://www.totalchoirresources.com/what-makes-a-great-choir-leader-2/>
- Ouzts, D. (2017). Ordinary vs. Proper. Retrieved May 20, 2020, from <http://www.holycommunion.org/notes/posts/ordinary-vs-proper>
- Pavlick, E.-J. (2010). John Paul II's Statements on Music in the Church: A Fulfillment of the Theology of Vatican II. *Sacred Music*, 137(1), 6. Retrieved from <https://www.questia.com/library/journal/1G1-279262675/john-paul-ii-s-statements-on-music-in-the-church>
- Percival, P. (2007). The big 3 issues in church music. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from [https://sydneyanglicans.net/blogs/insight/the\\_big\\_3\\_issues\\_in\\_church\\_music](https://sydneyanglicans.net/blogs/insight/the_big_3_issues_in_church_music)
- Petersen, A. (2017). *Silver Anniversary of the Parish's Choral Tradition*. Cape Town.
- Pirtle, C. (2018). Benedict XVI Beyond the Liturgy Wars. Retrieved April 25, 2020, from <https://churchlifejournal.nd.edu/articles/benedict-xvi-beyond-the-liturgy-wars/>
- Pitts, J. (2017). Churches struggling to find organists. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://www.baltimoresun.com/news/maryland/bs-md-church-organist-shortage-20170407-story.html>
- Poewe, K. O. (1994). *Charismatic Christianity as a Global Culture*. Columbia: University of South Carolina Press.
- Ratzinger, J. (1983). Theological Problems of Church Music. *Crux et Cithara*. Retrieved from

- <https://musicasacra.com/commentaries/theological-problems/>
- Ratzinger, J. (2014). *Joseph Ratzinger Collected Works: Volume II - Theology of the Liturgy*. (M. J. Miller, Ed.). San Francisco: Ignatius Press.
- RCA Commission on Worship. (n.d.). The Theology and Place of Music in Worship. Retrieved from <https://www.faithward.org/the-theology-and-place-of-music-in-worship/>
- Rishton, T. (n.d.). The future of church music: a lecture. Retrieved from <http://www.rishton.info/pubs/churchmusic.html>
- Rodriguez, E. (2020). Anglican Chant. Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/art/Anglican-chant>
- Rosenthal, J. (2008). Festive Beginning for New Archbishop of Cape Town. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2008/04/festive-beginning-for-new-archbishop-of-cape-town.aspx>
- Roth, A. N. (2018). Local churches struggle to find organists. Retrieved October 25, 2018, from <http://www.uticaod.com/news/20181006/local-churches-struggle-to-find-organists>
- Routley, E. (1997). *A Short History of English Church Music* (2nd ed.). London: Mowbray.
- Royal School of Church Music. (2018). Retrieved September 19, 2020, from <https://www.rscm.org.uk/our-resources/rscm-medals-and-ribbons/>
- Russell, B. (2007). Resolving the Music Controversy: What's this disagreement all about. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.christianitytoday.com/pastors/2007/july-online-only/churchcentral-030512.html>
- Sachs, W., & Dean, S. (2020). Anglicanism. Retrieved May 13, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Anglicanism>
- Schall, S. J. J. V. (2015). For Pope Benedict, Music is Inspired By An Encounter with the Divine. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://aleteia.org/2015/08/25/for-pope-benedict-music-is-inspired-by-an-encounter-with-the-divine/>
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as Qualitative Research A Guide for Researchers in Education and the Social Sciences* (3rd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Senn, F. C. (2012). *Introduction to Christian Liturgy*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.
- Sison, M. (2004). Music and multilingual service mark installation of new leader. Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://www.anglicanjournal.com/music-and-multilingual-service-mark-installation-of-new-leader-2386/amp/>
- Spreadbury, J. (2016). Jesus: a portrait in words and music. Retrieved July 13, 2018, from <https://www.churchtimes.co.uk/articles/2016/26-february/features/features/jesus-a-portrait-in-words-and-music>
- Strong, R. (2017a). *The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume I*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Strong, R. (2017b). *The Oxford History of Anglicanism, Volume III*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Stubbs, G. (1917). Why We Have Male Choirs in Churches. *The Musical Quarterly*, 3(3), 416–427.

- Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/738032>
- Swain, J. P. (2006). *Historical dictionary of sacred music*. Scarecrow Press.
- Sweeney, J. (2017). Why Are Church Choirs On the Decline? Retrieved November 14, 2017, from <https://www.boxcast.com/blog/why-are-church-choirs-are-on-the-decline>
- Tagg, B. (2013). *Before the Singing*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Temperley, N. (1979). *The Music of the English Parish Church: Volume 1*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved from [https://books.google.co.za/books?id=XfBOzmC1OTIC&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs\\_ge\\_summary\\_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.co.za/books?id=XfBOzmC1OTIC&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false)
- Temperley, N. (2001). Anglican and Episcopalian Church Music. Retrieved May 21, 2020, from <https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000046765>
- The Archbishop of Canterbury will be celebrating the choral tradition. (2008). *Anglican Communion News Service*. Retrieved from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2008/01/the-archbishop-of-canterbury-will-be-celebrating-the-choral-tradition.aspx>
- The Papal Visit: Pope Benedict XVI in the UK. (2010). Retrieved May 23, 2020, from <https://thepapalvisit.org.uk/>
- Tilby, A. (2018). Why choral evensong is so popular. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.churchtimes.co.uk/articles/2018/2-november/comment/columnists/why-choral-evensong-is-so-popular#.W-XUhpPpOro.facebook>
- Tucker, J. (2008). What Were the Musical Intentions of Vatican II? Retrieved April 24, 2020, from <https://www.catholicculture.org/culture/library/view.cfm?recnum=8335>
- Walters, C. (1994). *Advice to the minister of music: get a giant hat rack!* Missouri: CBC Press Books.
- Ward-Steinman, P. (2010). *Becoming a Choral Music Teacher: A Field Experience Workbook*. New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Ward, K. (2006). *A History of Global Anglicanism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Watkins, D. (2018). Pope to Choirs: 'Help community sing, don't replace its voice'. Retrieved March 27, 2019, from <https://www.vaticannews.va/en/pope/news/2018-11/pope-francis-3rd-choirs-meeting-singing.html>
- Weaver, M. (2009). What are the propers? Retrieved May 20, 2020, from <http://b16schola.org/what-are-the-propers/>
- West, J. (2017). Anglican Music: Future of the Continuing Anglican church. Retrieved October 25, 2018, from <http://anglicanmusic.blogspot.com/2017/10/future-of-continuing-anglican-church.html>
- Wijngaards, J. (2014). Women and girls were not allowed to be singers in Church. Retrieved May 22, 2020, from <http://www.womenpriests.org/traditio/singers.asp>
- Williams, B. (2016). Why Tradition. Why Now. Retrieved May 11, 2020, from

- <https://liturgyguy.com/2016/09/25/why-tradition-why-now/>
- Wittry, D. (2007). *Beyond the Baton*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wood, M. J. (2014). Ancient Worship Wars: An Investigation of Conflict in Church Music History. *Musical Offerings*, 5(2), 119–130. <https://doi.org/10.15385/jmo.2014.5.2.3>
- Yin, R. (2016). *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish* (2nd ed.). New York: The Guilford Press.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Research and Applications*. (L. Fargotstain, Ed.) (6th ed.). California: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Young, G. et al. (2017). Book of Common Prayer. Retrieved May 15, 2020, from <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Book-of-Common-Prayer>
- Zulu, B. (2016). Anglicans share strategies to retain the youth. Retrieved June 29, 2018, from <http://www.anglicannews.org/news/2016/04/anglicans-share-strategies-to-retain-the-youth.aspx>

## Personal Communication

- Adriaanse, L. (2020a, September 18). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Adriaanse, L. (2020b, September 21). Personal communication. *Personal Interview*. Cape Town.
- Brasler, G. (2020a, August 28). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Brasler, G. (2020b, September 3). Personal communication. *Personal Interview*. Cape Town.
- Irish, D. (2020a, August 11). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Irish, D. (2020b, August 13). Personal communication. *Zoom Interview*. Cape Town.
- Lowes, T. (2020a, August 11). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Lowes, T. (2020b, August 13). Personal communication. *Zoom Interview*. Cape Town.
- Petersen, A. (2020a, August 3). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Petersen, A. (2020b, August 15). Personal communication. *Zoom Interview*. Cape Town.
- Weeder, M. (2020a, August 10). Survey response. *Survey Conducted by L. Alexander*. Cape Town.
- Weeder, M. (2020b, August 15). Personal communication. *Zoom Interview*. Cape Town.